

Good Practice in Planning with Gender in the Commonwealth

Paper for the Women in Planning (WiP) Network of the Commonwealth Association of Planners, March 2009

by

**Alison Todes, Nqobile Malaza and Amanda Williamson
School of Architecture and Planning
University of the Witwatersrand
Johannesburg, South Africa**

This paper was funded through a grant from the Commonwealth Foundation and was presented at the Gender Roundtable at the World Urban Forum, Nanjing, November 2008.

Good Practice in Planning with Gender in the Commonwealth

Contents

1. Introduction.....	3
2. Generic Guidelines on Engendering Planning and Good Practice Examples from the Commonwealth.....	5
2.1. Understanding Gender	5
2.2 Governance and Participation	6
2.3. Women’s Representation in the Planning Profession.....	9
2.4. Strategic Planning	11
2.5. Infrastructure and Services	16
2.6 Settlement Planning	22
2.7. Housing.....	30
2.8. Integrated Area Development and Economic Development	32
2.9. Conclusion	36
3. Assessing Guideline Implementation	38
3.1. Strategic Planning	40
3.5. Street Trading.....	42
3.3. Safer Cities.....	44
4. Conclusion	44
5. Future Directions	46
Acknowledgements.....	47
References.....	47

1. Introduction

The Commonwealth Association of Planners (CAP) Women in Planning (WiP) Network is an advocate for gender equality within the planning profession and in planning practice in the Commonwealth. CAP itself is strongly identified with the 2006 Vancouver Declaration and the associated paper *Reinventing Planning*, which is committed to building ‘the capacity for creating safe, healthy and sustainable settlements by mobilising sharing and developing the knowledge and skills of planners’ and to ‘planning as an inclusive process...rooted in concerns for equity’ (CAP 2008: 1). Gender equality is a key dimension of this kind of inclusive planning.

The Commonwealth itself has a strong commitment to gender equality. Points four and nine of the 1991 Harare Commonwealth Declaration make specific reference to gender equality and development, as well as to the need to provide the facilities, services and infrastructure to make that possible. The more recent Commonwealth Plan of Action for Gender Equality 2005-2015 argues for gender mainstreaming in policy making, planning, programme implementation, monitoring, evaluation and reporting. The Commonwealth Principles on Good Practice for Local Democracy and Good Governance (the Aberdeen Agenda) also emphasise inclusiveness and equitable service delivery, with a particular focus on gender. The work of CAP WiP is located within these commitments, as well as within the broader international commitments around gender equality in relation to the United Nations Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and the Beijing + 10 review.

While there has been considerable attention to gender equality within Commonwealth organisations, planning or human settlement planning has not been a particularly strong focus. The Commonwealth Plan of Action on Gender Equality includes attention to poverty eradication and economic empowerment, which contains aspects of importance to planning, but the centrality of cities and planning to this work has not been understood. Yet in making manifest the objectives of the Commonwealth Declaration, it is critical to incorporate issues of gender in service delivery, city governance and physical planning, particularly in contexts of high levels of socio-political inequality (Greed 1994; Little 1994; OECD 1995). Several Commonwealth countries have attempted to actualise these issues with varying degrees of success in terms of policy intention, implementation and management. The work of the CAP WiP, and the links it makes with Commonwealth and United Nations agencies concerned with gender, urban development and planning, is critical in bringing together planners concerned to promote the incorporation of gender in human settlement planning, and may go some way towards addressing the deficit at the level of the Commonwealth itself.

This paper represents an initial exploration of gender and planning in the Commonwealth as part of the work of the CAP WiP network. One of the key objectives of CAP WiP is to collect, develop and disseminate good practice in planning for gender equity in human settlements, and to monitor progress. This paper provides an overview of key generic guidelines on gender in relation to human settlement planning, and a set of good practice

case studies from across the Commonwealth. Attention to these kinds of guidelines and practices however is potentially misleading, since it highlights what should be done and what may be a few isolated cases, but neglects the broader story of planning in practice. For this reason, the paper also considers evidence on the extent to which gender mainstreaming is occurring in various arenas of planning practice. Due to the potential size and scope of this task, and the limited availability of assessments of this sort, the paper does not attempt to provide a systematic discussion of this issue in all areas of planning. Indeed, a key conclusion that emerges is the need to assess the extent to which gender mainstreaming is occurring in practice within planning.

The CAP WiP network was used to collect good practice case studies. Cases from the United Kingdom, Sri Lanka, Canada and Australia were identified through this process. These cases were supplemented through the use of case studies documented in the UN-Habitat's Best Practices database, its recent gender and local government guide (UN-Habitat 2008a), as well as in case studies contained within other guideline documents and literature. Case studies were chosen to achieve a reasonable spread across Commonwealth countries¹, and across the following fields of planning:

- a. Governance and participation
- b. Strategic planning
- c. Gender, space and the city (transport, urban form, physical planning, safety)
- d. Housing and services
- e. Local economic development
- f. Area based planning and urban regeneration

The ten case studies are intended to be illustrative of the types of good practice that is occurring, rather than being representative. Inevitably there is some overlap in types of case study undertaken. Good practice in this context is taken to mean practice that broadly complies with the recommendations of gender guidelines. It should be noted that these are not necessarily best practice and still less "perfect practice". In one case, excellent planning was not implemented. In another, no gender analysis was undertaken, but practice is close to the recommendations of gender advocates in several respects. In many cases, and partly as a consequence of the way good practices are identified, projects focus on particular groups of women, rather than gender. Indeed, as will emerge from the analysis, a mainstreaming approach is in fact relatively rare.

The paper is structured as follows. The next section provides a set of generic good practice guidelines drawing from the literature. Good practice examples from the Commonwealth are embedded as boxes within this discussion. The section concludes by drawing out the key points of analysis from the Commonwealth good practice case study. The following section of the paper presents examples of evidence on the implementation of gender aware guidelines. The paper concludes by drawing together key findings, and by suggesting recommendations and important directions for future research.

¹ Unfortunately, it was not possible to access case studies in the Caribbeans or in South East Asia, other than Malaysia, despite word of mouth indications that there were interesting examples in some areas.

2. Generic Guidelines on Engendering Planning and Good Practice Examples from the Commonwealth

The work of international agencies and the efforts of gender advocates have highlighted the importance of gender-sensitivity in urban governance, human settlement planning and in a range of related fields such as water and sanitation, housing and transportation. Declarations, policies and guidelines have been formulated to assist in enabling gender sensitive practice. Indeed, there is no shortage of general guidelines on these matters (eg. Moser and Peake 1987; Dandekar 1992; Moser 1993; Greed 1994; Beall 1996, 2001; Chant 1996; Levy 1996; Sweetman 1996; UNCHS 1997, 2000, 2002; UN-Habitat 2008a; Reeves 2003, 2007; OPDM 2005; World Bank, 2006). The following section provides an overview of the concept of gender and then draws out key points from the literature and guidelines on incorporating gender into planning. It begins with a focus on urban governance and participation, and then moves on to a discussion of women in the planning profession; strategic planning; infrastructure and services; settlement planning (including safety); housing; and integrated area development and economic development.

Good practice case studies from the Commonwealth are inserted into these sections as examples of how engendered planning of this sort is being done in developed and developing regions of the Commonwealth. The case studies help to concretise the meaning of gender aware interventions, and also show how complex conceptual issues have been put into practice.

2.1. Understanding Gender

Gender² refers to the socially conferred roles, responsibilities and relationships that affect how women and men contribute to and benefit from social, economic and political life. Of course, women, like men, are not a homogenous group and there are many differences amongst women. Some women are working, others are mainly responsible for housework, some combine work in both arenas. Some are single, others have partners and families. There are elderly women, young girls at school, and teenagers. Women's incomes, culture, religion, and even their sexuality varies. Many women have to balance a multiplicity of roles and responsibilities at the same time and this can preclude their involvement in public life and development decision-making processes and practice. Women's experience is also crosscut by other forms of exclusion, such as on the basis of poverty, race, ethnicity, age, disabilities and education. Men's experience and position is similarly varied. Appreciating this complexity is part of gender analysis. Attention to gender rather than simply women also highlights power relations – a key element in the social life of cities (Jackson 1996; Beall 1998).

² This section and parts of sections 2.5, 2.6, 2.7 and 2.8 draw to some extent on a previous paper involving one of the authors: Beall et al (2002).

There is considerable evidence that women and men use, contribute to and gain from the city in different ways and planning initiatives need to be gender-sensitive. It is critical to both increase women's participation in human settlements development alongside men as well as to improve the gender awareness of planners, urban managers and politicians. This can be justified on the grounds of gender equity, ensuring that the priorities of both women and men are addressed and that their needs are met, but it is also important to bring in the knowledge, energy and expertise of both women and men into planning and management processes (Beall 1997a).

The early literature on women and human settlements development critiqued the stereotypical assumptions of urban policy makers and planners for assuming that a) households were male-headed and nuclear, b) there was a gender division of labour involving men in paid work and women primarily in domestic work and child-rearing, (Moser 1987, 1993) and c) that there is a strong separation between the public and private sphere, with women confined to the latter (Whitzman 1995; Beall 1996; Pain 2001; Grundström 2005; Chant 2007b).

Subsequent research has critiqued the tendency to focus on women rather than gender relations in urban contexts. An appreciation of differences between women is also beginning to overcome the tendency towards seeing women as a homogeneous category (Beall 1997a, 1997b). The more recent literature has moved away from making assumptions about how different groups of women and men live and use space in the city, and instead have focused on devising methodologies for doing so in practice (Grundstrom 2005; Greed 1994; McDowell 1997; World Bank 2006; Mtani 2002). Thus many of the more recent guidelines place considerable emphasis on analysing the conditions and needs of various groups of men and women in particular contexts, rather than reading these off a priori. Nevertheless, the earlier formulations which attempted to highlight in generic ways how gender can be understood in relation to urban development and planning (eg. Moser 1993) remain useful as tools for thinking about these issues.

2.2 Governance and Participation

The agendas of many international agencies have focused on promoting good governance and efficient urban management, and have emphasised the importance of incorporating women in development efforts as a critical mechanism to address poverty. Thus, at Beijing +5, the draft Declaration on Cities and other Human Settlements in the New Millennium outlines the intention of co-signatories to 'promote gender equality and the empowerment of women as effective ways to combat poverty and to stimulate development of human settlements that are truly sustainable'. Similarly the Habitat Agenda (2001) has called for gender equality in human settlements development, and thus it has placed women at the centre of strategic campaigns, such as the Global Campaign on Urban Governance. UN-Habitat has recognised that full implementation of its Agenda will require an enhanced role for women, thus participation of women must be encouraged and supported at all levels. UNIFEM echoes these concerns:

‘There is an urgent need for the leadership and participation of women if we are to meet the challenges of the 21st century...women are essential to addressing the pressing challenges we face: achieving the MDGs, creating more accountable institutions of local governance, ensuring more equitable resource allocation, combating HIV/AIDS and guaranteeing peace and security’ (Heyzer 2004: 1).

Gender advocates adopt a position based on a feminist critique of unequal and socially constructed gender relations. Thus, increased participation of women in human settlements development, and greater ‘gender awareness and competence amongst men and women in the political arena and planning practice’ (Beall 1996: 4) can serve to transform current power relations and bring about gender redistributive change and gender-sensitive programme and policy development (BRIDGE 2001). Similarly, the UK-based ReGender calls for ‘hearing from women and men’ so that their specific needs can be brought into planning consultative processes. From this perspective, Beall (1996) identifies three key elements of a gender-sensitive approach to urban governance:

- An improvement in women’s representation in political structures
- Women’s active participation in organisations outside of government
- Gender-sensitive and inclusive approaches to the development of urban partnerships.

While their agendas and methods reflect their respective ideologies, both international agencies and gender advocates are generally in agreement that sustainable and effective governance requires the increased participation and empowerment of women in decision-making and development processes. This should be undertaken through decentralised processes that facilitate direct engagement with women citizens as well as civil society organisations that represent their interests.

Initiatives to incorporate gender within human settlements planning generally place a very strong emphasis on participation (e.g. Reeves 2003, 2007). Apart from the importance of empowering women, advocates argue that planners need to access the specificity of experiences and perceptions of different groups of women and men in order to develop locally appropriate plans and projects (Hayden 2003; Whitzman 2007a; Hobson 2000; Grundström 2005). In addition, participation increases the likelihood of long term project sustainability (World Bank 2007). Guidelines developed to improve participation by women generally point to factors that limit their participation and provide pointers to how it can be improved. For instance, leadership styles; attitudes to women; the time taken by the domestic, subsistence and income-earning activities of women; lack of household support for women’s organisational involvement; the way meetings are announced; the time and place of meetings; and safety en route to meetings, are some factors that may affect women’s participation.

The case of Kerala, India (Box 1) provides a well known example of democratic decentralisation that was highly participatory and inclusive of women. Participation in this case has affected the content of plans and led to improved service delivery in ways that are beneficial to women.

**Box 1: *Involving Women in Grassroots Level Participatory Processes*
*People's Campaign for Decentralised Planning - Kerala, India***

In the Indian state of Kerala, the People's Campaign for Decentralised Planning demonstrated significant involvement and impacts on women. Through a well-documented exercise in decentralised participatory democracy, reforms were introduced to maximise the direct involvement of citizens in planning and budgeting at municipal and sub-municipal (panchayats) levels and granted over 35-40% of the state's developmental expenditure directly to local governments for their discretionary allocation. The Kerala State Planning Board created an elaborate series of nested participatory exercises, comprising four phases in each annual cycle, in which citizens are given a direct role in shaping — rather than just choosing — policies and projects (Heller et al. 2007). As part of this planning process, the state, supported by civil society organisations, undertook an extensive training programme of Key Resource Persons which involved 100,000 people. As it evolved the programme was specifically targeted at women and marginalised groups. The state also set parameters for local level expenditure, and stipulated compulsory minimum expenditures for women and marginalised groups. Thus, publicity and policies have specifically targeted women with special fund allocations, training programmes, and mobilisation efforts (op. cit.).

