

2658-2214

# *A History and Theory of Informed Consent*

RUTH R. FADEN

TOM L. BEAUCHAMP

*in collaboration with*

NANCY M. P. KING

*New York Oxford*  
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS  
1986

# Contents

## Part I. FOUNDATIONS

1. Foundations in Moral Theory 3
  - Principles, Rules, and Rights 4
    - The Concept of Morality* 4
    - Reasoning by Principles* 5
    - Rights as Correlative to Duties* 6
  - Three Principles 7
    - Respect for Autonomy* 7
    - Beneficence* 9
    - Justice* 14
  - Balancing Moral Principles and Rights 16
  - Conclusion 19
  - Notes 20
2. Foundations in Legal Theory 23
  - Moral Principles and Legal Rights 24
  - Common Law and the Legal Doctrine 25
    - Theory of Liability* 26
    - Disclosure Requirements* 30
    - Causation* 34
    - Exceptions* 35
  - Constitutional Law and the Right to Privacy 39
    - Informed Consent as a Privacy Claim* 40
    - The Prospective Character of Privacy Actions* 41
  - Conclusion 42
  - Notes 43

## Part II. A HISTORY OF INFORMED CONSENT

- X 3. Pronouncement and Practice in Clinical Medicine 53
  - Problems of Historical Interpretation 53

	<i>Interpreting the History of "Consent": Some Perils of the Project</i>	53
	<i>Two Competing Historical Interpretations</i>	56
X	<b>Codes and Treatises from Hippocrates to the AMA</b>	60
	<i>Ancient Medicine</i>	61
	<i>Medieval Medicine</i>	63
	<i>Enlightenment Medicine</i>	64
	<i>Modern British and American Medicine</i>	67
	<i>The Tradition of Medical Beneficence</i>	74
X	<b>American Medical Practices in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries</b>	76
	<i>Cases of Consent and Refusal</i>	77
	<i>Secrecy, Benevolent Lying, and the Politics of Protection</i>	84
X	<b>The Arrival of Informed Consent</b>	86
	<i>Becoming Informed About Informed Consent: 1957–1972</i>	88
	<i>The Development of a New Medical Ethics</i>	91
X	<b>Conclusion: Everything's Changed, and Nothing's Changed</b>	100
Y	<b>Notes</b>	101
<b>4.</b>	<b>Consent and the Courts: The Emergence of the Legal Doctrine</b>	114
	<i>Reading Law</i>	114
	<i>Consent Before the Twentieth Century</i>	116
	<i>Late Eighteenth-Century England: The Slater Case</i>	116
	<i>Battery and Malpractice in Nineteenth-Century American Cases</i>	117
	<b>The Early Twentieth-Century Cases: The Birth of Basic Consent</b>	119
	<i>Pre-Schloendorff Cases</i>	120
	<i>The Schloendorff Case</i>	123
	<i>The Role of the Early Cases</i>	123
	<b>1957–1972: Consent Becomes Informed</b>	125
	<i>Salgo and Battery</i>	125
	<i>Natanson and Negligence</i>	129
	<b>1972–Present: Informed Consent Flourishes</b>	132
	<i>The Canterbury Case</i>	133
	<i>Post-Canterbury: The Truman Case</i>	138
	<i>Strategies in Statutory Law</i>	139
	<b>Conclusion</b>	140
	<b>Notes</b>	143
<b>5.</b>	<b>The Development of Consent Requirements in Research Ethics</b>	151
	<b>Consent in the Biomedical Sciences</b>	152
	<i>The Nuremberg Code</i>	153
	<i>The Declaration of Helsinki</i>	156

