

## **Author's response to reviews**

**Title:**Intraoperative use of enriched collagen and elastin matrices with freshly isolated adipose-derived stem/stromal cells: A potential clinical approach for soft tissue reconstruction

### **Authors:**

Ziyad Alharbi ([zalharbi@ukaachen.de](mailto:zalharbi@ukaachen.de))

Sultan Almakadi ([salmakadi@ukaachen.de](mailto:salmakadi@ukaachen.de))

Christian Opländer ([christian.oplander@med.uni-duesseldorf.de](mailto:christian.oplander@med.uni-duesseldorf.de))

Michael Vogt ([mvogt@ukaachen.de](mailto:mvogt@ukaachen.de))

Hans-Oliver Rennekampff ([hrennekampff@ukaachen.de](mailto:hrennekampff@ukaachen.de))

Norbert Pallua ([npallua@ukaachen.de](mailto:npallua@ukaachen.de))

**Version:**6**Date:**16 January 2014

**Author's response to reviews:** see over

UNIVERSITY HOSPITAL – RWTH AACHEN UNIVERISTY  
**DEPARTMENT OF PLASTIC AND HAND SURGERY – BURN UNIT**  
CHAIRMAN: N. PALLUA M.D., Ph.D., FEBOPRAS

Addressed to: the Editor of ***BMC surgery***

Dear Prof. Rowles,

Thank you very much for the extensive and excellent review of our manuscript entitled “Intraoperative use of enriched collagen and elastin matrices with freshly isolated adipose-derived stem/stromal cells: A potential clinical approach for soft tissue reconstruction.”

We are excited that the second reviewer found our current version suitable for publication. In addition, we have carefully considered and evaluated the concerns that were raised by the first reviewer. We made extensive modifications to the manuscript, including the addition of a detailed description of the statistical analysis and the use of an English language editing service.

In the following list, we respond to the reviewers’ comments in a point-by-point manner. Blue text indicates the comment from the first reviewer. The black text that follows indicates the reply from the authors.

Major Comments:

(1)

#### Statistical review

A complete statistical review of the whole analysis has been performed and approved by Prof. Hilgers and his team from the Institute of Medical Statistics at the Faculty of Medicine of the RWTH Aachen University. Therefore, authors acknowledged them in the acknowledgment section.

#### Statistical analysis: Did the authors use a one-sided or two sided ANOVA?

The F-test of an ANOVA, which assesses differences between groups, is always one-sided. Thus, we will clarify whether we used one- or two-way ANOVA for the statistical analysis. We used one-way ANOVA because the experiments had only one independent variable (i.e., the fluorescence signal), which changes in response to different conditions (i.e., incubation time). We used repeated measures ANOVA because the within-subjects design entails that the cells from each individual were used under different conditions (i.e., incubation times). This information was also added to the Statistical Analysis section of the Methods.

#### Have all three groups been tested against each other, or was the comparison a pair-wise approach as suggested in Figure 2. Please state the exact p-values.

To avoid suggesting a pair-wise approach in Figure 2, we added lines to indicate all comparisons. The exact p-values for all comparisons have been added to the Results section, as requested by the reviewer.

Can the authors please provide all exact values (median, min/max etc. either within Figure 2 or in the Results section), as this might be a valuable contribution for other groups considering similar experiments. Please refer to a statistician and/or use his statement when resubmitting.

We have added the requested information (i.e., values) to the manuscript in the Results section, as suggested by the reviewer.

Minor Comments:

(2) No brand names should be used in the manuscript, eg. Matriderm should be stated once, and then be referred to as eg. "collagen-elastin matrix" or "dermal matrix" to the authors' preference(s).

As advised by the reviewer, the term 'Matriderm' was used once in the Methods and was replaced by the term 'collagen and elastin matrices' throughout the rest of the manuscript.

(3) Please state the version number of the statistical software.

The version number of the statistical software is now included in the Statistical Analysis section of the Methods, as requested by the reviewer.

(4) Following the previous extensive revision of their manuscript, I recommend the authors to either refer to a native speaker or a linguistic service before considering resubmission.

As recommended by the reviewer, the entire manuscript, including the abstract, has been edited and formatted by an English editing service.

We would like to thank the reviewers for their comments. We attempted to implement all reviewer suggestions and answer all reviewer questions, and we hope that the current version meets the high standards for publication in BMC Surgery.

Yours,

**Ziyad Alharbi, M.D.**

Department of Plastic and Hand Surgery - Burns Unit,

University Hospital of the RWTH Aachen University,

Pauwelsstr 3052057 Aachen, Germany

Telephone Number: +49 241 80-0

Fax Number: +49 241 80-82634

E-mail address: [zalharbi@ukaaachen.de](mailto:zalharbi@ukaaachen.de)