Citizen participation in the planning process has been relatively high, and in the second year of the Campaign women represented 41% of the participants. Despite declining levels of participation in recent years, features from the Campaign's inception remain noteworthy. A particular achievement has been the high levels of activity from organisations, such as women's organisations which have not been traditionally associated with political participation. Thus, women's organisations were drawn to the forefront of associational life through the efforts of the state's programme to encourage women's involvement, and those of women's groups to form small neighbourhood groups for women.

Citizen mobilisation was effectively translated to increased perceptions among people's sense of voice, in other words, their willingness to make demands and influence decision-making. Women's organizations felt that there had been a marked increase in women's voice. A large proportion of respondents felt that there had been 'drastic change' in bringing women more into the public arena and empowering them in raising development issues.

Before its inception in 1996 people felt that the quality of services and development had been poor, and most specifically in the area of 'efforts to improve income and employment for women'. After five years of the Campaign, a large proportion of respondents felt that there had been 'some' or 'significant' improvements. Almost two-thirds of respondents felt that 'felt needs are always reflected in the final plan'. These findings show that the participatory planning processes were inclusionary, broadly representative, and quite successful in processing popular inputs through the decision-making chain (op. cit.).

Impacts of the Campaign have been particularly noticeable for women. These findings, drawn from Heller, Harilal and Chaudhuri's survey (2007) demonstrate that the development planning process in Kerala has effectively empowered women through a deliberately participatory, inclusive and redistributive process, facilitated women's presence in the local governance sphere, and increased the political space within which they can mobilise themselves (Hickey and Mohan 2004).

2.3. Women's Representation in the Planning Profession

The need to equalise the representation of men and women in the planning profession is also of concern to several professional planning organisations. Although it cannot be assumed that women planners represent the interests of women in general, a broader gender balance is an important part of creating gender equity and improving inclusivity within the profession.

In March 2008, data for the Royal Town Planning Institute (RTPI), which is based in London, showed that women make up under a third (31.4%) of its 21,213 members. In the numerically smaller categories of technical members (planning support staff), licentiates (i.e. graduates en route to full membership) and students, however, the ratio of women to men reaches parity. In South Africa, the numbers of women in the planning profession has been rising, and between 1994 and 2004 their representation increased from 28% to 34% (Todes and Mngadi 2007: 10).

The UK data seems to indicate that a proportion of female planning students do not continue to register with the Institute after graduation or leave the profession. Rahder and Altília (2004) have noted similar trends in North America. They have shown that while numbers of female planning students and female planners have increased steadily, the numbers of the former have far outstripped the latter. It seems that women planning graduates have left the profession for three main reasons: changing fields, lacking employment opportunities, or becoming stay-at-home mothers (Rahder and Altília 2004: 110). In Australia the professional planning body, the Planning Institute of Australia, has been proactive in identifying these trends and proposing recommendations that will positively impact on the number of women in planning practice and improve their workplace experience.

Box 2: Supporting the Participation of Women Planners - Australia

In 2004, the Planning Institute of Australia (PIA) completed its first National Inquiry into Planning Education and Employment to investigate the perceived shortage of urban and regional planners, their workplace environments and their professional training. Of concern were the findings relating to female planners, which contributed significantly to the overall shortage of planning skills. In general terms, the number of women in the planning profession has increased since the 1970s, and they account for 40% of graduates

and represent half of all planners under the age of 35 years, which indicates the ease of access to the profession by interested women. However, this proportion drops to 26% among female planners over 35 years of age. In other words, a significant number of qualified, experienced female planners are leaving planning practice. The Inquiry revealed that the difficulties in balancing work and family responsibilities were the main factors accounting for their departure.

Planners are often subjected to highly stressful working conditions, particularly in local government, which arise from political pressures, high volumes of work, legislative requirements, demands from the community and the development industry, and limited human and financial resources. As a result many planners are suffering from burn-out. For women trying to juggle home and family pressures, these stressful and 'toxic' conditions can be a prime factor for seeking employment in related areas (such as natural resource management, transport or social planning) or choosing to work on a part-time basis. In 2001, a quarter of women planners worked part-time compared to ten percent of men, indicating their preference for more flexible employment conditions. However, some workplaces do not offer flexible working arrangements, such as working from home or job-sharing, although employers are becoming more accommodating as they feel the impact of the shortage. Re-entering planning practice requires that skills and knowledge are up-to-date, and women who have taken a leave of absence for family reasons can find this a barrier to their return.

In addition to these findings, the Inquiry also noted that women were under-represented in senior decision-making positions, and that there were few female role models to offer support, guidance and encouragement to younger women. These findings not only raise issues about the loss of experienced women from the profession, but also point to the insufficiencies in the current system which is not as representative of women's interests, or as supportive to new female entrants as expected.

The Planning Institute of Australia has demonstrated its proactive concern by proposing a series of recommendations that are aimed at assisting male and female planners to return to and stay in the Australian workforce. These recommendations include ensuring that flexible working conditions are available (such as working from home, job sharing, job exchange, secondments, contract or part-time work), particularly within local government, to support qualified and experienced female planners back into the workforce. The Institute has also submitted its findings to the House of Representatives inquiries on Balancing Work and Family, and Increasing Participation in the Workforce in 2005, which both seek to address the current barriers to attracting and retaining a skilled labour force. It has also conducted discussions with the Australian Local Government Association about a range of issues affecting planners.

2.4. Strategic Planning

Bryson (1995) defines strategic planning as a disciplined effort to produce fundamental decisions and actions that shape and guide what an organisation is, what it does, and why it does it. It is a process whereby all the organisational functions and resources are integrated and co-ordinated to implement formulated strategies which are aligned with the environment, in order to achieve the long-term objectives of the organisation (Ehlers and Lazenby 2004). As an institutional tool designed to rationally plan future management of resources towards identified goals, it has been quickly adopted as an element of good governance. The renewed emphasis on strategic planning enabled gender activists to advocate for gender mainstreaming - to ensure that a gender-blind approach was not reproduced in subsequent development efforts, and instead, that gender equality was achieved.

Adopting a gender perspective is at the heart of gender mainstreaming. According to the UNDP (2000: v), it is:

‘the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in any areas and at all levels. It is a strategy for making women’s as well as men’s concerns and experiences an integral dimension of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and societal spheres so that women and men benefit equally and inequality is not perpetuated’.

Rather than adding on a women’s component to existing initiatives, a gender perspective informs these at all stages of the decision-making process. Similarly, the Commonwealth Secretariat (Leo-Rhynie et al 1999: 9) defines gender mainstreaming as the consistent use of a gender perspective at all stages of the development and implementation of policies, plans, programmes and projects. It involves:

- bringing about institutional change to ensure the empowerment of both women and men through equal participation in decision-making on issues which affect their lives
- analysing all government policies and practices to examine the differential impact they have on men and women
- providing training and capacity-building to enhance gender management and raise the general level of gender awareness.

Gender mainstreaming is a flexible strategy that accommodates mainstreaming women into all projects, women-specific components, and separate projects and programmes directed exclusively at women (www.adb.org).

As Beall (1996: 17) notes, ‘Policy and planning with an understanding of gender does not come naturally to professionals whether women or men. Changes in organisational culture are required to foster gender sensitive analyses and consultative processes.’ Thus,

gender mainstreaming is both a technical and a political process (BRIDGE 1997). It is not something to simply add onto existing operations because it goes to the heart of the institution and the values of all persons associated with it. Institutionalising gender equality requires a fundamental mindshift within government, underpinned by a process of organisational transformation, which goes far beyond the adoption of a gender policy or affirmative action programme. It means that all elements of a municipality, including the organisational culture and values, operations and resource allocations, need to be critically reviewed to become more inclusive (van Donk 2000).

Reeves (2002) notes that the REFLEX tool provides a useful set of conditions against which to assess whether a strategic plan is likely to promote gender equality. It calls for the following:

- relevant gendered information needs to be collected
- women and men need to be represented on decision-making bodies
- policies need to reflect different needs
- measurable goals and outcomes need to be established.

More specifically geared towards practical implementation, the RTPI Gender Mainstreaming Toolkit (2003) shows how to incorporate a consideration of gender into planning. It is based on a series of questions and can be used at any stage of the plan-making process. In summary, these are:

- Who are the planners?
- Who forms the policy team?
- Which sorts of people are perceived to be planned?
- How are statistics gathered and who do they include?
- What are the key values, priorities and objectives of the plan?
- Who is consulted and who is involved in participation?
- How are the planning proposals evaluated? By whom?
- How is the policy implemented, monitored and managed?
- Is gender mainstreaming fully integrated into all policy areas?

Thus, in the planning process, the implementation of gender mainstreaming usually entails the following elements: gender analysis; sex-disaggregated data; gender-sensitive indicators; institutional mechanisms; gender-responsive resource allocation; and gender partnerships and networks.

Box 3 provides an example of mainstreaming gender within a strategic planning process in Plymouth in the United Kingdom. Although not implemented, the Plymouth Gender Audit (2001) represents a comprehensive exercise in applying mainstreaming principles to policy making and processes, in this case to the review of the Plymouth Local Plan.

Box 3: Mainstreaming Principles in Policy Making: Gender Audit - Plymouth, United Kingdom

The audit commences with a gender profile for Plymouth using readily available statistics as well as the findings from a series of people-based consultations undertaken in 2000.

The key areas it highlights include:

- implications of the gender gap in labour market participation and pay
- gender gap in family and caring responsibilities
- gender differences in leisure needs
- gender differences in housing needs
- gender differences in transport and accessibility
- gender differences in shopping
- gender differences in individual and community safety

A Gender Issues Matrix was prepared to identify gendered issues which have planning implications. It uses the topics of the Local Plan as the basis for the identification of issues that may be relevant to many groups including women. The topics it covers are: A Vision for Plymouth, Plymouth’s Planning Strategy, Environment, Waste, Minerals, Housing, Community, Education, Health, Leisure, Tourism, Employment, Shopping, Transport, Implementation and Monitoring. The Matrix examines each in terms of sub-themes, and then considers each in terms of gender issue, source of data, and planning implications.

The Matrix lists issues under headings of home, neighbourhood, and city, and relates these to information on the everyday lives of women in Plymouth based on an analysis of the women and planning literature, the most recently available statistics and the consultation exercises carried out as part of this study. The Matrix was designed specifically to illustrate those issues that may not be immediately recognised as high priorities to those who do not experience their effects as part of their everyday lives. Exploring issues at the three different scales allowed for reconsideration of many issues in relation to very different settings that may alter their relative priorities, or the nature of detailed responses that are appropriate (Mackie 2001).

The example below shows how one of the housing sub-themes under the heading of ‘using the home’ has been fleshed out.

Housing	Relevant gender issues	Source of data	Planning implications
Limitations on choice of housing type and location	Many women may be forced to rent or to live in sub-standard housing, or housing remote from services and facilities because of low incomes.	Consultation Exercise Housing Statistics Employment statistics	Encourage a wide range of low cost housing for rent, located in the City Centre and other well served districts.

On the basis of this information, the Local Plan’s objectives and policies are explored to identify sections where a gendered impact might be expected, and where a gendered perspective might raise opportunities for refinement of these policies or the development of slightly different policies. The table below illustrates the application to draft policy on housing.

Draft Policy	Likely impact on gender relations	Gender issues	Recommendations
House extensions for	Equality orientated	Gender gap in caring	Consider how the policy

dependent relatives	The policy is providing for the housing needs of older women as well as men	responsibilities with women tending to take on the caring role. Because of the gender age profile, women are more likely to use this type of accommodation. Need to cater for the needs of a wide range of needs in different cultural communities.	could reflect different needs as well as ensuring good quality housing. Replace 'granny flat' with gender neutral term. Encourage the production of design guidelines for this type of accommodation to enable more caring to be shared
---------------------	---	---	---

A detailed list of questions was formulated to determine the gender impacts of project proposals. They related to problem and situation identification; project and programme objectives; project strategy; project implementation; project management; and project monitoring and evaluation.

On problem and situation identification:

- For the development problem selected for project intervention, does this problem affect women and men differently? Are the different problems adequately stated in the proposal?
- Did women as well as men from the target group participate in the problem, needs and situation analyses? Was the participation equally representative of women's and men's views?
- Is there an assessment of the specific constraints that women and men face in accessing opportunities and resources and in participating in the development process? Is this assessment sufficiently comprehensive?

On project and programme objectives:

- Do the objectives make clear that the intervention will benefit equally women and men?
- Does the intervention state in what specific ways it intends to lead to improved equality between men and women? e.g. improved access by women to resources, increased female participation in decision making, increased remuneration and labour market position in relation to men?

On the project strategy:

- Is the intervention aimed at a target group involving both women and men?
- Does the strategy address the different needs, experiences and potentials of women and men?
- Does the strategy include measures to overcome the constraints on women's participation? Are these measures sufficient to achieve equal participation by women and men?
- Is the strategy therefore likely to achieve the intended equality objectives?

On the project implementation:

- Do the implementation methods make sufficient use of women's and equal opportunities networks and organisations?
- Are the implementation methods appropriate for ensuring equal participation by women and men?

