

# Recruitment, Training and Employee Productivity in Nigerian Customs Service

**IDRIS SULE DAN<sup>1</sup>**  
**NWAODIKE CHIBUZOR AYODELE<sup>2</sup>**  
**ONI MICHAEL ABIODUN<sup>3</sup>**

**AFFILIATION:**

Department of Political Science  
and Public Administration,  
Babcock University

**CORRESPONDENCE:**

nwaodikec@babcock.edu.ng

**CITATION:**

Dan, I. S., Ayodele, N. C., &  
Abiodun, O. M., (2020).  
Recruitment, Training and  
Employee Productivity in Nigerian  
Customs Service. *Jurnal Studi  
Pemerintahan*. 11(2). 202-228

**ARTICLE HISTORY:**

Received:

March 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2020

Accepted:

April 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2020

**ABSTRACT:**

The productivity of the Nigeria Customs Service (NCS) has ripple effect on all the sectors of the Nigeria economy and this is because the Customs is considered a policy instrument for enforcing trade policies and enhancing growth of domestic economy through boarder protection. However, the performance of the NCS has experienced a decline in unit of transactions recorded from 2015-2019 and had frustrated the ease of business transactions in Nigeria. These challenges has been attributed to the recruitment procedure, training and development. Hence, this study examined the recruitment, training and employee productivity in the Nigeria customs service. A mixed research design was adopted with a population of 7,347 officers and men of the NCS. A sample size of 383 was computed through Krejcie and Morgan sample-size determination formula. The study adopted the stratified random sampling to select the officers and men of the NCS in Abuja and Lagos command units from three management cadres. Questionnaire and interview guide were the instrument of data collection. Response rate of 87.7% was achieved, and data were analyzed and presented through descriptive and inferential statistics. Findings revealed that recruitment and selection had significant effect on employee productivity ( $R^2 = 0.054$ ;  $\beta = 0.189$ ;  $t = 4.385$   $p < 0.05$ ); training and Development had significant effect on employee productivity ( $R^2 = 0.100$ ;  $0.269$ ;  $t = 6.086$ ;  $p < 0.05$ ) in the Nigeria Customs Service. This study concluded that human resources management practices had weak effect on employee productivity in the NCS. The study recommended that the leadership of the NCS to adopt strategic human resource management practices; one that identify required human resource need through ethical process and identify area of need of the human resource and tailor training programmes in the direction to help redirect the energy of it personnel to deliver superior-world class public service.

Keywords: Nigerian Customs Service, Recruitment, Training and Development, Employee, Productivity

**ABSTRAK:**

Produktivitas Nigeria Customs Service (NCS) memiliki dampak riak pada semua sektor ekonomi Nigeria, karena Bea Cukai dianggap sebagai instrumen kebijakan untuk menerapkan kebijakan perdagangan dan meningkatkan pertumbuhan ekonomi domestik melalui perlindungan. Namun, kinerja NCS telah mengalami penurunan dalam catatan dari 2015-2019 dan telah menggagalkan kemudahan

transaksi bisnis di Nigeria. Tantangan-tantangan ini telah dikaitkan dengan prosedur perekrutan, pelatihan dan pengembangan. Oleh karena itu, penelitian ini meneliti rekrutmen, pelatihan dan produktivitas karyawan di layanan Bea Cukai Nigeria. Desain mix method digunakan pada populasi 7.347 petugas dan pria dari NCS. Ukuran sampel 383 dihitung melalui Krejcie dan formula penentuan ukuran sampel Morgan. Studi ini mengadopsi stratified random sampling untuk memilih petugas dan orang-orang NCS di unit komando Abuja dan Lagos dari tiga unit manajemen. Kuesioner dan panduan wawancara merupakan instrumen pengumpulan data. Tingkat respons 87,7% tercapai, dan data dianalisis dan disajikan melalui statistik deskriptif dan inferensial. Temuan mengungkapkan bahwa rekrutmen dan seleksi berpengaruh signifikan terhadap produktivitas karyawan ( $R^2 = 0,054$ ;  $\hat{\alpha} = 0,189$ ;  $t = 4,385$   $p < 0,05$ ); pelatihan dan Pengembangan berpengaruh signifikan terhadap produktivitas karyawan ( $R^2 = 0,100$ ;  $\hat{\alpha} = 0,269$ ;  $t = 6,086$ ;  $p < 0,05$ ) di Layanan Bea Cukai Nigeria. Studi ini menyimpulkan bahwa praktik manajemen sumber daya manusia memiliki pengaruh yang lemah terhadap produktivitas karyawan di NCS. Studi ini merekomendasikan agar pimpinan NCS mengadopsi praktik strategis manajemen sumber daya manusia; yang mengidentifikasi kebutuhan sumber daya manusia yang diperlukan secara etis dan identifikasi kebutuhan sumber daya manusia dan program pelatihan yang sesuai dengan tujuan untuk membantu mengarahkan kemampuan personelya untuk memberikan layanan publik kelas dunia yang unggul.

## INTRODUCTION

Organization that seek to compete in a dynamic global environment and consistently achieve desired goals should possess competent human resource that will consistently deliver; this is because the human resource is considered a strategic component for enhancing organizational growth and sustainability. Again, the organization's capability to achieve competitive advantage can partly be attributable to the competences of its human resources. Hence, providing a conducive environment for the human resources, that will enable them to thrive, becomes vital to the going-concern of the organization. Adenuga, Fadoju, and Akhuetie (2017) suggested that every organization is established to attain specific goals in mind and the accomplishment of those goals lies in the hands of its workforce. Furthermore, scholars emphasized that the human resource employed by an organization constitutes the nucleus within which other organization's activity revolves. Thus allowing the entire organization to work smoothly to perform at an optimal level (Alinno & Igwe, 2017).