<i>Influential Scholarly Publications</i>	157
<i>Controversy over Cases</i>	161
Consent in the Behavioral Sciences	167
<i>Psychology Gets a Code</i>	167
<i>Early Discussions of Consent and Deception</i>	171
<i>Controversial Cases and Professional Reactions</i>	172
<i>Ethical Principles in the Conduct of Research</i>	179
Conclusion	186
Notes	187
<b>6. The Evolution of Federal Policy Governing Human Research</b>	<b>200</b>
Early Federal Recognition—Two DHEW Agencies	
from 1962–1974	201
<i>An Early NIH Clinical Center Policy</i>	201
<i>FDA Policy Formulation</i>	202
<i>NIH Policy Formulations</i>	205
Later Federal Developments: Two Commissions and New Regulations from 1974–1983	215
<i>The National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioral Research: 1974–1978</i>	215
<i>Revised Regulations at DHHS: 1981</i>	218
<i>The President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research: 1980–1983</i>	221
Conclusion	222
Notes	226

### Part III. A THEORY OF INFORMED CONSENT

<b>7. The Concept of Autonomy</b>	<b>235</b>
Autonomy and Informed Consent	235
<i>Distinguishing Persons and Their Actions</i>	235
<i>Degrees of Autonomous Action</i>	237
<i>Substantially Autonomous Actions</i>	240
Three Conditions of Autonomous Action	241
<i>The Condition of Intentionality</i>	241
<i>The Condition of Understanding</i>	248
<i>The Condition of Noncontrol</i>	256
Is Authenticity a Necessary Condition?	262
<i>Authenticity as Reflective Acceptance</i>	263
<i>Possible Reformulations of the Authenticity Condition</i>	266
Conclusion	268
Notes	269

<b>8. The Concepts of Informed Consent and Competence</b>	<b>274</b>
<b>Two Concepts of Informed Consent</b>	<b>274</b>
<i>Analyzing Informed Consent</i>	276
<i>Sense<sub>1</sub>: Informed Consent as Autonomous Authorization</i>	277
<i>Sense<sub>2</sub>: Informed Consent as Effective Consent</i>	280
<i>The Relationship Between Sense<sub>1</sub> and Sense<sub>2</sub></i>	283
<b>Competence to Consent: The Gatekeeping Concept</b>	<b>287</b>
<i>The Nature and Degrees of Competence</i>	288
<i>Normative Functions of the Concept of Competence</i>	290
<i>Psychological Competence, Legitimate Authority, and Autonomous Persons</i>	291
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>293</b>
<b>Notes</b>	<b>294</b>
<b>9. Understanding</b>	<b>298</b>
<b>Understanding and Authorizing</b>	<b>299</b>
<b>Criteria of Substantial Understanding</b>	<b>300</b>
<i>Understanding That One Is Authorizing</i>	300
<i>Understanding What One Is Authorizing</i>	302
<b>Standards of Understanding and Disclosure</b>	<b>305</b>
<i>The Inadequacy of Conventional Disclosure Standards</i>	305
<i>From Disclosure to Communication: A Subjective Standard of Understanding</i>	306
<i>Core Disclosures and Shared Understanding: An Objective Standard</i>	307
<i>Open Withholding of Information</i>	312
<i>Understanding Through Effective Communication</i>	314
<b>Communication and the Understanding of Information</b>	<b>316</b>
<i>Problems of Language, Inference, and Background Knowledge</i>	316
<i>Risk and Uncertainty</i>	319
<i>Problems of Information Overload, Stress, and Illness</i>	323
<i>Confirmation of Substantial Understanding</i>	326
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>329</b>
<b>Notes</b>	<b>330</b>
<b>10. Coercion, Manipulation, and Persuasion</b>	<b>337</b>
<b>Coercion</b>	<b>338</b>
<i>The Nature of Coercion</i>	339
<i>Threats and Offers</i>	340
<i>A Subjective Criterion of Resistibility</i>	341
<i>"Coercive Situations"</i>	344
<b>Persuasion</b>	<b>346</b>
<i>The Nature of Persuasion</i>	346
<i>Warnings and Predictions</i>	349
<i>Reason and Justified Belief</i>	349
<i>Self-Persuasion</i>	353

<b>Manipulation</b>	<b>354</b>
<i>The Nature and Types of Manipulation</i>	354
<i>Manipulation of Options</i>	355
<i>Manipulation of Information</i>	362
<i>Psychological Manipulation</i>	365
<i>The Problem of Role Constraints</i>	368
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>373</b>
<b>Notes</b>	<b>374</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>383</b>