On project management:

- Is there a management policy on equality between women and men in the development process?
- Are women and men represented equally on the management committee? Are women and men from target population also represented?
- Are the project managers trained in gender awareness and gender analysis? If not, is this included

in the proposal, or being undertaken outside the framework of this intervention?

- Will sufficient human resources and expertise be provided to manage and monitor the equality dimensions of the intervention?

On project monitoring and evaluation:

- Are the inputs for the project objectives and outputs gender-disaggregated?
- Are the indicators relating to equality realistic and sufficient? e.g. are they realistic compared to the current situation and proposed intervention? Are they sufficient for achieving real progress in equality between women and men in the given situation?
- Is specific monitoring of the equality objectives and outputs intended? Will the monitoring and reporting be sufficient for timely adjustment to be made to the intervention if equality outputs are not being achieved?
- Will there be evaluations of the equality dimensions of the intervention?
- Will women and men from the target populations be involved in the evaluations?

Possible indicators and outputs for each of the objectives were then suggested to assist in the process of implementation. The table below illustrates the indicators for many of the objectives.

No.	Objectives	Suggested indicators or outputs for future use
1	To support the economy of the South west of England through developing Plymouth's role as a Regional Centre for the South West and as an international centre for knowledge and learning.	% women and men employed in regional economy % of women and men employed in education and training
2	To develop a greater integration of the city's economy with regional, national and international networks through the maintenance and improvement of strategic transport and communication links.	% of women and men benefiting from strategic communication links
6	To protect and improve the quality, vitality of the city centre, district and local shopping centres and to meet the shopping needs of all local residents and of the sub-region.	% of women and men who use local, district or city centres Number of facilities for women and men in each centre
7	To ensure that all Plymouth's residents have access to good quality living environment and a home which is affordable and suitable to their needs.	Number of new homes provided within 5 minutes walk of existing transport/schools/ shops/employment facilities Number of new energy efficient homes Number of homes affordable by women and men
8	To ensure that all local people have good access to a range of shopping, community, health, employment and cultural facilities, including art, open space, libraries and leisure and sporting facilities.	Number of child care facilities available in each location Number of facilities accessible by public transport Number of facilities catering for leisure needs of women and men
11	To safeguard and improve the health and limit the environmental impact of development.	Number of women and men affected by the environmental impacts of development; noise, air and water and ground pollution
12	To reduce crime, accidents and the fear of crime	Numbers of women and men

	through sensible design of the built environment and transport systems.	experiencing crime in and around the home, in local and district centres, at interchanges and pedestrian routes Numbers of women and men who do not go out because of a fear of crime Number of women and men who have accidents as pedestrians, cyclists, drivers, passengers in private or public transport
--	---	---

2.5. Infrastructure and Services

Infrastructure and services are key areas for improvement from a gender perspective. The level of services and infrastructure provided has a very direct impact on domestic work. For example, in many Commonwealth countries long distances to walk for water and poor quality water affect the time taken for housework as well as the health of households. The HIV/AIDS epidemic has exacerbated problems associated with poor water and sanitation, particularly for women who often take on caring roles. Thus in very general terms, a higher standard of services is very much in the interests of low-income women as it reduces demands on their time and can improve their own and other household members' health and welfare.

Attention to gender issues in infrastructure and service provision is usually concerned with identifying gender-differentiated preferences, needs, roles and responsibilities that may impact on services. This then informs investment and services choices, of particular relevance in demand-led approaches or when different levels of service provision are being considered. Appropriate consultation over settlement planning with both men and women is now stressed by many writers, not least because women are the people who spend most time in residential areas, in pursuit of their domestic responsibilities which often spill over into community management activities (Moser 1987a). Despite this, their views are often overlooked in settlement planning or house design.

Examples of good practice include where consultative processes with groups of women have resulted in designs that are different to the standard grid layouts, which some argue, isolate women in the home, and make it difficult to engage in mutual help, such as supervising children (Schlyter 1984; Hayden 1980; Beall 1996). The literature also cites classic cases where services designed for men (such as hand pumps) did not work because they were mainly used by women and children, who could not reach them and thus could not use them properly. Another example is where communal toilets alongside a public thoroughfare were re-sited in order to afford women more privacy.

Box 4 provides a case study in Thatta in Pakistan of gender-aware integrated infrastructure development and planning. Importantly, although infrastructural improvements were at the core of the project, it was multi-sectoral, addressing

livelihoods and environmental issues amongst others. While the project was not specifically or exclusively directed to women, the considerations of gender and gender development were incorporated and specified in the project objectives. Its usefulness lies in illustrating how:

- involving women at project inception can highlight issues project managers do not necessarily consider or cater for;
- how projects can incorporate the perspectives of women and girls in project design;
- how improving and expanding city infrastructure can directly impact on women's livelihoods, and
- how the imperatives of environmental sustainability and infrastructure development can be linked to socio-political agendas of gender development.

Box 4. Infrastructure and Livelihoods – Integrated Built Environment Development (IBED): Built Environment Improvement Programme (BEIP) – Thatta, Pakistan³

The project's main purpose was to ensure an integrated approach to planning and infrastructure provision – especially to poor and marginalised communities, by 'enhancing accessibility to improved basic infrastructure facilities... as well as providing capacity building for NGOs, for project development management and technical assistance for better house planning and design that has produced social, economic and environmental impacts leading to sustainability' (UN-Habitat 2006). Essentially, the project objectives lie at the interface between integrated planning, responsive project management, improvement of livelihoods, environmental sustainability and gender development.

Located in Sindh Province, about 100km east of Karāchi, Thatta is a city that is home to about 1.1 million people and is in the process of modernising itself. Before the project began, about 97% of the population did not have access to potable water or to any form of latrines in some areas. The untreated disposal of household wastewater had polluted the city water supply so badly that it caused a decline in fish hatcheries yields – especially distressing given that almost the entire community (directly or indirectly) live on fishing, earning an average family income of Rs. 5000 – Rs. 6000 per month. Furthermore, domestic firewood consumption had put excessive pressure on the surrounding mangrove forests.

Three of the ten project objectives related directly to improving women's livelihoods – providing technical assistance to local entrepreneurs; skills enhancement programmes; as well as empowering households with knowledge on domestic hygiene, primary health care and environmental sustainability. Two objectives related to providing institutional support, capacity building as well as information dissemination and generating local awareness of the project. The remaining set of strategies and objectives concerned infrastructure delivery; environmental conservation and sustainability; community

³ Source: UN-HABITAT Best Practices Database, 2006.

Go to <http://staging.unhcs.org/bestpractices/2006/bplist.asp> for more information.

healthcare; building affordable housing; and a general improvement in the physical environment of the city.

Project support was provided by a number of NGOs including the UNDP, Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (PPAF), Aga Khan Foundation (AKF) and AusAID. The Aga Khan Planning and Building Service, Pakistan (AKPBSP) was responsible for managing the project as well as funding research and development into a range of infrastructure technologies. The 10 IBED Village Development Organisations (VDOs) and Management Committees representing the interests of communities on the ground had 100 women in various positions and capacities, actively participating in project activities. IBED operated on a 'no subsidy' basis meaning that households served by the programme were responsible for the improvements and costs of the end product (anything from street lights and drainage systems at a community scale to smokeless stoves and water pumps at a household level) – a cost based only on materials and manufacturing.

Under the management of the AKPBSP, and in cooperation with the provincial and city structures the Built Environment Improvement Programme (BEIP) instituted a number of projects designed to meet the previously explained objectives. Some are particularly relevant to the discussion:

- A project to instruct masons on the construction and manufacturing of smokeless stoves and chimneys that trained 12 local people, 10 of whom were women to work both in Thatta and nearby towns as well 127 others trained to construct and deliver a range of IBED products;
- Another project related to water and sanitation provided women with an opportunity to be trained as health and hygiene promoters, working in conjunction with two other programmes – Community Health Intervention and School Health Improvement – with a total of 30 women receiving skills training. This is an example of an infrastructure-related project specifically targeting, but also driven and managed by them as well.

As the project brief (UN-Habitat 2006) explains: 'Input was specifically sought from women both during planning as well as the implementation phase of the BEIP. Women were encouraged to assist and guide IBED by citing and selecting locations for installation of IBED living environment improvement products and technological interventions, and were also involved in the construction of these improved household products. Moreover, informal education to women on domestic health and hygiene (issues)...was provided through workshops, meetings and field level briefings.'

As a result of these and other interventions, innovations and initiatives, the BEIP had a range of positive outcomes for Thatta in general and women in particular, with regard to women's livelihoods, skills capacity, political involvement, managerial responsibility within the planning process and their ability to care for their families. In addition, women were given the skills to improve and manage their environment, and to diversify the economic base of the city. The project helped to begin to entrench the principles of gender empowerment and development in a country with a very patriarchal structure. Some of the results of the BEIP, and the ideas of IBED were:

- An observed increase in households' disposable income as a result of savings on energy (a cumulative saving of Rs. 1 934 400 in one year) - particularly for female headed households;
- As a result of greater interaction amongst the IBED partner villages in and around Thatta, many women who had never left their neighbourhoods before, were afforded opportunities to travel and be exposed to other areas of Sindh province;
- The increased institutional and financial capacity of local government, local NGOs and CBOs for the implementation of skills training projects – some aimed especially at women.

IBED was initiated by AKPBSB in 1997 and has since has installed 700 demonstration models of its various products in various cities in the Northern Areas and Chitral region of Pakistan. By 2005, over 12 000 products had been replicated by community members at their own expense. In 2003 the AKPBSB through funding from the UNDP, began and replicated the BEIP around the Sindh province. Similar projects have also been undertaken in the Azad Jammu-Kashmir and Nathiagali regions of the country. Internationally, the AKPBSB has engaged in a number of knowledge sharing initiatives in order to disseminate the techniques and lessons learnt from the Programme.

One key to the project's sustainability and success was in attracting, engaging and involving the youth: young women and men who were far more comfortable embracing new technologies and ideas. Young women especially, displayed enthusiasm for IBED because it offered them a way to meet their familial responsibilities while still being able to engage in programmes that would improve their social status and earning power. This focus on the youth was partly because of the highly technical nature of some of the initiatives, and also as a result of the AKPBSB's vision of transforming Thatta society.

The involvement of women was also critical. The AKPBSB 'found women to be much more acquainted with housing and community infrastructure problems than men. Their input, though slow to take off, was invaluable. Women were also noticeably more interested in the entire project and its potential benefits, perhaps because of the realisation that they were the principal beneficiaries of the programme' (UN-Habitat 2006).

The VDOs allowed the process of community participation to be reiterative and continual, and in this way the project illustrates how incorporating women institutionally helps to enhance the quality of the responses programmes propose. There was recognition that receiving feedback from the client communities even after the models had been developed was important, especially when that feedback meant that changes needed to be made. Moreover, the use of indigenous knowledge, expertise and materials made IBED much more context appropriate and applicable.

The World Bank (2007:1) has recognised the important role that well designed transport networks and services could play in ensuring gender development, both in policy and practice:

‘Women’s safety suffers when their needs are not taken into account in transport project design. Addressing transport-related gender inequalities is smart economics. It benefits society as a whole. Poor women, who balance productive, social, and reproductive roles, often have higher demands on their time than poor men. Gender-responsive infrastructure interventions can free up women’s time by lowering their transaction costs. This, in turn, increases girls’ school enrolment and facilitates women’s participation in income-generation and decision-making activities. Evidence from Pakistan, (for instance) shows that an all-weather motorable road may increase girls’ primary school enrolment by 50 % and female literacy by 75 %... Gender-responsive transport services can thus serve as a powerful vehicle to achieving several of the MDGs. They help empower women, improve health, provide education opportunities and ultimately reduce poverty.’

The planning of transport systems is a fundamental aspect of urban and regional planning. Providing well designed, maintained and managed transport systems (physical and administrative) that are also gender-sensitive could potentially have far reaching, largely positive impacts for citizens – especially those who are currently marginalised by existing unresponsive solutions.

Women are also more likely to be dependent on public transport, particularly in low-income communities (Levy 1991; Little 1996; Khosa 1998; Peters 1998). The need for planning that is supportive of public transport is stressed by several authors. For instance, layouts that force public transport to remain on the edges, rather than penetrating into the residential fabric have been criticised for offering poor public transport to women, forcing them to walk long distances, and making them vulnerable to crime (Trench et al. 1992). The predominance of public transport oriented to home-work journeys, neglecting other trip needs, women’s safety on public transport, and the timing and frequency of services are other areas raised in the literature.

Box 5 provides a good practice case study of a project to make public transport safer for women in Montréal, Canada. It also illustrates how effective multi-sectoral partnerships striving for a clearly defined goal (safer public transit for women) can be, and that the solutions to problems facing women can be simple, but very effective and appropriate.

Box 5. *Gendered Perspectives in the Public Transport Services. Between Two Stops Service: Montréal, Canada*

Examining how planners might intervene to make public transport safer for women has been an important strategy employed to make cities safer for women. Literature on transport suggests that men and women have different commuting patterns and mode of travel preferences. Many transport experts working in developed countries like Canada and the UK are predicting that women’s travel demands and expectations will have an

increasing impact on their work and consequently female responses to travel demand management strategies are also likely to become more critical. Two studies on public transport in Montréal in 1994 (Wakeley and You 2002; Patterson *et al* 2004: 9) revealed that while women were the principal users of public transit – constituting some 60% of users – ‘women prefer the public transit option much less than men do.’ This finding was reinforced by the results of a Gallup poll suggesting that almost 60% of women in Montréal did not feel safe walking in their local area at night.