While the performance of public service in developed countries, seems appreciating, public service performance in Nigeria, especially in the Nigeria Customs Service, is worrisome. Ac-

## 204

According to report, out of a total of 160 countries, Nigeria was ranked 110th, and adjudged to perform poorly in efficiency and other indices of operational standards. Again, on trade logistics along six generic dimensions which are customs efficiency and border management clearance; quality of trade and transport-related infrastructure; Ease of arranging competitively priced international shipments; competence and quality of logistics services; ability to track and trace consignments; and the frequency with which shipments reach consignees within the scheduled time. Nigeria ranked 147th in terms of customs efficiency; 112th in logistics; 110th in international shipment; 78th in logistics infrastructure; 112th in logistics competence; 92nd in tracking and tracing; and 92nd in timeliness. Nigeria has a level of logistics constraints typical of low and middle-income countries. Other African countries that ranked higher than Nigeria in the report include Cote D'Ivoire (50), Benin Republic (76), and Ghana (106) (World Bank, 2018).

In addition, there are concerns with the issue of effective border protection. Despite the border closure in 2019, items such as rice and frozen foods considered as contra ban still find there ways into the Nigerian market. One would expect those contra ban items should not be seen. This show gross inefficiency on the part of the Officer and Men of the NCS and it frustrate the federal government of Nigeria's policy of boosting economic growth from within. Although, this is not say that the NCS is not doing anything tangible, however, the land border closure should not be selective; while some borders are properly managed, others create safe haven for contra ban items. Hence, this inconsistencies create challenges for the federal government about the sincerity of its policy and in the achievement of the policy objectives.

In view of this poor performances, the World Bank (2018) suggested five factors that can improve the performance of the public sector. Two of the five critical factors for improving public sector performance are institutional capacity building, and

incentives have to do with the core responsibility of the human resource manager. Other factors include political leadership, technology, and transparency. The human resource management perspective believes that to achieve organizational performance, the management of organizations must ensure that its employees are well-taking care of (Sinha & Thaly, 2013). In other words, human resource management practices become significant in enhancing the capacity of the organization to achieve a result through a transparent human resource environment and effective recruitment and selection of personnel, training and development, performance appraisal, and compensation activities (Selase, 2018).

Consequent to these developments, the objectives of the paper are: ascertain the process of recruitment and selection on employee productivity in the Nigeria Customs Service; determine the functional relationship between training and development on employee productivity of employees in Nigeria Customs Service.

## **LITERATURE REVIEW & HYPOTHESIS FORMULATION**

### **RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION PROCESS**

The employment into the private or public sector driven organization often begins with recruitment and selection of competent human resource who have the responsibility of working with other factors of production to create value and accomplish organizational objectives. The two primary activities at this stage of the employment process are recruitment and selection. Although they both defined how a prospect becomes an employee, yet the two concepts are unique, with a specific goal in the employment process. Bearing in mind this narrative, Selase (2018), viewed recruitment as an exercise which organizations uses to pull in work competitors who have the required capacities and mentalities. Recruitment is the way toward producing a pool of qualified candidates for employment opportunities. Similarly, Anand et al. (2018) posit that the process of discovery and hir-

ing the most-suitable-candidate (either within or outside of the organization) for a new or existing job is considered a recruitment process. In the same vein, Adu-Darko (2014) suggested that recruitment involves a painstaking management effort to identify candidates with the requisite experience, knowledge, skills, qualifications, and attitude for a job opening. One issues which is consistently missing in these definitions is that scholars failed to accentuate the relevance of a recruitment exercise to the overall organization objective.

To address this inadequacy, Yaseen (2015) asserted that recruitment is essentially about inviting and discovering a capable pool of applicants based on the job description and other contingent criteria needed to perform the job task to achieve organizational goals. This definition, imply that the recruitment process is sacrosanct to the fielding of competent personnel into the organization and in the achievement of organizational goals (Muscalu, 2015).

Onwe, Abah, Nwokwu, (2015) observed that recruitment is a fundamental personnel function that involves analysis of job openings, the discovery of pools of suitable prospective candidates, encouraging as well as attracting them to apply to the organization. When do correctly, this process provides an organization with as many qualified job applicants as possible from where the organization can selects those that meet the job requirements of available positions. It is enlightening to note that unless recruitment is carefully carried out, there can be little hope for securing and building a formidable first-rate workforce. In addition, Nabil et al. (2017) pointed out that the process through which firms identify and charm suitable candidates in required quantum and encouraging them to apply for a job position within the organization is considered recruitment process and very germane to securing competent workforce.

As revealed by Yaro (2014), the process of conducting recruitment and selection into public service in Nigeria to a large extent ignore meritocracy. This is manifested by the consistent

interference of political office holders in the issue of recruitment. Whenever recruitment commences, politicians do interfere and make sure that their candidates scaled through irrespective of whether they are qualified or not. This eventually leads to recruiting staff that is, in most cases, incompetent. It is factual to suggest that for any organization to achieve its objectives, it must have people with proven competence. It was on the realization of the need for competence in organizations that made Max Weber the greatest exponent of bureaucracy state that candidates for positions in organizations must be selected based on technical qualifications. However, in the case of Nigeria, recruitment and selection into public service are based purely on sentimental reasons. The principle of federal character has also compounded the problem since it has legalized nepotism and segregation in employment in the form of ethnic balancing.

The principle of federal character is a principle saddled with the responsibility of given equal opportunity to all the six geopolitical zones in terms of employment into the federal civil service. However, the problem is that some of the zones are backward in terms of paper qualification, and as such, their vacancies cannot be adequately filled fully with competent candidates. Again, regarding this issue, since all the geopolitical zones have representation in the commission, in most cases those representatives intrude candidates from their respective zones irrespective of their competences or lack of it, this is where the issue of ethnicity and favouritism comes in and this has a severe drawback as the outcome of those employed through this means will not yield any fruitful result. Incompetency of staff in Nigeria public service has resulted in gross inefficiency. It is therefore not surprising that officer and men of the Nigerian customs service have not been able to deliver over these years.

## TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT

Another human resource management practice considered

critical to influence employee performance is training and development. Although the two concepts can be differentiated, however, within the context of HRMP they both explain the short-term and future responsibility of the HR manager designed to enhance the capacity of its employees to deliver higher value to facilitate the accomplishment of organizational goals. According to Appiah (2010), training is a learning experience, which seeks a relatively permanent change. This definition is limiting as it did not position the relevance of training to the organization objective and the use of 'permanent change' is vague. Researchers suggest that training is given by the organization for the current or new employees to improve their knowledge and skills. Corroborating the line of thought, scholars assert that training is design to improve the skills of employee as such designing a training program can be considered as one of the essential tasks in the whole of the training and development scenario. (Asfaw, Argaw & Bayissa, 2015).

Nda and Fard (2013) aver that development is organizational-level activities which lead to efficiency of an employee given that the employee has been exposed to better ways of getting things done and with little effort and resources. Although development is not as specific as training; it is more general in application. As stated by Adamu (1991), development activities are used to help the managerial employee who performs non-routine jobs to improve their managerial, administrative, and decision-making abilities and competence. Development is primarily divided into three main dimensions, such as development opportunities, Perception of the organization long term, and Continuous commitment to investment in employee development. Development opportunities for employees at organizations are in direct relation with training. When considering employee development programs, many factors must be considered. Certain pieces of training may be a company focused, but when looking from an employee's point of view, the learning experience might not be of a great benefit to the employee. (Jacobs and Washington 2003).

Perception of the organization long term is the commitment to the organization is best defined by an employee's focus on their work along with a long term view of their career at the organization. To achieve this, an employee has to maintain a consistent level of job performance, from the organization's side, it has to provide constant training along with other benefits to the employees to ensure long-term commitment. With regards to the dimensions of training and development that an organization can adopt, scholars have emphasized that the type of training and development is dependent on the objectives an organization intends to achieve (Obi-Anike and Ekwe, 2014). According to scholars, training and development can be attained through the following means: Initially, induction training is given to new employees to familiarise the organization's goals, structure, culture, work standard, and other conditions of employment. Thereafter, foundation training is given to the new employee to meet specific professional knowledge about various rules and regulations of the government, financial transaction, administrative capability, communication skills, report writing, leadership ability, amongst others.

Also, it involves career development training, which is an ongoing acquisition or refinement of skills and knowledge, including job mastery and professional development, coupled with career planning activities. Lastly, is the refresher training, which involves enabling specialists, administrators, accountants, supervisors, and frontline workers update and enables them to add to the knowledge and skills they already have over time. The purpose of training and development programs overall is to improve employee capabilities, which has a positive ripple effect on the organizational potentials to achieve higher overall performance.

## EMPLOYEE PRODUCTIVITY

Employee productivity refers to the accomplishment of workers or mere working effectiveness. Several organizations use em-



ployee productivity as a measure of organizational performance. One activity that can contribute to these measure of organization performance is training and development (Fejoh & Faniran, 2016). In the organizational context, employee productivity is the extent to which an organizational member contributes to achieving the goals of the organization (Mwichigi & Waiganjo, 2014). Therefore, a measure of the quantity and quality of work done effectively and efficiently in a minimal cost of resources.

McNamara (2003) further states that results are usually the final and specific outputs desired from the employee. Results are often expressed as products or services for an internal or external customer. They may be in terms of financial accomplishments, impact on a community; and like wisely are expressed in terms of cost, quality, quantity, or time. Employee productivity could include the quantity of output, quality of output, timeliness of output, presence at work, and cooperativeness. This is the utilization of skills and high level of competence to execute organizational programmes as expected by management.

## **THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK**

### **RESOURCE-BASED VIEW (RBV)**

RBV explain how organization can achieve and sustain a competitive advantage. Its emergence to limelight came after scholars such as Barney, Wernerfelt, Prahalad, and Hamel. They published there works on factors that drive competitive advantage between the 1980s and 1990s. Barney (2001) regarded human resource as an essential factor for an organization to gain competitive advantages and realize organizational goals or targets as advanced by the RBV. This theory holds the view that the strategic proficiency of a company can be attributed to the human resources it possesses (Armstrong, 2009); hence, the RBV presents the justification for human capital resourcing.

RBV holds that for organizations to achieve its short and long-term competitiveness, it is expected that such an establishment must not depend upon the resources that only differenti-

ate it from its competitors, rather it should possess resources that are unique, difficult to copy and complex to find substitutes. Hence, RBV promotes the narrative that an organization can achieve superior performance by merely recruiting, development, and retaining competent human resources. RBV implies that organizations should continuously appraise the strength and appropriateness of its human resources to ensure person-task fit and in the event of a shortfall, they should employ individuals that can suit the desire of the organization (Barney, 2001). The relevance of the theory in this paper is that the quality of personnel recruited and subjected to training and development to acquire skills, knowledge and ideas to implement programmes and attain organizational objectives or goals makes the difference. These empowers the organization to achieve a competitive edge over competing firms and as such considered valuable tools or resources.

However, RBV was criticized for its lack of flexibility and relate in a competitive advantage, especially in a more dynamic or weak environment. It is also not enough to have human resources, but ability to have basic knowledge or attributes that keep the organization at a competitive advantage makes the difference.

## RESEARCH HYPOTHESES

The following hypotheses were tested in this study.

- H<sub>1</sub>: Recruitment and selection process has no significant influence on employee productivity in the NCS.
- H<sub>2</sub>: Training and development has no significant effect on employee productivity in the NCS

## RESEARCH METHOD

The paper adopted cross-sectional survey design. The population of the study comprised officers and men of Nigerian Customs Service, specifically, Abuja Command Unit and Federal Operating Unit, Lagos State, Nigeria, with a numerical popula-

tion of 7,347. The justification for these two units was on the premise that Abuja Command Unit is responsible for human resource management of the NCS, while Lagos Command Unit is in charge of NCS operations. Specifically, Abuja Command Unit has a population of 3,389 and Lagos Command Unit has 3,958 respectively. Sample size was computed using Krejcie and Morgan (1970) formula for determining sample size of 383. The paper adopted stratified random sampling to access the Officers and Men of NCS. Structured questionnaire was self-developed and validated. Structured interview was used to complement the survey method. Cronbach's Alpha reliability coefficient range from 0.645 to 0.942. The response rate of 87.7% was achieved. Data were analyzed through descriptive and inferential statistics.