The city of Montréal is the second largest in Canada and more than half (52%) of whose residents are women. So, ensuring the safety of women in the city using public transit became a primary concern not just for the residents, but the city administrators and politicians as well. In response to this imperative, the Comité Action Femmes et Sécurité Urbaine (CAFSU) was founded in 1992. The CAFSU ‘is a partnership between women’s groups, municipal authorities, city planners, university research groups, public transit officials, health officials and the police’ (Wakeley and You 2002: 81). After a request from Centres de Femme,⁴ the CAFSU approached La Société de Transport de la Communauté Urbaine de Montréal (STCUM), which runs the public transit system on the island of Montréal, to put in a place a bus service system to address issues of women’s safety in public transit at night. The service would allow women to get off the bus *between* two regular stops at night in order to decrease women’s walking distance from the bus to their destination. In 1994, the *Between Two Stops* pilot project was instituted to scrutinise and evaluate the viability of the service – a service strictly for girl and women users only (Wakeley and You 2002).

The STCUM were responsible for the financial expenses related to the project. This included expenses related to the marketing, logistical support and the evaluation process – in total, these costs amounted to US\$6350 over a six month period. The evaluation and promotion of the project was done with the assistance of the Ville de Montréal’s Femme et Ville (Women in the City) with the Centres de Femmes members completing evaluation forms and mobilising women to show support for the project. Furthermore, the project worked in conjunction with other activities and initiatives including one to install emergency telephones near bus stations and a programme designed to train workers at small businesses to respond to women in danger.

Between Two Stops did however, face some challenges. Wakeley and You’s (2002: 83) work highlights that one of the major obstacles faced by the project ‘...was to make it clear that this service was exclusively for girls and women. The Human Rights Commission rejected complaints of discrimination...recognising that this was a positive action to reduce gender inequality in terms of mobility, particularly in the evening.’ In response to this, the STCUM devised a communications strategy which used various media forms, targeted specifically at female users of the service.

As a consequence of this multi-faceted approach, the project’s ability to respond directly to the needs of women and the high profile the project received through targeted promotion and awareness campaigns, the project was permanently instituted in December

⁴ Centres de Femmes is a coalition of 22 women’s centres, reaching approximately 40 000 throughout Montréal.

1996 – with the service extending its hours from 21:30 to 19:30 (UN-Habitat 2008b).

The collaboration between the CAFSU, STCUM and Montréal's Women in the City programme has highlighted the positive ripple effect that a single initiative can produce – improving systems of information dissemination, acknowledging that local authorities can make tangible contributions to support women toward autonomy and equality when they recognise women as the main recipients of their services, skills and safety training, and the value of successful strategic partnership. Essentially, 'success was achieved by recognising the specific needs of women in the overall allocation of public resources and creating a low-cost strategic policy that transformed the economic and social lives of women' (UN-Habitat 2008b).

From a management standpoint, the project also provides a useful framework for how other similar projects could evaluate their performance and appropriateness, as well as how the tools of evaluation (evaluation forms in this case) could be disseminated to the relevant target groups. The project's clever utilisation of existing organisations and networks meant that the *process* of evaluation could be effectively monitored.

2.6 Settlement Planning

Considerable attention has been given within the feminist literature to planning settlements that meet the needs of both men and women and that are convenient and safe for children. In low income areas particular attention has to be given to the safety of people dependent on public transport or walking. Traditional planning models within the Commonwealth focused on low density, segmented, inwardly oriented neighbourhoods, with concentrations of facilities and services some distance from homes. These have been criticised by several writers (e.g. Trench et al. 1992; Posselthwyte 1986; Manchip 1986). Other physical planning issues raised in the literature include direct, safe, well-lit pedestrian routes; the provision of recreational/leisure facilities that serve the needs of both men and women; adequate play spaces; accessible shops and other services; and the location of facilities, services, recreation and shopping close to good public transport routes.

The importance of well-located housing for women is stressed by several writers. The 'double burden' of responsibility for domestic work within the home and paid work elsewhere, is compounded by time spent covering long distances to work. Studies reported by Moser (1987) demonstrate how peripheral locations have made it impossible for some women to combine paid work with child care and other chores, while others demonstrate the benefits offered by central city locations for poor women (Miraftab 1994). Trends towards urban sprawl and growth on the periphery of the city have grown over the past two decades (Oranje 2002). For many women this has meant even longer trips to work, more time away from their families, more money spent on transport costs and ultimately less disposable income.

Traditional planning based on land use separation has also led to fragmented urban environments where residences, the workplace as well as shopping and leisure districts are in separate spaces linked by extensive motorways and transportation systems. These are often seen as contrary to the needs of women (Beall 1996; Jaeckel and van Geldermalsen 2006). Most feminist planners promote mixed land use and are critical of old style land use separation, which has been shown to isolate women at home, to make access to services and facilities inconvenient, and to discourage home-based work (Posselthywte, 1986; Little, 1994; Moser, 1987). The importance of seeing the home as a productive space for women, many of whom work from home, has also been stressed in the literature (Greed, 1994). This has implications not only for zoning, but also for plot size, and the design of housing.

Guidelines have been developed which attempt to move beyond these limitations. For instance, some emphasise encouraging local neighbourhoods to develop allotments to supplement food supplies for vulnerable families (Wakeley and You 2002), or projects to provide affordable housing in and around the inner city where women-headed households receive preferential access, or to improve public transport between residential and central business areas. These interventions aim to reduce home-to-work transit times and increase women's opportunities for employment (Wakeley and You 2002).

The literature also emphasises moving away from the notion that women's work and home lives are wholly separate and occur in different activity arenas. It implies that the long held notion that the spatial organisation of a city as a division between private and public is an over-simplification (Whitzman 1995; Beall 1996; Pain 2001; Grundström 2005; Chant 2007b). Yeoh and Huang's (1998: 583) characterisation of the public and private as 'co-related and interpenetrative spheres' is particularly constructive for planners as it shows that women's lives in the city are spatially complex and nuanced.

While generic guidelines are very useful in thinking about the gender in relation to urban space, the imperative is to appreciate the more complex ways in which women and men interact with and use urban space in everyday life. Understanding how different activities are valued and positioned in relation to one another, and how this relationship is manifested in physical form is a valuable foundation for analysing the gendered built environment (Grundström 2005). Understanding where and how women and men use the city can uncover a whole range of study components underlying both the patterns and motivations for urban space use (Mtani 2002; World Bank 2006; Whitzman 2007a). Mapping and data collection can enhance the ability of urban designers and physical planners to formulate frameworks that are responsive, appropriate and better suited to the developmental and social context. Moreover, it allows planning to forecast possible changes and deviations in movement and use patterns – particularly as it applies to the shifting trends regarding women's use of the home environment and private space (Greed 1994; McDowell 1997).

In addition, the urban environment is a vital arena in promoting genuine and productive social inclusion in cities (ADB 2000; Hayden 2003; Grundström 2005), and policy needs

to understand this link between gender identity and the use of the urban in the everyday context (Broadbent 1990). In doing so, physical planners begin to develop policy and frameworks that better grapple with the ubiquitous nature of power relations and how it shapes state proposed design interventions, (Flyvbjerg 1998; Hayden 2003; Gendersite 2008) how and where to best provide services and infrastructure to enable women not simply to survive but to live efficiently and effectively, (McDowell 1997) and to better synergise the ability of urban space to facilitate women's lifestyles and livelihoods, especially at the neighbourhood scale (Greed 2006a; UN-Habitat 2006).

Settlement planning and design that promotes safety is also critical, given rising levels of crime and sexual violence in many cities. 'Safe' design includes, inter alia, good street lighting; avoiding deserted spaces or areas that are not peopled for parts of the day; avoiding places where women are easily trapped, such as subways and alleyways; designing parks that are overlooked, and do not contain places where attackers can easily hide (Trench et al. 1992; Little 1996). There is debate over whether safety is best created through controllable defensible spaces (such as culs de sac), enclosing and segmenting spaces, or through outward facing layouts, with continuity of access to create well used public spaces. Trench et al (1992) argue that different options may be appropriate depending on the context. Women are also often concerned about the safety of environments for children, such as busy roads, lack of safe places to play, polluted areas and so on.

The question of safety has received considerable attention in practice. The UN-Habitat's Safer Cities programme is a world wide initiative with projects in 22 countries. It has acknowledged that women are particularly vulnerable to certain forms of violence due to social inequalities between men and women. The UN-Habitat Strategic Plan for Safer Cities (2007: 8) sets out what its roles are on three administrative levels:

‘At the **global level**, the Programme undertakes advocacy on local crime prevention, policy development on human settlements and on the governance dimensions of crime prevention, documents and analyses experiences, and develops and disseminates tools for local governments.

At the **regional level**, region specific strategies are developed to complement this global strategy and orient its work. Regional efforts will be strategic in nature and aim at those regions where the needs are the most urgent or least addressed. Key partners at this level will be regional bodies with a role in influencing national policies.

In addition, at the **local level**, the Programme provides indirect support to local actors formulating and implementing local crime prevention strategies, and direct support in collaboration with partners.’

Its work as it relates to violence against women has five basic principles designed to give projects running around the world procedural, managerial and ethical guidance (Smaoun 2002):

- ‘Situate city action within a framework or approach that promotes gender equality;
- Involve men in solutions to problems;
- Use the findings of gender-based analyses of gender-disaggregated data to inform the development and implementation of safety walks which support women's perspectives;
- Develop partnerships with important actors in the domain of violence and promote a gender approach in work undertaken with them;
- Share practices, experiences, evaluations, etc – especially given the importance of the phenomena of violence at the international level.’

Using this five-pronged approach, UN-Habitat hopes to better institutionalise efforts to create safer cities for women, and to encourage governments to prioritise the safety of women in policy and practice. Here, safety is defined in broad terms, and does not only seek to address the threat of criminal activity on women, but also the impacts of poor service provision, ill-conceived urban design and the marginalisation of women in political decision making processes.

Boxes 6 and 7 provide two case studies from the Safer Cities programmes in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania and Nairobi, Kenya. These case studies point to how planning can be used to improve safety conditions for women in cities. The methodology of gender safety audits used is a particularly constructive tool in developing gendered urban planning interventions. While the focus is on safety, these processes highlight a range of physical planning issues of significance for women. The case studies also show the importance of a participatory process and the inclusion of a range of organisations in planning of this type. The use of public-private partnerships, as the case studies show, is important in broadening community awareness of urban space issues that affect them.

**Box 6 *Incorporating the Perspectives of Women in Creating Safer Cities:
The UN Safer Cities Project: Safety Audit – Dar es Salaam, Tanzania***

Manzese, the case study area, is located in the Tanzanian capital city of Dar es Salaam, where about a quarter of all recorded crimes in the country occur. Manzese ward is one of the most densely populated in the city authority of Kinondoni with a population of 1.2 million, a majority of whom are female. The area is a middle to low income area with informal settlements.

The case represents ‘the first time the municipality had worked so closely with women in a community to discuss matters affecting their livelihood and development of the area... [demonstrating] their ability to initiate necessary changes that will benefit everyone's safety (Mtani 2002: 1). The safety audit was primarily intended to play a role in finding

ways to enhance safety through planning and design and increase community awareness of the environment. According to figures quoted by Anna Mtani⁵ (2002:2) of the female victims of crime and abuse who were interviewed between April and May 2000, '79% had been economically abused, 76% emotionally abused, 71% physically abused while 45% of the women had been sexually abused.' This data clearly points to a systematic and widespread victimisation of women. The audit, coordinated and managed by UN-Habitat in Tanzania generated a list of observations and recommendations regarding the physical and the socio-economic environment, designed to help planners and designers begin to strategise interventions to help reduce these numbers.

The audit revealed the following observations:

- *Streets* – widening them to allow for easier vehicular circulation
- *Unfinished and abandoned buildings* – refurbishing buildings that have become criminal hideouts
- *Street lighting* – to improve visibility
- *Building densities* – increasing the spaces between houses for more allotments and open space for 'children's playgrounds and other community activities' which currently cannot be catered for
- *Sanitation* – improving drainage channels, sewer systems, pit latrines
- *Open space* – the lack of well designed public open space that is secure and useful
- Some of the observations also made a clear link between *rampant alcohol abuse*, high levels of unemployment, with increasing *domestic violence against women* in the area (Mtani 2002).

UN-Habitat then called a group of women from Manzese together to discuss the observations and initial suggestions and recommendations around: accessibility and visibility, elimination or destroying hideouts of potential criminals, lack of lighting, safe places, health, socio-economic problems and security groups.

The recommendations were then tabled and presented to a range of urban development professionals working in the Dar es Salaam municipality including town planners, environmentalists, engineers and economic planners. It was during this meeting between women of Manzese, the Safer Cities Project and the city municipality that a resolution to repeat the safety audit was taken (Mtani 2002). Consequently, 'after agreeing on the date and time, the two groups (the women and Safer Cities) were organised for a day walk into Mnazi Mmoja and Midizini with the municipal staff. The women, guiding the walking, had the opportunity to show and explain the experiences of crime in the area to the municipal staff as associated to both the environmental and social economic problems of the area' (Mtani 2002: 8). The safety audit, driven by an international agency, received active support and buy-in from local-level institutions in the form of the Dar es Salaam municipality. In this way, agencies like Safer Cities constructively use local leadership in decision making at the grassroots level whose recommendations have, in turn, been built into national policies of good governance, responsive physical planning and appropriate urban development.

⁵ Anna Mtani is the Coordinator of the Safer Cities: Dar es Salaam project.

The project ‘suggests how women can be involved in improving drainage, building improvements, lighting, and street signage, as a way of reducing unemployment and alcohol use as well as physical violence on the street and in homes’ (Whitzman 2007a: 2725). It also shows how women’s recommendations for creating safer cities for women can translate into an improved quality of life for city residents in general - the positive ripple-effect of gender targeted planning.

The inputs and recommendations meant that women in Manzese were given a tangible platform from which to formulate context appropriate design interventions. The recommendations that the group generated as a result of the audit ranged from improving the accessibility and visibility of certain areas like narrow, blocked off and unlit streets; the identification and destruction of criminal hideouts; the start of a local, household-driven campaign to provide Manzese with better lighting; improvements to basic health infrastructure; and improved relations with the city safety and security bodies, like the police and community security groups – the *sungusungu* (Mtani 2002). Whether these suggested improvements were implemented and if they actively contribute to reducing levels of abuse against women is however unclear.

The Dar es Salaam case study also illustrates how methodologies for gendered safety audits which began in developed Commonwealth countries like Canada over two decades ago are being adapted and adjusted in other, very different contexts. In so doing, planners are finding creative and constructive ways to incorporate issues like physical infrastructure enhancement, and ‘private’ issues like domestic violence and alcoholism in designing for safer cities.

While the Tanzanian Safer Cities experience has much practical value – suggesting tangible ways in which planners could make cities safer for women - the main objective of the Safer Nairobi Project is ‘to reduce the level of crime and causes of crime in the city of Nairobi through a multi-sectoral and partnership crime prevention strategy’ (Kamau 2002: 2). As a result, Nairobi’s lessons are especially relevant for those who manage the process and formulate the plans and policies of gendered urban space.

Box 7: Managing and Strategising the Processes of Physical Planning: The UN Safer Cities Project: Urban Assessment Walk – Nairobi, Kenya

Home to 3 million people and one of the largest informal settlements in the world – Kibera – Nairobi is the capital city of one the economic powerhouses of East Africa, but also a place where many women face significant levels of victimisation and violence.

In order to get a clearer picture of the nature of violence against women and its spatial distribution, an international NGO called the Intermediate Technology Development Group (ITDG) in conjunction with UN-HABITAT, carried out a citywide crime

victimisation survey in two parts: Firstly, a scan survey interviewing 7954 people was conducted. Out of this sample, 1210 women detailed their experiences and views on gender based violence. Secondly, as a result of the scan survey 200 female victims were interviewed further and additionally a qualitative survey on youth offenders was also conducted 'to supplement the findings of the main victimisation survey' (Kamau 2002: 3). The findings of the survey were presented at the 1st World Urban Forum in 2002, and like the Tanzanian case, the data established widespread and high levels of economic, social and sexual abuse (Kamau 2002; Smaoun 2002).

According to Kamau (2002: 4) the objectives of the survey were to investigate and obtain data on:

- 1) the various forms of abuse suffered by women;
- 2) the socio-economic characteristics of the abuser;
- 3) impacts of the abuse on the victims;
- 4) the types of services and assistance offered to victims;
- 5) suggestions on the way forward.

Of the 200 women that were surveyed in depth: 60% of the women interviewed had experienced serious physical abuse, with 73% of the same sample saying that the violence occurred in the presence of other people, even children. Furthermore, more than half of the sample said they were victims of emotional abuse and that 1 in every 7 women had their mobility severely curbed and controlled by their male partners. More than 30% of women had been the victims of sexual abuse over the previous year, and 25% of all rape cases reported were gang rapes, with 1 in 12 survivors contracting HIV (Kamau 2002).

The Nairobi council, along with the UN Safer Cities and ITDT-East Africa were interested in preparing and executing a crime prevention strategy. The strategy employed a two-pronged approach – with the development of a 6-month, medium term plan and a longer term over a 3-year period. The Nairobi Safety Assessment Walk, carried out in March 2002 was 'planned to help design a more elaborate questionnaire for the development of future audits... It was also envisaged to kick-start the development of a women's safety audit tool kit, which will be implemented citywide...' (Kamau 2002: 7). This was done as part of the medium term strategy, and was intended to then form a basis for targeted interventions around Nairobi at a later stage, that would then begin to find physical, economic and technological solutions to violence against women.

The first stage in the design of the Walk involved mapping out the area to be covered within Nairobi's CBD, including main roads, narrow pathways and alleys. Each group (including the police, city council officials, members of the business community and women's organisations) was guided by the map and a set of guiding questions, with technical assistance being provided by UN-Habitat and the IGDT. The second stage involved a discussion of experiences of the city and meeting sessions designed to develop recommendations for, and resolutions to, crime and insecurity. The findings of the Walk related to four broad areas – lighting and visibility, physical design and maintenance, population concentration as well as social and economic activities (Kamau 2002).

The findings of the Walk and subsequent focus groups and workshops held to discuss the observations made related to lighting and visibility, physical design and infrastructure maintenance, population dynamics and concentration as well as social and economic activity. Some of the recommendations drawn out from these discussions included the following with a view to taking on issues of safety and security in a much more gender focused way:

- better enforcement of council by-laws and building codes;
- incorporating participatory approaches to settlement design;
- the promotion of women's entrepreneurial activities;
- strengthening institutional capacity;
- using social capital more appropriately and better;
- understanding the logistical implications of proactive management.

There were challenges that the partnership faced, especially during second stage of the Walk. It highlighted the impact of conflicts around land and land use, for instance, where men who often controlled the rights to land, resisted the implementation of recommendations that would compromise this control. Some of the conflicts arose not because of gender differences, but as a result of ethnic / tribal affiliation. The project also had to convince communities of its relevance as participation in urban design and planning processes were not a priority to women concerned with the business of meeting their basic needs. Also, it was not clear whether groups of women with special needs – like the visually and physically impaired – had their views adequately represented in the Assessment process.

Nevertheless, despite some of these problems, UN Safer Cities Nairobi found that safety audits were a constructive tool to target gendered urban planning interventions. Following the initial success of the project, the audits were then implemented at a city-wide level in June 2002.

The project shows that victimisation surveys add value to the planning process as they help inform and clearly illustrate to policy makers and city residents the 'overall levels and types of crime, their incidence, the perceptions of crime and the suggestions to make cities safer places to live and work in,' (Kamau 2002: 16). This further reinforces the pivotal role that good research and research methodologies can play in formulating strategies for safety planning.

The work undertaken by the Safer Cities Campaign is important in several respects. Research has indicated that women's perceptions and experiences of crime, violence and insecurity are crucial in designing effective urban planning, urban management and crime prevention policies and strategies. Because women are more vulnerable to violence and suffer more from feelings of insecurity, they are more sensitive towards those aspects of the built environment and of urban design that contribute to opportunities for crime and to fear of crime and violence. As such, it is critical to take account of women's view,

experiences and perceptions in city policies. Safety walks further are important in filling in gaps in existing data that are not taken into account in city policies. Although urban design and planning in themselves do not result in violence against women, they result in an environment that enhances or reduces opportunities for crimes to occur, and which affects perceptions and experience of safety (Kamau 2002, 12-13).

It is also critical to develop action plans and strategies that are issue and sector specific (Smaoun 2000; Whitzman 2007a), and to target interventions that deal with violence against women in and outside the home, taking into account the particular cultural and religious experiences and identities of women in that context / location (Ruddick 1996; McDowell 1997; Phadke 2005). However, there is a danger that safety audits could face obstacles in implementation like poor timing and phasing, unforeseen gender bias and even possible derailment of the process by interest groups. Still, practitioners attest to the audit's ability to capture the 'particularities of place' (Pain 2001) and its latent power to shift the perception of urban space in the mind of the layperson.

2.7. Housing

A large body of literature argues that women-headed households face particular constraints in accessing housing due to their lower incomes and irregular work. However, gender issues in housing go beyond access and many studies emphasise the importance of women's rights to secure tenure, and ensuring their direct access to housing and land. Without this, women are vulnerable to eviction by errant partners or by relatives after the death of a spouse. It is feared that male ownership of housing extends men's control within the household, and limits women's ability to benefit from capital appreciation on the land (Moser, 1987). The case of Cato Manor in Durban, South Africa (discussed below in Box 9) provides an example of good practice in relation to ownership of housing.

The design of housing is another area of criticism, with the argument that the standard detached unit produced by house building companies in many Commonwealth countries presumes a nuclear family, and does not cater to the needs of various groups of women and men, such as the aged and young women, or to extended households (see various studies in Dandekar, 1992), let alone the needs of home-workers, many of whom are women. Similarly, housing subsidy systems frequently assume a nuclear household, and do not easily support other forms of household, especially those dependent on informal and irregular income streams.

There are several examples in best practices databases of women organizing to provide housing for themselves, sometimes in partnership with the public and/or private sectors. Box 8 provides a Ugandan example in Jinja, the second largest city of Uganda.

Box 8. *Land and Housing: Jinja, Uganda*⁶

A group of women petty traders living in the slums of Mpumudde, Jinja, Uganda's second largest city, organised themselves to develop housing in partnership actors in the public and private sector. The women, who were mainly single parents, were living in crowded conditions in poorly built rental housing, without basic water and sanitation, or recreational facilities for children. They were concerned about the impact of these conditions on their children, and on its cost.

They organised themselves into a savings and credits society, the Mpumudde Low Income Women Group, with the intention of building their own houses on secure land with adequate services, expanding businesses and paying school fees. They met weekly to establish their priorities, to discuss their major projects and to act upon them. The group linked to the UN-Habitat, which had developed a strategy which allowed women entrepreneurs to access money to expand their businesses in order to raise money to build houses, UN-Habitat's Gender Mainstreaming Unit and the German Government sponsored the construction of houses which were mortgaged to the women entrepreneurs. Akright, a private company with a social responsibility mission assisted in the mobilisation of technical resources and building materials, and trained beneficiaries in elementary masonry work and business skills, construction of houses, and landscaping around the estate. The Jinja Municipal Council and the National Housing Ministry provided land and the Municipality undertook physical planning and land titling. Beneficiaries provided 'sweat equity'. The project was in effect a private-public-community partnership and was managed by a steering committee comprising these various parties.

Some 20 units had been built and occupied by beneficiaries by 2006. Houses are made of permanent materials and have septic tanks. Homes are accessible by a motorable road, and are located in a clean and green environment, which is well kept. Each house has a Neem tree, with medicinal properties, two fruit trees and vegetable gardens. Vegetation serves to mark the property and provide privacy. The houses have increased women's self-esteem, and are used as collateral for loans for business expansion. There is little concern about defaulting on loans since houses are high quality but affordable, and there is a group guarantee system.

The project is seen as a success by all parties, and is used as a model or point of reference for other projects, and has attracted delegations from neighbouring towns, districts and countries. The Jinja Municipal Council has also developed a policy to support any women's group intending to build an organised estate, which will be done if there are sufficient funds and the beneficiaries are prepared to contribute sweat equity.

⁶ Source: UN-Habitat, Best Practices Database, 2006.

2.8. Integrated Area Development and Economic Development

Settlement planning was for many years treated as a technical exercise, with little attention being paid to local social and economic factors. However, examples of infrastructure development having negative social impacts and of failing to reach the poor (Mendenez 1991) led to greater attention being paid to targeted approaches, with poverty being addressed through the delivery of affordable housing, infrastructure and services. Closely linked to this was increased emphasis on participation in programme planning and implementation, which in turn gave rise to demand-led strategies. These saw preference for integrated urban development programmes that included social and economic initiatives alongside the development of infrastructure and services. The case of Thatta, Pakistan, discussed in Box 4 above, provides an example of this sort.

An integrated approach is now common. This approach is favoured in the feminist housing and planning literature, which has long recognised the importance of creating ‘whole’ environments for women, while acknowledgement of women’s disadvantaged position in the labour market has lent support to a focus on including economic and social projects.

Urban regeneration, which generally involves a multi-sectoral approach, including both economic and social projects as well as physical interventions is another area where feminists promoted a gender aware approach (Oxfam n.d.; Rodriguez n.d.). Good practice guidelines have for example been developed in the UK (Oxfam 2008), and include good practice examples (e.g. from Govan, Glasgow). Beall and Todes (2004) argue that these complex, multi-sectoral projects offer potentials to address a range of women’s disadvantages, and their intersections, although this is by no means automatic (Brownill 2003).

Box 9 provides a good practice example of an area-based initiative from the South African context, which involved a multi-sectoral approach including a range of social and economic interventions, as well as physical developments. The case of Cato Manor, included several good practices, even though the project as a whole did not specifically include attention to gender.

Box 9. *Multi-Sectoral, Area Based Urban Development: The Cato Manor Development Project – Durban, South Africa*⁷

The Cato Manor Development Project (CMDP) was a large, multi-sectoral, area-based urban development programme which ran from 1993 to 2003 in Durban, South Africa’s second largest metropolitan area. The project sought to develop an area some seven kilometres from the city centre, which had been a site of forced removals under apartheid. The area included a substantial informal settlement which grew in the early 1990s, and

⁷ This case study draws on research previously done by one of the authors with Jo Beall and Heather Maxwell. Full reports are available in Beall et al (2002), and shorter papers in Beall et al (2004); Beall and Todes (2004).

attracted migrants from rural areas and other parts of the city. Some 45% of households were headed by women. It was also an area with high levels of crime and sexual violence. The project received substantial funding from the European Union, as well as from various national and local sources. It was a Presidential lead project, intended to restructure the city towards a more compact and integrated form, and to enable the urban poor to access well located land. The goals of the CMDP were to provide housing, infrastructure, services and access to jobs for the poor.