## **RESULT AND DISCUSSION**

Objective One: ascertain the process of recruitment and employee on employee productivity in the Nigeria Customs Service.

The first objective of the study was to determine the effect of Recruitment and selection on employee productivity in the NCS. Table 1 established the extent to which respondents agreed or disagree with the statements regarding Recruitment and selection in relation to employee productivity. Accordingly, 52.7% of the respondents strongly agreed that NCS Advertise openings in public domain in line with international standard, 28.6% agreed, 14.9% partially agreed, 3.0% partially disagreed, and 0.9% disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that NCS Advertise openings in public domain in line with international standard is high with a mean of 5.29 and standard deviation of 0.890. Results also indicated that 39.3% of the respondents strongly agreed that NCS have the capacity to engage a transparent recruitment and screening process, 39.3% agreed, 15.8% partially agreed, 2.7% partially disagreed, and 3.0% indicated disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that NCS have

the capacity to engage a transparent recruitment and screening process is high with a mean of 5.06 and standard deviation of 1.065.

Also 22.9% of the respondents strongly agreed that the NCS Acquire right number of personnel based on quota system and operational need, 38.1% agreed, 22.6% partially agreed, 13.7% partially disagreed, 1.8% disagreed and 0.9% strongly disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that the company only

**TABLE 1: DESCRIPTIVE STATISTICS ON RESPONDENTS RESPONSES ON THE EFFECT OF RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION ON EMPLOYEE PRODUCTIVITY, 2015-2019**

Recruitment and Selection	Strongly Agree	Agree	Partially Agree	Partially Disagree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree	Mean	Standard Deviation
Advertise openings in public domain in line with international standard	52.7%	28.6%	14.9%	3.0%	0.9%	0.0%	5.29	0.890
Transparent recruitment and screening process	39.3%	39.3%	15.8%	2.7%	3.0%	0.0%	5.06	1.065
Acquire right number of personnel based on quota system and operational need	22.9%	38.1%	22.6%	13.7%	1.8%	.9%	4.64	1.086
Acquire right quality of personnel based on skill gap	19.0%	52.7%	14.3%	9.2%	4.8%	0.0%	4.72	1.028
Observe best practise in selection of application in line with public service rule	14.3%	50.6%	25.0%	6.3%	3.9%	0.0%	4.65	0.934
Average							4.87	1.000
<b>Productivity</b>								
Timely delivery of work done	36.9%	51.2%	8.9%	7.1%	3.0%	0.0%	5.22	0.728
Quality of service rendered	31.8%	48.5%	17.3%	2.4%	0.0%	0.0%	5.10	0.761
Ability to work with less supervision	19.6%	46.1%	26.8%	5.1%	2.4%	0.0%	4.76	0.908
Able to perform increasing number of task	20.8%	41.7%	27.1%	10.4%	0.0%	0.0%	4.73	0.908
Low personnel absenteeism	11.6%	48.2%	15.8%	8.3%	14.6%	1.5%	4.22	1.290
Average							4.80	0.919

## 214

gives people the maximum amount of training is high with a mean of 4.64 and standard deviation of 1.086. Last on the table shows 14.3% of the respondents that strongly agreed that NCS Observes best practise in selection of application in line with public service rule, 50.6% agreed, 25.0% partially agreed, and 6.3% partially disagreed, 3.9% disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that people are strongly encouraged to develop their skills is high with a mean of 4.65 and standard deviation of 0.934. The grand mean for training is 4.872 with standard deviation of 1.000, indicating that recruitment and development is high. The value of standard deviation implies that the response were moderately dispersed from the mean.

In addition, Table 1 showed the descriptive statistics of employee productivity. According to results in Table 4.6, 36.9% of the respondents strongly agreed that they timely deliver work done, 51.2% agreed, 8.9% partially agreed, and 7.1% partially disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that they timely deliver work done with a mean of 5.22 and standard deviation of 0.728. Results also indicated that 31.8% of the respondents strongly agreed to the Quality of service rendered, 48.5% agreed, 17.3% partially agreed, and 2.4% partially disagreed. On average, the Quality of service rendered is high with a mean of 5.10 and standard deviation of 0.761.

Also 19.6% of the respondents strongly agreed that they have the ability to work with less supervision, 46.1% agreed, 26.8% partially agreed, 5.1% partially disagreed, and 2.4% disagreed. On average, the respondents agree they have the ability to work with less supervision with a mean of 4.76 and standard deviation of 0.908. Furthermore, 20.8% of the respondents strongly agreed that they are able to perform increasing number of task, 41.7% agreed, 27.1% partially agreed, and 10.4% partially disagreed. On average, the respondents agree that are able to perform increasing number of task with a mean of 4.73 and standard deviation of 0.908. Lastly, 11.6% of the respondents strongly agreed to Low personnel absenteeism, 48.2% agreed, 15.8%

partially agreed, 8.3% partially disagreed, 14.6% disagreed, and 1.5% strongly disagreed. On average, the respondents agree that are able to perform increasing number of task with a mean of 4.22 and standard deviation of 1.290. The grand mean for employee productivity 4.80 which indicates that on average, respondents partially agreed with most of the statements as it relates to employee intention to leave with the overall standard deviation of 0.919 implies that the response were clustered around the mean.

Relating results in tables 1 together, recruitment and selection process has similar patterns of increase with employee productivity in the NCS. The findings suggest that recruitment and selection process may likely influence employee productivity in the NCS. This provided answer to research question one and enabled the researcher to achieve the objective of this study. To substantiate the effect recruitment and selection process have on employee productivity, a hypothesis if formulated and analyzed using simple linear regression analysis as an example of inferential statistics.