The CMDP did not explicitly focus on issues of gender equality, however a large proportion of the beneficiaries were women, and the area included a grouping of very powerful women who were influential in the way the project developed. The CMDP worked closely with local communities, and developed a good understanding of local social dynamics. Since women were the stable base of the community and most active around development, they were the centre of many projects. In addition, the project staff included several staff from an NGO background who were aware of gender issues, including some feminists. Some of the good practices include the following:

A community safety programme was instituted which reduced levels of crime, although rates are still high, as they are in much of South Africa. Safety has also been an important consideration in spatial planning, layouts and local design of the area. For example, small neighbourhood parks and play spots, instead of a few large parks favoured by municipal departments, were developed in consultation with local reference groups, mainly women. These parks are overlooked by houses, and bushy areas were avoided, enabling children to play safely on their own. Safety was also an important criterion in the design of public facilities. For example, while planners initially thought that a pre-school overlooking a park would be a good design principle, input from the community development manager suggested that this would make children vulnerable to abuse by men who might for example expose themselves to them. Instead, the pre-school was turned away from the park, and access to the facility was secured.

Following national housing policy and its financial system, most housing was developed for private ownership, at no cost to owners. Housing allocations either matched or exceeded the proportion of women-headed households. In allocating titles, CMDP staff attempted to understand who the real functional head of household actually was, and who was responsible for children. The local woman councillor also tried to ensure that title deeds were in the name of women. Both attempted to avoid outcomes that would marginalise women and children. In interviews (Beall et al, 2003a) both planners and the councillor cited cases where women and children had been evicted from houses after the death of a male title deed owner, or where men had found new partners and had pushed out their previous wives. In one case, after a man died of AIDS his partner and children were thrown out by in-laws who claimed that the house was left to them. However the advice of CMDP staff and councillors was sometimes thwarted by women choosing to put the house in the name of men, or by men's insistence that houses be registered in their names.

The Shayamoya social housing project developed by the Built Environment Support

Group (BESG), directly targeted women. Some 45% of beneficiaries were intended to be women headed households, but in practice, some 62% were women-headed households in 2003. With the support of Rooftops, Canada, an innovative lease was drawn up, which gave rights to all members of the household at the time of sign up. The lease provided for children of deceased leaseholders to continue to live there, protecting their rights. Workshops were done around the lease agreement to ensure that there was understanding of their rights. These included role-playing various situations, such as wife abuse. All policy documents considered gender, and a male/female balance was required in all committees.

The local economic development policy included a range of interventions ranging from job placement, training, and small business support to the development of industrial and office parks and formal retail facilities. The overall focus of financial support towards the latter meant that women benefited less than they might have, nevertheless, they were strong participants in most projects aimed at the former. Some 60% of those benefiting from small business support services were women, as were 52% of those engaging in vocational training⁸. Women were the main focus of a tourism support project, and formed the majority of participants in urban agricultural projects.

Social projects aimed at homeownership education largely attracted women, who were drawn in through their savings clubs. Capacity building and leadership training were components of this project which included for example, discussions of inheritance options, and how they compared to traditional patterns of passing everything on to the eldest son. The cooperative programme which worked with savings clubs (mainly women) attempted to strengthen them and included a training programme with a strong focus on gender.

Hence the CMDP included several practices which promoted women's interests, although it did not specifically focus on gender. Feminists in the organisation however argued that more explicit attention to gender would have strengthened the project.

A basic point of departure in much of the literature is that women, and particularly women headed households, have lower incomes, and are likely to be over-represented in the poverty groups. These patterns have underpinned arguments for urban economic policies that improve the economic position of women. Interventions include:

- ensuring that women can get access to the jobs that are created, even where these are outside of traditional gender roles;
- ensuring that both men and women benefit from economic strategies;
- targeting areas of women's economic activity for growth and development;
- appropriate training;
- credit and savings schemes;
- accepting and providing for home based economic activity;

⁸ Some 92% of job placements were however for men, mainly since most placements occurred in the construction of the area, and these jobs were largely occupied by men.

- supporting and developing of women's small business and informal economic activities.
- Some authors also argue for wider assistance to ensure that women can take up economic opportunities, such as child care support (Little 1996).

Women generally form a significant part, if not the majority of informal traders, for example. Feminist advocates generally argue for accepting and managing these activities, rather than repressing them, which is still so common. Women are frequently involved in many marginal economic activities. Although these are significant in terms of women's survival, it is also important to ensure that women can access more lucrative economic opportunities that emerge through local economic development.

Box 9 above on Cato Manor provides some examples of these approaches, which are also evident in the case of Thatta in Box 4. Box 10 below on the Women's Development Federation in Manbantota, Sri Lanka, provides an example of a non-governmental organisation which has established itself to promote women's economic empowerment.

Box 10: *Micro Finance, Livelihoods and Development: The Women's Development Federation – Hambantota, Sri Lanka*⁹

The Women's Development Federation (WDF) is a Non-Governmental Organisation established in 1989 in the Hambantota district of Sri Lanka, one of the most deprived areas of the country, with limited job opportunities and economic activities. WDF was started by a few women in a very small and informal way with the objective of empowering the women socially and economically. The society has gradually developed into a large federation providing leadership to women throughout the district, and is the largest women's organisation in the country. It is now an internationally recognized institution receiving international assistance for specific projects.

The central focus of WDF is micro-finance following the Grameen bank model in which groups of rural women save through the 84 'Janashakthi' (People's Strength) Banking Societies, and can access loans for a variety of activities, such as income generating projects; housing, construction and improvements; and purchasing of consumables. Some 35,000 women are now members. This form of banking is more accessible, both physically and in terms of cost. WDF also provides support through skills and knowledge development and is financially self-sustaining. WDF builds local organisations, and draws them together into a strong network. Women's self esteem and their economic situation is improved through developing positive attitudes; mobilising them for self-employment; developing their entrepreneurial capabilities; increasing their income and savings; and assisting them to start new industries or to strengthen existing ones.

The organisation operates across a broad range of development areas, including:

- Helping to develop the livelihoods of women headed households and widows;
- Implementing training programmes on technological and entrepreneurial development

⁹ Information provided by the CAP Women in Planning Coordinator in Sri Lanka

related to livelihood activities such as agriculture, animal husbandry and small scale trade;

- Assisting and advising on the preparation of business plans;
- Provision of micro finance on easy terms;
- Provision of micro insurance schemes for deaths and diseases;
- Helping women to save through various savings schemes;
- Provision of services to rehabilitate Tsunami affected people;
- Conducting health and nutrition programmes;
- Organising programmes for mental health and the development of children's talents;
- Child development through establishment of children's societies;
- Providing scholarships for the education for orphans;
- Making society aware of human, women and child rights

The organisation has been highly successful and has enabled the accumulation of more than Rs. 200.0 million in savings, and has provided loans of over Rs. 1500.0 million, achieving a 99% recovery rate. It has also awarded compensation of Rs. 17 million to 8758 members in terms of its social security insurance scheme. It has conducted 25 training programmes on income generation projects for 752 members, and 33 training programmes on entrepreneurship development for 889 members. In addition, it has trained 3000 people linked to the Janashakthi societies. Training programs have also been conducted on assistance to elderly people and water management. Awareness programmes to mitigate drug and alcohol addiction and harassment of women have been presented. The WDF was active in tsunami relief, rehabilitating some 8 irrigation tanks, constructing 557 new toilets, granting scholarships to some 250 orphans, and helping to rehabilitate salt industries.

The organisation also plays roles in co-ordinating other institutions and projects:

- *Concerned World Wide* – livelihood development assistance.
- *World Bank* – micro financing for livelihood development, renovation of buildings, education assistance to children, construction of toilets.
- *Solidy House Foundation* – Development of the livelihood of widows.
- *Strom Foundation* – Micro financing, development of resource centres and training
- *World Women Bank* – Talent development and micro financing management training
- *Etmos Institute* – Talent development training programmes.

The organisation is widely recognised as the strongest women's organisation in Sri Lanka, and has contributed enormously to development in the region.

2.9. Conclusion

Considerable attention has thus been paid to understanding the gendered nature of urban development, and to generating approaches and methodologies to include gender in

planning. This section has highlighted several good practices from Commonwealth countries. These good practices provide a partial view of what is occurring: they reflect mainly well known projects that appear in best practices data bases, in the literature, in major campaigns, or ones that are known to CAP WiP gender co-ordinators. Within the bounds of these limitations, several points of analysis or conclusions can be made about these good practices.

Perhaps reflecting the way case studies are recorded, most are projects, specific to a particular locality or sector, rather than programmes. The Safer Cities case studies are examples of a broader programme, but are also city specific and issue focused interventions. There are few examples of effective mainstreaming across the breadth of local plans. The Plymouth case study provides the only example here, but even then was not implemented as political conditions changed. Nevertheless, the mainstreaming approach has led to a useful focus on deeper analysis of gendered conditions, which in turn has spawned several interesting methodologies. Checklists, audits and matrices have also been developed as useful tools to enable better understanding of local contexts and planning issues.

Although there are few examples of mainstreaming across municipalities, there are several good practice examples of integrated, multi-sectoral projects (eg. South Africa, Pakistan, Sri Lanka). Some were designed as multi-sectoral projects, which have been valuable for the promotion of gender equity, since they have allowed for various dimensions of women's lives to be addressed. In other cases, projects have moved from a narrow to a broader focus, addressing the multifaceted needs of its membership or constituency (eg. Sri Lanka). Several projects in addition have understood gender in a complex and multi-dimensional way. This is evident in the Safer Cities case studies, which, while focused on particular concerns, have used methodologies that allow for an understanding of the many ways in which gender, space and safety are linked, and which enable the development of broad ranging initiatives to address them. Importantly, as well, attention to gender here brings into focus broader social relations and conditions, and enhances planners' understanding of the context, and thus facilitates more appropriate responses to it.

Most projects discussed here are highly participatory and inclusive in style. Participatory approaches are generally extensive and open enough to allow for a real engagement with communities about needs and approaches. This leads to planning and development that fits local needs and engages with the complexity of local conditions, but the project approach arguably also facilitates this response. In several cases as well, the project serves to empower women in various ways, giving women voice, building confidence through participation, through skills development and economic development, and through enabling women to move beyond traditional roles. The Kerala case where participatory democracy was deliberately built over time, and where women specifically were empowered through targeting and capacity building is particularly notable.

Several of the projects examined are 'women's' projects (eg. Uganda, Sri Lanka). This may however reflect the way the case studies were collected and the fact that it is easy to

identify these projects as in some way linked to gender. Not all case studies are specifically focused on gender, but the importance of women as the centre of the community, with most interest in local development and planning has meant that projects relate strongly to them, such as in Cato Manor. Although there are limitations in the way projects of this sort are undertaken, and a stronger gender perspective could have strengthened them, they nevertheless do include good practices. In contexts where project staff are closely linked to communities and are open to gender issues, and where there are strong women's organisations to relate to project staff, the space for gender aware practice may be greater than is initially apparent, even where 'gender speak' is not evident.

Many projects also are initiated autonomously by women's groups, civil society organisations or NGOs, and the important role of these organisations in promoting gender aware planning and development needs to be noted. There are few examples of projects or processes initiated and sustained by governments or municipalities, although this may reflect the data source. The case of Kerala is different in that it was a government led process, but here, participatory democracy was built in partly to consolidate the power of an initially oppositional political party (Heller 2007). The Plymouth case was also a municipal led process, but unfortunately was not implemented once political power changed. In several cases however, multi-stakeholder partnerships have developed, including municipalities and possibly governments. Other partners include the private sector, agencies and government and international organisations. The role of international organisations, particularly the UN-Habitat and of donor agencies in promoting or assisting these projects is also critical in several cases. Some projects reflect campaigns in particular areas, such as the Safer Cities programme.

The case studies demonstrate the effectiveness of a multi-sectoral and multi-stakeholder approach in several instances, and the importance of clearly focused, issue based planning. They also show how a focus on gender can lead to improved quality of life for city residents more generally. The participatory approach adopted, attention to differentiated experience, and the focus on everyday life all help to make planning more responsive to people's lived needs and experiences (Smaoun 2000; Staeheli 2003, World Bank 2006).

3. Assessing Guideline Implementation

Most international organisations focused on human settlement planning now accept the idea of gender mainstreaming, and several have produced guidelines to facilitate it as the previous sections showed. In some areas, such as water and transportation, campaigns have developed to respond to the neglect of gender in practice, including disjunctures between policy at international and national level and practice on the ground (World Bank 2003; GWA 2003).

Internationally, gender advocates are using the influence of aid agencies to exercise their ability to hold planning processes to account. Through funding conditionalities and support programmes, these organisations can heighten the profile of gender in development processes. The Paris Declaration (2004) saw the introduction of a changed development aid paradigm in which gender equality was emphasised along with partnerships, local ownership and accountability. In 2007, UNIFEM commenced a series of regional consultations to build knowledge, capacity and partnerships to include a gender perspective in aid agendas and monitor results. Similarly, a joint initiative by the European Commission and the UN, the Partnership for Gender Equality in Development and Peace, aims to strengthen investment and implementation of gender equality commitments in national budgets and in national development strategies.

The growing attention to gender occurs in a context of continuing economic marginalisation of women (AFP, 2007). Globalisation and liberalisation have had contradictory effects for women: while they have been drawn more strongly into the labour force in some areas, patterns are uneven across countries (Meyer 2006). Many of the areas of employment growth for women are poorly paid and offer bad working conditions, such as clothing and textiles. Across the world, women own less than 3% of land and have limited access to productive resources (APF 2007). In Africa, where 16 Commonwealth countries along with Zimbabwe are located, the gender gap is worsening, despite the rise in women's participation in economic activity. The main growth here has been within the informal sector, but there is little support for this economic activity (APF 2007), and street trading is often actively suppressed (Skinner 2008a). The African Union's 2003 Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa commits governments to economic rights for women, including, inter alia, rights to equal pay for equal work; rights to access land and other productive resources; inheritance of equitable shares of property; sharing of joint property in divorce or separation; protection and social insurance for women in the informal sector. The protocol is reflected in a bill of rights, but also requires states to allocate resources to give them effect. A 2007 review however showed that less than half had done so (APF 2007). Access to land remains a significant problem for women (APF 2007), as it does in many other parts of the world, including in Commonwealth countries like Vanuatu, Kenya, Swaziland, India and Tanzania, for instance (Wakeley and You 2002).

Within the broad field of governance and development, there are some assessments of the extent to which the recommendations of gender advocates are being taken up in practice, including on women's representation and decentralisation to local government (see e.g. Hickey and Mohan, 2004; Beall, 2006; UNRISD, 2006; and studies funded by the International Development Research Centre). There is however no comprehensive assessment of the extent to which gender is considered within human settlement planning. Rather, the assessments that do exist are either focused on particular case studies or countries, or on particular sectors, such as transport (Turner, 2003) and water (e.g. GWA's study of 17 African cities).

The discussion below thus provides some examples of the extent to which guidelines are being implemented on the ground. There are some positive examples of growing

dissemination but the overall impression, and the main finding that emerges from several studies is that while gender and the idea of gender mainstreaming are accepted in policy terms, there is often an implementation gap. It suggests that although there are clear ideas about what should be done and some good practices, these may be relatively isolated. Nevertheless, it is also possible that there are many undocumented good practices at a project level as a consequence of the permeation of gender discourses, the interest showed by women in projects, and/or because project managers pay attention to women as the stable base of the community in certain contexts. The discussion below centres on studies examining the extent to which gender is being mainstreamed in strategic planning, the more practical experience with street trading, and the more positive experience of the Safer Cities campaign.

3.1. Strategic Planning

Gender advocates have worked hard in making a case for gender and development, developing and implementing training programmes, developing frameworks, planning tools and checklists for the integration of gender equality concerns in development, unpacking organisational development and change from a gender perspective (Mukhopadhyay 2003). However, the successful implementation of gender mainstreaming largely depends on the institutional mechanisms for promoting gender equality and on the people involved at all levels. Their commitment, gender knowledge and competence, the gender mainstreaming tools at their disposal, and the resources and support they have to enable them to carry out the policy imperatives of gender mainstreaming meaningfully, are all necessary elements (Cole et al. nd).

Yet, it is apparent that gender mainstreaming has not yet achieved its anticipated outcomes of gender equality. There appears to be a deep gulf between policy and practice, a situation that has been referred to as ‘policy evaporation’ (Khan 2003). The five-year review of progress in implementing the Beijing Platform for Action showed that the path of progress had been bumpy at best. Although there are positive and practical examples in almost every country of actions taken that have improved women’s status, ‘significant challenges remain’. Most development institutions have to be constantly reminded of the need for gender analysis in their work, policy makers have to be lobbied to include gender concerns, and [development practitioners] need convincing that integrating a gender analysis in their work makes a qualitative difference (Mukhopadhyay 2003). Policy evaporation is frequent: despite policy statements and mechanisms dedicated to gender equality, implementation demonstrates poor commitment, and where competing priorities are present, gender issues are lost altogether (Khan 2003). Reeves (2002) identifies three distinct types of responses: ‘strategic filter’ which regards gender as too detailed for inclusion in the strategic plan; ‘implicit factor’ or gender-neutral approach in which women are deemed to be covered by all policies; and ‘unidentified priorities’ where such issues were not raised in the consultation process.

There have been several recent studies that have focused upon the way in which gender issues have been treated in strategic planning initiatives in the UK and Sweden (Reeves 2002, Greed 2006b, Larsson 2006). Investigations in the UK have sought to examine the extent to which strategic planning in the UK complies with the European and national gender and equality requirements. Greed (2006b) notes that gender mainstreaming is being undertaken within regional strategies and development activities, but these are more concerned with economic, rather than physical land-use planning. The reason for this is that EU-funded regional projects require 'gender proofing' as part of structural funding conditionality. However, this usually takes the form of a superficial 'tick-box' process to demonstrate a basic level of compliance. Reeves' survey in 1998 shows that local authorities have a poor record of gender mainstreaming, and very few of them are systematically including a gender perspective in their strategic planning processes. It appears that a framework exists for gender mainstreaming in a number of authorities (e.g., 34% stated that someone in the organisation would be able to undertake a gender audit, gender appraisal or gender impact analysis of the strategic policies) and some attempts at gender responsiveness had been made (just over a quarter stated that gender issues have been incorporated into their strategic plans and policies. 21% stated that there had been outcomes for women in respect of strategic policies, projects or processes. 4% considered the outcome to be significant). However, very few of the authorities systematically collect and analyse statistics or other forms of knowledge that have been gender disaggregated. In 52%, between 1-2% of the respondents to structure plan consultations were women's groups, and in the remaining 48%, women's groups were not involved in the responses at all. Greed (2006b) concludes that this demonstrates that awareness of overall equality issues does not seem to translate into actual knowledge and understanding, as there is limited capacity of strategic planning authorities to seriously consider gender as an issue.

The difficulties in implementing gender mainstreaming are complex and include several factors.

First, the broader political environment is often not conducive to promoting gender equality, and the necessary political will is either variable or absent. This has translated into a lack of overall support in the form of funding, advice and clear requirements from government to facilitate gender mainstreaming efforts. Greed (2006b) argues that there is limited central government policy support or legal mandate to mainstream gender within the statutory planning system in Britain. Due to its conceptual broadness, there has been some confusion about what gender mainstreaming entails and national policy guidelines can be presented in an ambiguous and equivocal manner. As a result, planners have expressed uncertainty as to how 'gender' should be incorporated into strategic planning processes.

Secondly, many planners lack sufficient understanding about gender issues in general. Reeves' survey (2002) reveals that in the development control sections of planning departments, some planners appeared to be under the impression that gender considerations had no bearing on their work as they believed their decisions were determined by purely technical constraints. Some planners responsible for forward policy

making imagined that ‘women’ had already been ‘done’ ...and that ‘gender’ was no longer of any relevance. Others were under the impression that there is no longer any need to ‘do women separately’ as ‘gender’ is now dealt with under generic mainstreaming programmes by other departments, and so it was not their concern. Greed (2006b) adds that in planning departments where ‘gender’ is given some consideration and a ‘difference’ between the needs of women and men is acknowledged, policy makers are, nevertheless, likely to base their assumptions about ‘what women want’ upon outdated stereotypes of women as housewives. It may appear that the attitude of planners – ‘a resistance to looking at planning in a different way’ (Greed, 2006b) - presents yet a more deeply entrenched obstacle.

Thirdly, it is often unclear where the responsibility lies for gender mainstreaming, who is held accountable for its implementation, and how its progress is managed and measured. As a cross-cutting issue, it is everyone’s responsibility, but this has often resulted in nobody assuming responsibility for gender mainstreaming, and its implementation being almost entirely left to dedicated staff or social development departments. As a cross-cutting theme, gender has been regarded as ‘another bureaucratic burden’ (op. cit.) by many planners, who have given it only cursory attention.

Fourthly, gender has been increasingly subsumed under a more generic approach to planning for equality or diversity, which has further weakened its claims. Rahder and Altilia (2004) argue that feminist perspectives appear to be dissolving amidst a broader focus on diversity and multiculturalism. Greed (2006b) similarly argues that a generic equalities approach to mainstreaming has resulted in gender considerations receiving limited attention. This generic approach has also been interpreted to mean no further support for women-exclusive programmes, and in Britain many women’s units and women’s committees have been closed as it was assumed that they were no longer required.

And finally the experience of gender mainstreaming has shown that usually its transformative goals have been diluted as attention has been focused on managerialist concerns of organisational planning, technical processes and administrative structures. There has been little evidence that these initiatives have adopted a more critical approach to challenge the unequal gender relations present in development processes and organisational culture and to create opportunities to explore alternatives. Mukhopadhyay (2003) argues that the political project of equality is being normalised in the development business as an ahistorical, apolitical, de-contextualised, and technical project that leaves the prevailing and unequal power relations intact. Strategic planning by its very nature is a rational and technocratic approach that tends to overlook or conceal the value-laden and political nature of planning.

3.5. Street Trading

In most countries, women are the majority of informal street traders or a substantial minority, and are generally in the least profitable sectors. Planning regulation plays an

important role in the survival or marginalisation of these activities, hence its acceptance and appropriate management is of critical importance to large groups of poor women.

WIEGO's reviews of street trading in Africa, Asia and Latin America (Skinner 2008a; Bhowmink 2005; Roever 2006) show that while informal trade has grown considerably in these regions, largely as a consequence of economic stress, there are very few countries where street trading is recognised, accepted and appropriately managed. In many countries, there is active suppression. Alternatively, a level of street trading is accepted, but the number of traders who are registered and accepted is far lower than the actual number of traders. Frequently, street traders are relocated to markets, which may offer better facilities and conditions (water, sanitation, waste removal), but are often not well located, undermining incomes. There are some exceptions. In the Commonwealth these include, for example:

- Singapore's licensing of all street traders (the only country in the world to do so), and provision of training, clear areas for trading and food markets where basic stall facilities and services such as water, electricity and garbage collection are available (Bhowmink 2005);
- While street vendors in India are often harassed, some planners have shown that informal traders near housing complexes help to reduce congestion, pollution and transport costs since shopping is literally on their doorstep (Bhowmink 2005)
- Accommodation of informal trade in Dar es Salaam in the context of the Sustainable Dar es Salaam Project, where traders were accepted, shelving was provided for goods, and health and cleaning issues were addressed. Nevertheless, implementation is not consistent, and women are often excluded from more lucrative areas (Skinner 2008a; Nnkya 2006)
- The Warwick Avenue Triangle project in Durban, South Africa, where an area based management project enabled a participatory and inclusive approach to the design of space to accommodate informal trade around this important transport interchange, and its ongoing management. Some 60% of traders here are women, and the project worked closely with the Self Employed Women's Union (SEWU), an international organisation of women street traders, with a branch in Durban. Infrastructure was developed for traders, and cleaning, ablution facilities and child care facilities were provided (Skinner 2008a). Temporary housing was also developed to respond to safety problems for migrant women who often sleep on the street, but it has proved to be too expensive, and the provision of much cheaper accommodation is being considered (Skinner 2008b).

Although there are some good practices with regard to informal trade, these are not necessarily long-lasting, and both the Dar es Salaam and Durban cases are moving away from some of these more positive practices. Skinner (2008a: 12) cites a coordinator of an international alliance of street trading organisations with substantial experience in urban policy and street trading as saying:

'There are no policy best practices with street trading. Where there have been windows where better practices emerge, there tends to be a continuity problem. There is a change in the bureaucracy, a big event or an election and the approach changes...With street trading things are particularly fluid.'

3.3. Safer Cities

The UN Safer Cities programme has begun to internationalise the issue of gender and safety – operating in 22 cities around the world, from Dar es Salaam, Port Moresby to Toronto.

The first phase of the programme was primarily focused on ‘initiating partnership delivery’ and putting in place the institutions and support mechanisms that would help to establish and extend UN-Habitat’s strategies for creating safer cities. In effect, this phase has laid the institutional, policy and logistical ground work that would entrench the Programme – through public private partnerships and the delivery of key outputs i.e. surveys, city structure assessments and so on. The second phase, to run from 2009 to 2013, will then ‘develop yearly work-plans in consultation with partners’ that will ostensibly implement recommendations made during the first phase of the programme (UN-Habitat 2007: 11).

The UN Safer Cities programme is an important initiative that recognises the need to make cities safer for women. In contrast to the common focus on developing frameworks and guidelines at national level and attempting to translate them into practice, the focus here is on specific projects at city level. This approach has the advantage of concentrating specifically on action on the ground, but it is unclear whether the approaches developed are being implemented more broadly, and whether they are the subject of national debate and initiative.

4. Conclusion

There has been considerable attention to gender equality within international organisations and within the Commonwealth. Many national governments as well have accepted this agenda and have national policies on gender. There is a recognition of the importance of engendering governance and planning at policy level, but often this is not effectively translated into gender aware practice. While there are some good practices, they may well be relatively isolated. These limitations may however be the result of a process in motion: in response to the implementation gap, several new guidelines have been developed in recent years (eg. GWA 2006; UN-Habitat 2008a; Reeves 2003, 2007; World Bank 2006). In addition, it is likely to take time for governments to move from broad policies to implementation. This suggests that governments need to pay attention to both policy and implementation - to promoting gender awareness in policy and also to ensuring that such policies are carried forward into practice.

In many instances, governments have interpreted gender-sensitive governance narrowly as ‘representation of women’, and have set gender equity targets of between 30-50%. As a result, the proportion of women has increased in political and administrative positions within state institutions, although parity with men remains elusive. The representation of

women within the planning profession also appears to be rising, and while this is important in its own right, it cannot be assumed that women carry forward a feminist agenda. The use of targets in terms of representation of women in projects is also a narrow way of encouraging gender equality, but it does help to ensure that women are benefiting from development projects, at least if appropriate checks are carried out.

Translating gender-responsive governance intentions into reality beyond this requires greater political commitment and investment in building systems of participatory democracy. From the evidence available, successful processes give particular attention to increasing local involvement in decision-making and resource allocation, as well as specifically targeting and empowering the capacity of women to become actively involved. In addition, the role of civil society organisations operating at local and global scales is critical. Gender advocates in these organizations have a key role to play to ensure that gender remains on the agendas of governments, and to continually exert pressure and offer alternatives to challenge dominant gender-blind approaches.