**TABLE 1.1: REGRESSION RESULT OF EFFECT OF RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION PROCESS ON EMPLOYEE PRODUCTIVITY IN THE NCS, 2015-2019**

<b>Model Summary</b>						
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate		
1	.233 <sup>a</sup>	.054	.052	.59874		
a. Predictors: (Constant), Recruitment and selection process						
b. Dependent Variable: Employee Productivity						
<b>Coefficients<sup>a</sup></b>						
Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	3.900	.212		18.367	.000
	NEWRS	.189	.043	.233	4.385	.000
a. Dependent Variable: Employee Productivity						

RESTATEMENT OF HYPOTHESIS ONE

H<sub>01</sub>: Recruitment and selection process has no significant influence on employee productivity in the Nigeria Customs Service?

To test the objective one, linear regression analysis was used. Using SPSS version 24 package, the resulting regression coefficients have been used to interpret the direction and magnitude of the relationship. The  $\beta$  coefficients show the responsiveness of the dependent variable as a result of unit change in each of the independent variable (recruitment and selection). The error term  $\hat{\epsilon}$  captures the variations that cannot be explained by the model. The dependent variable was employee productivity. The Regression results are presented in Tables 1.1.

Table 1.1 provides details of results of linear regression on the effect of Recruitment and selection on employee productivity of the Nigerian Customs Service. The results reveal that Recruitment and selection have positive and significant effect on employee productivity in the NCS ( $\hat{\beta} = 0.189, t = 4.385, p=0.000$ ). The estimated coefficient of correlation (R) was .233<sup>a</sup> indicating that there is a low positive relationship between recruitment & selection and employee productivity. The result also revealed that recruitment & selection only account for 5.4% of employee productivity while 94.6% of employee productivity is as a result of other factors apart from recruitment & selection ( $R^2 = 0.054$ ). The regression model was thus established as follows:

$$Y = 3.900 + .189x_1 + \hat{\epsilon}_i \dots\dots\dots \text{Eq. i}$$

Where: Y = employee productivity  
x<sub>1</sub> = Recruitment and selection

The regression equation showed that holding Recruitment and selection constant at zero, employee productivity is 3.900. The result shows that the coefficient of Recruitment and selection is 0.189 with probability value of 0.000 indicates that Recruitment and selection does contribute significantly to employee productivity in the NCS. The results reveal that a unit improvement in Recruitment and selection brings about 0.189 increase

in employee productivity in the NCS. In other word, an improvement in Recruitment and selection, results into a corresponding increase in employee productivity in the NCS. Based on these result the null hypothesis ( $H_{01}$ ) which states that Recruitment and selection has no significant effect on employee productivity in the NCS was rejected.

One common narrative that echoed through the responses of nearly 85% of the personnel interviewed, suggested that the recruitment and selection process into the Nigeria Custom Service is a case of 'Man no Man' and that merit as a criteria is jettisoned in most case. Government officials, politicians, and Political office holders usually hijack the process to put in their person. The ripple effect of this is largely personnel who do not have the competence to performance diligently to improve productivity. The interview conducted corroborate the quantitative result which reveals that recruitment and selection explained a meagre 5.4% variation in employment productivity.

Objective Two: determine the functional relationship between training and development and employee productivity of employees in Nigeria Customs Service.

According to results in Table 2, the value 51.8% of the respondents strongly agreed that NCS Engage in specific-needed training to enhancing Customs operations, 38.4% agreed, 8.9% partially agreed and 0.9% partially disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that NCS Engage in specific-needed training to enhancing Customs operations is high with a mean of 5.41 and standard deviation of 0.690. Results also indicated that 43.2% of the respondents strongly agreed that NCS Provide opportunity for career growth and succession, 28.3% agreed, 22.9% partially agreed, 4.8% partially disagreed, and 0.9% indicated disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that NCS Provide opportunity for career growth and succession, is high with a mean of 5.08 and standard deviation of 0.963 Also 13.4% of the respondents strongly agreed that the NCS Engage in transparent staff selection for development in strategic position,



**218**

46.1% agreed, 28.6% partially agreed, 8.3% partially disagreed, 2.7% disagreed and 0.9% strongly disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that the NCS Engage in transparent staff selection for development in strategic position is high with a mean of 4.57 and standard deviation of 0.975. Also 10.1% of the respondents strongly agreed that the NCS Conduct periodic training for personnel at Inspectorate and Assistant cadre, 49.1% agreed, 24.1% partially agreed, 15.8% partially disagreed, and 0.9% disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that the NCS Conduct periodic training for personnel at Inspectorate and Assistant cadre is high with a mean of 4.52 and standard deviation of 0.908.

**TABLE 2: DESCRIPTIVE STATISTICS ON RESPONDENTS RESPONSES ON THE FUNCTIONAL RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT AND EMPLOYEE PRODUCTIVITY, 2015-2019**

Training and Development	Strongly Agree	Agree	Partially Agree	Partially Disagree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree	Mean	Standard Deviation
Engage in specific-needed training to enhancing Customs operations	51.8%	38.4%	8.9%	0.9%	0.0%	0.0%	5.41	0.690
Provide opportunity for career growth and succession	43.2%	28.3%	22.9%	4.8%	0.9%	0.0%	5.08	0.963
Engage in transparent staff selection for development in strategic position	13.4%	46.1%	28.6%	8.3%	2.7%	0.9%	4.57	0.975
Conduct periodic training for personnel at Inspectorate and Assistant cadre	10.1%	49.1%	24.1%	15.8%	0.9%	0.0%	4.52	0.908
Provide opportunity for organizational development	9.8%	52.4%	26.8%	11.0%	0.0%	0.0%	4.61	0.810
Average							4.83	0.809
<b>Employee productivity</b>								
Timely delivery of work done	36.9%	51.2%	8.9%	7.1%	3.0%	0.0%	5.22	0.728
Quality of service rendered	31.8%	48.5%	17.3%	2.4%	0.0%	0.0%	5.10	0.761
Ability to work with less supervision	19.6%	46.1%	26.8%	5.1%	2.4%	0.0%	4.76	0.908
Able to perform increasing number of task	20.8%	41.7%	27.1%	10.4%	0.0%	0.0%	4.73	0.908
Low personnel absenteeism	11.6%	48.2%	15.8%	8.3%	14.6%	1.5%	4.22	1.290
Average								

Source: Field Survey Results (2020)

Last on the table shows 9.8% of the respondents that strongly agreed that NCS Provide opportunity for organizational development, 52.4% agreed, 26.8% partially agreed, and 11.0% partially disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that NCS Provide opportunity for organizational development is high with a mean of 4.61 and standard deviation of 0.810. The grand mean for training is 4.83 with standard deviation of 0.809, indicating that Training and Development is high. The value of standard deviation implies that the response were clustered around the mean.

In addition, Table 2 presented the descriptive statistics on employee Productivity. According to results in Table 4.9, 36.9% of the respondents strongly agreed that they timely deliver work done, 51.2% agreed, 8.9% partially agreed, and 7.1% partially disagreed. On average, the respondents indicated that they timely deliver work done with a mean of 5.22 and standard deviation of 0.728. Results also indicated that 31.8% of the respondents strongly agreed to the Quality of service rendered, 48.5% agreed, 17.3% partially agreed, and 2.4% partially disagreed. On average, the Quality of service rendered is high with a mean of 5.10 and standard deviation of 0.761. Also 19.6% of the respondents strongly agreed that they have the ability to work with less supervision, 46.1% agreed, 26.8% partially agreed, 5.1% partially disagreed, and 2.4% disagreed. On average, the respondents agree they have the ability to work with less supervision with a mean of 4.76 and standard deviation of 0.908. Furthermore, 20.8% of the respondents strongly agreed that they are able to perform increasing number of task, 41.7% agreed, 27.1% partially agreed, and 10.4% partially disagreed. On average, the respondents agree that are able to perform increasing number of task with a mean of 4.73 and standard deviation of 0.908.

Lastly, 11.6% of the respondents strongly agreed to Low personnel absenteeism, 48.2% agreed, 15.8% partially agreed, 8.3% partially disagreed, 14.6% disagreed, and 1.5% strongly disagreed. On average, the respondents agree that are able to perform

**220**

increasing number of task with a mean of 4.22 and standard deviation of 1.290. The grand mean for employee productivity 4.80 which indicates that on average, respondents partially agreed with most of the statements as it relates to employee intention to leave with the overall standard deviation of 0.919 implies that the response were clustered around the mean.

Relating results in tables 2 together, training and development has similar patterns of increase with employee productivity in the NCS. The findings suggest that training and development may likely influence employee productivity in the NCS. This provided answer to research question one and enabled the researcher to achieve the objective of this study. To substantiate the effect training and development have on employee productivity, a hypothesis if formulated and analyzed using simple linear regression analysis as an example of inferential statistics.

**RESTATEMENT OF HYPOTHESIS TWO**

**TABLE 2.1: REGRESSION RESULT OF EFFECT OF TRAINING & DEVELOPMENT ON PRODUCTIVITY IN THE NCS**

Model Summary						
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate		
1	.316 <sup>a</sup>	.100	.097	.58419		
a. Predictors: (Constant), Training & Development						
b. Dependent Variable: Productivity						
Coefficients <sup>a</sup>						
Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		B	Std. Error			
1	(Constant)	3.516	.217		16.240	.000
	NEWTRD	0.269	.044	.316	6.086	.000
a. Dependent Variable: Productivity						

Source: Field Survey Results (2020)

To test the objective two, linear regression analysis was used. Using SPSS version 24 package, the resulting regression coefficients have been used to interpret the direction and magnitude

of the relationship. The  $\beta$  coefficients show the responsiveness of the dependent variable as a result of unit change in each of the independent variable (Training & Development). The error term  $\hat{\epsilon}$  captures the variations that cannot be explained by the model. The dependent variable was employee productivity. The Regression results are presented in Tables 2.1.

Table 2.1 provides details of results of linear regression on the effect of Training & Development on employee productivity of the Nigerian Customs Service. The results reveal that Training & Development has positive and significant effect on employee productivity in the NCS ( $\hat{\beta} = 0.269$ ,  $t = 6.086$ ,  $p=0.000$ ). The estimated coefficient of correlation (R) was .316<sup>a</sup> indicating that there is a relationship between Training & Development and employee productivity. The result also revealed that Training & Development only account for 10% of employee productivity while 90% of employee productivity is as a result of other factors apart from recruitment & selection ( $R^2 = 0.100$ ). The regression model was thus established as follows:

$$Y = 3.516 + 0.269x_2 + \hat{\epsilon}_1 \dots\dots\dots \text{Eq. i}$$

Where: Y = employee productivity  
 $x_1$  = Training & Development

The regression equation showed that holding Training & Development constant at zero, employee productivity is 3.516. The result shows that the coefficient of Training & Development is 0.269 with probability value of 0.000 indicates that Training & Development has positive and significant contribution to employee productivity in the NCS. The results reveal that a unit improvement in Training & Development brings about 0.269 increase in employee productivity in the NCS. In other word, an improvement in Training & Development, results into a corresponding increase in employee productivity in the NCS. Based on these result, the null hypothesis ( $H_{02}$ ) which states that Training & Development has no significant effect on employee productivity in the NCS was rejected.

All the personnel interviewed affirm that training and development is critical for achieving significant productivity for organisations. However, majority of the personnel suggested that *Oga boys* (public servants that are loyal to the top management or have political god father) get the privilege to go on training and development exercises hence suggesting that the training and development process is not transparent. Also, they stressed that the training for lower cadre is insufficient to enable the personnel to achieve significant improvement in productivity and that not many personnel can effectively operate a computer system that can aid productivity. The ripple effect of ill-trained personnel suggest that their capacity to be productive is restricted. The interview conducted corroborate the quantitative result which reveals that training recruitment and selection explained only 10% variation in employment productivity.

## **DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS**

### **RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION ON EMPLOYEE PRODUCTIVITY**

The first objective investigated the effect of recruitment and selection on employee productivity in the NCS. The finding of the linear regression revealed that Recruitment and selection has significant effect on employee productivity in the NCS. The findings of this study, supported in several empirical studies. For example, Ekwoaba *et al.* (2015) revealed that recruitment and selection have a significant effect on employee productivity and that the more transparent the recruitment and selection process, the better the organization's performance. In another related study that corroborate the findings of the study, but focused on the Nigerian banking industry, was Mustapha *et al.* (2013). According to the scholars, there is a significant functional-relationship between recruitment and selection based on merit and organizational performance; that effective recruitment and selection is a key to organizational commitment; that well-planned recruitment and selection contribute to organizational

productivity. Similarly, Sabiu et al. (2016) suggested that recruitment and selection and training and development were found to be significantly related and have a positive influence on employee productivity.

On the contrary, the submission of some scholars did not uphold the findings of this study. For example in a related study focused on the public sector, Yaro (2014) findings did not support the submission of this present study. He revealed that sentiment and other primordial issues like ethnicity, nepotism, and favouritism are given more consideration in terms of employment than merit. Consequently, this adversely led to labour turnover, low productivity and increased costs of governance. In a similar findings, Omisore and Ohofu (2013) reveal that merit is often jettisoned on the altar of ethnicity and religion in recruitment into the public service in Nigeria. Since the public service is directly controlled and regulated by the government, the Nigerian Federal Character Principle was primarily obeyed.

### **TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT AND EMPLOYEE PRODUCTIVITY**

The second objective examined the effect of training and development on employee productivity in the NCS. The finding of the linear regression revealed that training and development has significant effect on employee productivity in the NCS. In support of the finding of this study, Obi-Anike and Ekwe (2014) suggested that there is a positive relationship between training/development and organizational productivity. Gambo (2015) results equally support the finding of this study. The scholar revealed that training and development programs improve employees' skills and performance at the workplace, enhance their technical knowhow/wherewithal to withstand the challenges of contemporary times, thus, a useful tool for sustaining and enhancing workers' efficiency is through well planned and implemented training and development programs. Also, Daniel (2018) corroborate this findings of this study in

revealing that employee skill, knowledge, and ability gained during training has a significant effect organisational productivity.

Furthermore, Fejoh and Faniran (2016) explored how training and development cumulate to influence employee performance and optimal productivity in public sector in Nigeria. The result of the first analysis revealed that workers' training does not significantly affect performance. The result was a result of lack of proper in-service training program and infrequency of training programs in schools. It also disagreed with the conclusion of Ezeani and Oladele (2013), who claimed that development had a significant relationship with employee performance. The results further showed that in-service training and development had an insignificant combined effect on workers' productivity.

TABLE 3:SUMMARY OF THE HYPOTHESES TESTING

S/N	Hypothesis	Results	Remarks
1	H <sub>01</sub> : Recruitment and selection process have no significant influence on employee productivity in the Nigeria Customs Service	(R <sup>2</sup> = 0.054, $\beta$ = 0.189, $t$ = 4.385, $p$ =0.000).	Reject H <sub>01</sub>
2	H <sub>02</sub> : Training and Development have no significant influence on employee productivity in the Nigeria Customs Service	(R <sup>2</sup> = 0.100, $\beta$ = 0.269, $t$ = 6.086, $p$ =0.000).	Reject H <sub>02</sub>

In Table 3, the study established that recruitment and selection, training and development have positive and significant effect on employee productivity in the NCS.

### CONCLUSION

The study examined the effect of human resources management practices on employee performance of the NCS with emphasis on the command units responsible for HR administration (Abuja) and operational command unit (Lagos) of the NCS. It precisely assessed the effect of recruitment & selection on employee productivity. Also, it analyzed the effect of training and development on employee productivity. In addition, it evalu-

ated the effect of motivation on operational efficiency. Further analysis was done to ascertain the effect of work environment on employee commitment. Lastly, the study examined the influence of performance appraisal on employee satisfaction of the Officers and Men of the NCS.

Over all, this study found that recruitment and selection process have positive and significant influence on employee productivity in the Nigeria Customs Service ( $R^2 = 0.054$ ,  $\hat{a} = 0.189$ ,  $t = 4.385$ ,  $p=0.000$ ). One common narrative that echoed through the responses of nearly 85% of the personnel interviewed, suggested that the recruitment and selection process into the Nigeria Custom Service is a case of 'Man no Man' and that merit as a criteria is jettisoned in most case. Government officials, politicians, and political office holders usually hijack the process to put in their person. The ripple effect of this is largely personnel who do not have the competence to performance diligently to improve productivity. The interview conducted corroborate the quantitative result which reveals that recruitment and selection explained a meagre 5.4% variation in employment productivity.

Also, training and development have positive significant influence on employee productivity in the Nigeria Customs Service ( $R^2 = 0.100$ ,  $\hat{a} = 0.269$ ,  $t = 6.086$ ,  $p=0.000$ ). All the personnel interviewed affirm that training and development is critical for achieving significant productivity for organizations. However, majority of the personnel suggested that *Oga boys* get the privilege to go on training and development exercises hence suggesting that the training and development process is not transparent. Also, they stressed that the training for lower cadre is insufficient to enable the personnel to achieve significant improvement in productivity and that not many personnel can effectively operate a computer system that can aid productivity. The ripple effect of ill-trained personnel suggested that their capacity to be productive is restricted. The interview conducted corroborate the quantitative result which reveals that training re-



recruitment and selection explained only 10% variation in employment productivity.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

Based on the findings of this study, the following recommendations are made;

1. The study established that recruitment and selection process have weak, positive and significant influence on employee productivity in the Nigeria Customs Service. Hence, as part of the reform agenda it is imperative for the NCS to adopt strategic recruitment and selection process; one that identify required human resource and imbibe ethical process. This would improve the productivity of the service and by extension improves the institutional contribution to federal government of Nigeria.
2. The study established that the Training and Development programmes initiated for the Inspectorates and Assistant cadre have positive and significant influence on employee productivity however the significant effect is weak and this question appropriateness of the training and development exercises in the Nigeria Customs Service. The Office of the human resource manager for the NCS should identify area of need that would benefit the HR and consequently enhance the productivity-capacity of training and development programmes.

### **REFERENCES**

- Adenuga, A. A., Fadoju, O., & Akhuetie, R. E. (2017). Non-meritocratic factors and the recruitment process in Oyo State civil service. *African Sociological Review*, 21(1), 113-133.
- Adamu, S. O. (1991). Productivity data and nation building. *Journal of Industrial Relations*, 5(6), 21-26.
- Adu-Darkoh, M. (2014). *Employee recruitment and selection practices in the construction industry in Ashanti Region*. Unpublished thesis submitted to the Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology for partial fulfilment for requirements for the award of a degree in Master of Business Administration (HRM) Option.
- Alinno, F. C., & Igwe, N. N. (2017). Proactive human resource management and the performance Of the privatized organizations: evidence from selected Nigerian organizations. *European Journal of Business and Social Sciences*, 6(1), 77 – 98.

- Anand, V. V., Shanthanlakshmi, M., Srinivasan, G. U., Arunkumar, V., Icewarya, G., Nandhu, S., & Kamatchi, S. M. (2018). A study on effectiveness of recruitment organizational Support in ITES. *International Journal of Pure and Applied Mathematics*, 119(7), 2755-2764.
- Appiah, B. (2012). The impact of training on employee performance: A case study of HFC bank (Ghana) limited.
- Armsrtong, M. (2012). *A hand book of human resources management practice 7th edition*, London: Mc Donald and Evans.
- Asfaw, A. M., Argaw, M. D., & Bayissa, L. (2015). The impact of training and development on employee performance and effectiveness: A case study of district five administration office, Bole Sub-City, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. *Journal of Human Resource and Sustainability Studies*, 3(9), 188-202.
- Barney, J. (2001). Firm resources and sustained competitive advantage. *Journal of Management*, 17(1), 99-120.
- Daniel, C. O. (2018). Effects of training on organizational performance. *Asian Journal of Business and Management*, 6(5), 58-67.
- Ekwoaba, J. O., Ikeje, U. U., & Ufoma, N. (2015). The impact of recruitment and selection criteria on organizational performance. *Global Journal of Human Resource Management*, 3(2), 22-33.
- Ezeani, N. E., & Oladele, R. (2013). Implications of training and development programmes on accountant's productivity in selected business organizations in Onitsha, Anambra State, Nigeria. *International Journal of Asian Social Science*, 3(1), 266-281.
- Fejoh, J., & Faniran, V. L. (2016). Impact of in-service training and staff development on workers' job performance and optimal productivity in public secondary schools in Osun State, Nigeria. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7(33), 183-189.
- Gambo, H. S. (2015). The impact of training and development on workers' productivity. *Review of Public Administration and Management*, 3(1), 1-4.
- Jacobs, R. L., & Washington, C. (2003). Employee development and organizational performance: A review of literature and directions for future research. *Human Resource Development International*, 6(5), 343-354.
- Obi-Anike, H. O., & Ekwe, M. C. (2014). Impact of training and development on organizational effectiveness: Evidence from selected public sector organizations in Nigeria. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 6(29), 66-75.
- Omisore, B. O., & Okofu, B. I. (2014). Staff recruitment and selection process in the Nigerian public service: What is to be done? *International Journal of Human Resource Studies*, 4(3), 280-293.
- Muscalu, E. (2015). Sources of human resources recruitment organization. *Management and Economics*, 3(79), 352-359.
- Mustapha, A. M., Ilesanmi, O. A., & Aremu, M. (2013). Impacts of well-planned recruitment and selection process on corporate performance in Nigerian banking industry. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 3(9), 20-32.
- Mwlichigi, S. N., & Waiganjo, E. W. (2014). Relationship between outsourcing and operational performance of Kenya's Energy Sector: A Case Study of Kenya Power. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 5(3), 497-513.
- Nabi1, N., Ahmed, A. A., & Rahman, S. (2017). The empirical study on human resource management practices with special reference to job satisfaction and employee turnover at Investment Corporation of Bangladesh. *Human Resource Management Research*, 7(1): 54-64.
- Nda, M. M., & Fard. R. Y. (2013). The impact of employee training and development on employee productivity. *Global Journal of Commerce and Management Perspective*, 2(6), 91-93.

- Onwe, S. O., Abah, E. O., & Nwokuwu, P. M. (2015). Politics of recruitment and selection in the Nigerian civil service- An Ebonyi State experience. *Public Policy and Administration Research*, 5(2), 92-99.
- Selase, A. E. (2018). The impact of recruitment and selection criteria on organizational performance. GN bank, Greater Accra region of Ghana as the mirror. *Journal of Public Administration and Governance*, 8(3), 283-295.
- Sinha, V., & Thaly, P. (2013). A review on changing trend of recruitment practice to enhance the quality of hiring in global organizations. *Management*, 18(2), 141-156.
- World Bank. (2018). Improving public sector performance: Through innovation and inter-agenc coordination. Retrieved form World Bank Website: <https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/governance/publication/global-report-on-public-sector-performance>
- World Bank. (2018). Connecting to compete on trade logistics in the global economy. Retrieved from World Banks Website: <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/29971>
- Yaro, I. (2014). Recruitment and selection in the Nigerian public service: Nature, challenges and way forward. *British Journal of Economics, Management & Trade*, 4(7), 1005-1017.
- Yaseen, A. (2015). Recruitment and selection process of higher education sector and its impact on organizational outcomes. *International Journal of Human Resource Studies*, 5(4), 79-9