Planning is undergoing a revival in light of the massive global urbanisation trends. It is seen as playing a key role in enabling sustainable urbanisation, and in managing urban development. Planning today has a developmental agenda and a focus on inclusiveness, including the promotion of gender equity. It ought to be an important arena in which gender aware approaches can be promoted. Governments in the Commonwealth should give consideration to how these concerns can be taken through the planning system.

Gender mainstreaming was introduced by gender advocates to ensure that the goals of gender equality were implemented by the institutions who had agreed in principle to them. The guides and toolkits provided considerable information as to how gender mainstreaming could be undertaken in government contexts, and in planning processes in particular. Gender mainstreaming (proofing, auditing) provides an excellent way in which to demonstrate the gendered implications of every aspect of planning in the urban context. By adopting a gender perspective, the issues of different groups of men and women can be identified, and planning can become far more responsive to actual needs and circumstances. Although there is a growing recognition of a diversity of forms of inequality, it seems important to continue to focus specifically on gender within planning and development, but recognising the way in which gender intersects with other forms of inequality.

Mainstreaming gender however is an ambitious and difficult project. In this context, combining initiatives to mainstream with more focused and strategic approaches and projects may be useful in demonstrating the practical benefits of a gender aware approach. The success of the Safer Cities programme is raised in this context. It may be helpful to focus on a few key campaigns of importance to women, such as around women's rights to the city, and the role of planning and participatory processes in helping to deliver them: basic services, mobility, access, acceptance of informality and safety, for example. The links between gender, planning and responding to the HIV/AIDS epidemic will also be critical in many Commonwealth countries.

Although project approaches are limited in their impact, the case studies cited here show many innovative approaches, some of which have sparked off a range of other initiatives of importance to gender aware planning. Most are highly participatory and inclusive of women. Several of these projects understand gender in complex and nuanced ways. Some are multi-sectoral and address a range of interlinked needs. Many draw together a range of organisations and interests. These projects also show the value of a gender analysis and a gender aware approach for planning and development, and for improving quality of life in general.

5. Future Directions

Few of the projects collected for the purposes of this research focus specifically on spatial planning, and it is not clear to what extent there have been initiatives to implement the broad guidelines which are available, and what their impact has been. The UK (and to some extent, Canada) is an exception in this regard. It would be helpful to begin a process of documenting good practice more extensively within the broad field of human settlement development and particularly spatial planning. In addition, as this paper has shown, the plethora of guidelines and national policy commitments on gender seem to mask the limited extent of their implementation. There is little systematic research on the extent to which gender guidelines are being implemented. Where there are specific champions or programmes, there is some research, such as the Gender and Water Alliance; the World Bank's Transport Group; WIEGO's work on the informal economy; the UN-Habitat's Safer Cities Programme; and the International Development and Research Centre (IDRC)'s research programme on gender and decentralisation. Outside of these areas however, and particularly in the field of spatial planning, there is a dearth of research. It would be helpful to examine what is occurring in practice, the extent to which guiding principles are being used, what the limits to implementation are, and the outcomes of gendered planning practice.

Beyond this kind of research, it is important to encourage Commonwealth governments and local governments to pay attention to gender within planning at both a policy level and in implementation processes. They could draw on the many guideline documents that are available, although there may be a case for developing more specific and contextually appropriate guidelines on spatial planning. These initiatives may need to be supplemented by training programmes around gender and planning, and by greater attention to these issues within planning education. Improvements in practice however are likely to depend on more evident commitment to these issues on the part of governments, and their willingness to engage with civil society organisations focused on gender issues. While a mainstreaming approach is desirable, it may be strategically important to begin with key campaigns of local importance, such as around aspects of women's rights to the city. These campaigns could link with a range of organisations focused on gender issues, and could also demonstrate the practical benefits of a gender aware approach.

Acknowledgements

This research was funded through a grant from the Commonwealth Foundation. An earlier version of this paper was presented at the Gender Roundtable at the World Urban Forum, Nanjing, November 2008. The authors wish to acknowledge the support of CAP and the incisive comments on an earlier version of this paper by members of the secretariat of CAP and CAP WiP: Alicia Yon, Professor Cliff Hague and Christine Platt. Thanks are also due to Alicia Yon for her efforts to access case studies through the CAP WiP network, and to CAP WiP members who sent material. The paper was enriched by the many papers and suggestions sent by Professor Clara Greed and by discussion with Professor Dory Reeves, and her comments on the document.

References

Asian Development Bank (ADB) (2000). Asian Development Bank Gender Check-list on Urban Development and Housing, Asian Development Bank.

Africa Partnership Forum (APF) (2007) Gender and Economic Empowerment in Africa, Paper presented at the meeting of the African Partnership Forum, Berlin.

Andrew, C., Gurstein, P., Klodawssky, F, Moore Milroy, B., McClain, J., Rose, L.P. and Wekerie, G. (1994) Canadian Women and Cities, Paper for Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation, April.

Asiyanbola, R.A. (2007) Intra-Urban Transportation, Gender and Psychological Distress in Developing Countries: Nigeria, Paper presented to the PRIPODE Workshop on Urban Population, Development and Environment Dynamics in Developing Countries, 11 – 13 June.

Beall, J (2001) Doing Gender from Top to Bottom? The South African Case. In *Women: A Cultural Review*, 12 (2), 135-146.

Beall, J (1998) The Gender and Poverty Nexus in the DFID White Paper: Opportunity or Constraint? *Journal of International Development*, 10, 235-246.

Beall, J (1997a) Introduction. In J Beall (ed) *A City for All: Valuing Difference and Working with Diversity*, London: Zed Books, 2-37.

Beall, J (1997b) Participation in the City: A Gender Perspective. In J Beall (ed) *A City for All: Valuing Difference and Working with Diversity*, London: Zed Books, 38-48.

Beall, J (1996) *Urban Governance: Why Gender Matters*, Gender in Development Monograph Series No 1, New York: United Nations Development Programme.

Beall, J., and Todes, A (2004) Gender and Integrated Area Development Projects: Lessons from Cato Manor, Durban, *Cities* 21 (4), 301-310.

Beall, J., Todes, A., and Maxwell, H (2004) Gender and Urban Development in Cato Manor”, In Robinson, P., McCarthy, J. and Foster, C. (eds) *Urban Reconstruction in the Developing World. Lessons from an International Best Practice*, Sandown: Heinemann, 309-333.

Beall, J., Todes, A. and Maxwell, H (2002) Gender and Urban Development in Cato Manor, Report to the Cato Manor Development Association.

Bhowmik, S (2005) Street vendors in Asia: a review, *Economic and Political Weekly*, May 28-June 2, 2256-2264.

Bonnin, D (2000) Claiming Spaces, Changing Places: Political Violence and Women’s Protests in KwaZulu Natal, *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 26(2), 301– 316

BRIDGE (1997) Issue 5: Approaches to Institutionalising gender, *Development and Gender in Brief*, www.ids.ac.uk

BRIDGE (2001) Issue 9: Gender and participation, *Development and Gender in Brief*, www.ids.ac.uk

Broadbent, G. (1990) *Emerging Concepts in Urban Space Design*, London: Spon Press.

Bryson, J.M. (1995) *Strategic planning for public and non-profit organizations. A guide to strengthening and sustaining organizational achievement*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass

Chant, S. (2007a) Gender, Cities, and the Millennium Development Goals in the Global South, New Working Paper Series: Gender Institute, Issue 21, November.

Chant, S. (2007b) *Gender, Generation and Poverty: Exploring the Feminisation of Poverty in Africa, Asia and Latin America*, Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.

Chant, S (1996) *Gender, Urban Development and Housing*, UNDP Publication Series for Habitat II, Volume Two, New York: United Nations Development Programme.

Cole, J., S. Parnell and L. Sylwander (nd) *Gender and the City: Guidelines for Mainstreaming Gender in Urban Development Planning: a South African Experience*, report to SIDA.

Commonwealth Association of Planners (CAP) (2008) *Women in Planning: Strategic Plan 2008-2010*, Final Draft.

- Denden, A. (2008) Engendering Local Governance Revitalising Women's Movement(s): Insights from the Philippines, report prepared by Citizen Participation in Local Governance Programme, Institute for Popular Democracy, Philippines
- Dandekar, H (1992) *Shelter, Women and Development. First and Third World Perspectives*, Ann Arbour: George Wahr.
- Ehlers, T. and Lazenby, K. (eds) (2004) *Strategic Management. Southern African Concepts and Cases*, Pretoria: van Schaik
- European Union (1999) European Spatial Development Perspective, Prepared by the Committee on Spatial Development.
- Fenster, T (1999) Introduction. In T Fenster (ed) *Gender, Planning and Human Rights*, London: Routledge, 3-24.
- Flyvbjerg, B. (1998) *Rationality and Power*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Gender and Water Alliance (GWA) (2003) *Mainstreaming Gender in Water Management. Resource Guide*, GWA.
- Gender and Water Alliance (GWA) and UN Human Settlements Programme (2006) Navigating Gender in African Cities: A Synthesis Report of Rapid Gender and Pro-Poor Assessments in the 17 Cities of the Water for African Cities (WAC) II Programme, UN Habitat Water and Sanitation Infrastructure Branch.
- Greed, C. (2006a) Making the Divided City Whole: Mainstreaming Gender into Planning in the UK, *Tijdschrift voor Economische en Sociale Geografie*, 97(3): 267 – 280
- Greed, C. (2006b) Institutional and Conceptual Barriers to the Adoption of Gender Mainstreaming within Spatial Planning Departments in England, *Planning Theory and Practice*, 7 (2)
- Greed, C. (n.d.). A Place for Everyone? Gender Equality and Urban Planning, *ReGender Briefing Paper*, Oxfam
- Greed, C. (1994) *Women and Planning, Creating Gendered Realities*, London: Routledge.
- Grundström, K. (2005) Gender and the Use of Public Space, Proceedings ESF/N-AERUS Conference, INTERNET: <http://www.naerus.net/sat/workshops/2005/papers/11.pdf>.
- Hassim, S. (2006) *Women's Organisations and Democracy in South Africa. Contesting Authority*, University of KwaZulu-Natal Press: Scottsville

Hayden, D. (2003) What Would A Nonsexist City Be Like? Speculations on Housing, Urban Design and Human Work in A.R. Cuthbert (ed.) *Designing Cities: Critical Readings in Urban Design*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 218 – 232.

Hayden, D (1980) What Would a Nonsexist City Be Like? *Signs*, Spring Supplement.

Heller, P., Harilal, K. and Chaudhuri, S. (2007) Building Local Democracy: Evaluating the Impact of Decentralisation in Kerala, India, *World Development*, 35 (4)

Heyzer, N. (2004) Women's Participation and Leadership: Vital to Democratic Governance", www.unifem.org

Hickey, S. and Mohan, G. (2004) Relocating Participation within a Radical Politics of Development: Insights from Political Action and Practice, in Hickey, S. and Mohan, G. (eds) *Participation: from tyranny to transformation? Exploring new approaches to participation in development*, London: Zed Books

Hobson, J. (2000) Sustainable Sanitation: Experiences in Pune with a Municipal-NGO-Community Partnership, *Environment and Urbanization*, October, 12(2), 53 – 62.

Jackson, C (1996) Rescuing Gender from the Poverty Trap. In *World Development*, Vol 24, No 3, 489-504.

Jaeckel, M. and van Geldermalsen, M. (2006) Gender Equality and Urban Development: Building Better Communities for All, *Global Urban Development Magazine*, March 2(1).

Jahan, R (1995) *The Elusive Agenda: Mainstreaming Women in Development*, London: Zed Books.

Kabeer, N. (2003) *Gender mainstreaming in poverty eradication and the Millennium Development Goals. A handbook for policy-makers and other stakeholders*, IDRC

Kabeer, N (1994) *Reversed Realities: Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought*, London: Verso Press.

Kamau, H. (2002) Safety Audits: The Kenyan Experience, in Proceedings of the First International Seminar on Safety for Women and Girls: Montreal, May.
http://www.femmesetvilles.org/seminar/pdf_seminar/pres_en/kamau_en.pdf.

Khan, Z. (2003) *Closing the Gap: Putting EU and UK Gender Policy into Practice – South Africa, Nicaragua and Bangladesh*, www.oneworldaction.org

Larsson, A. (2006) From Equal Opportunities to Gender Awareness in Strategic Spatial Planning, *Town Planning Review*, (77) 5

Larsson, A. (1994) Gender Aware Approaches to Physical Planning, Unpublished ms.

Larsson, A., Mapetla, M and Schlyter, A (eds) (1998) *Changing Gender Relations in Southern Africa: Issues of Urban Life*, Roma: Institute of Southern African Studies, National University of Lesotho.

Leo-Rhynie, E. and Institute of Development and Labour Law, UCT (1999) *Gender Mainstreaming in Education*, Gender Management System Series, London: Commonwealth Secretariat

Levy, C (1996) *The Process of Institutionalising Gender in Policy and Planning: The 'Web' of Institutionalisation*. *Development Planning Unit Working Paper No 74*, London: Development Planning Unit, March.

Levy, C (1991) *Towards Gender-Aware Provision of Urban Transport*. In *Gender and Third World Development: Module 5*. University of Sussex: Institute of Development Studies.

Little, J (1994) *Gender, Planning and the Policy Process*, London: Pergamon.

Lynch, K. (1985) *Good City Form*, Cambridge: MIT Press.

Machado, L (1987) *The problems of women-headed households in a low-incomes housing programme in Brazil*, In C Moser and L Peake (eds), *Women, Housing and Human Settlements*, London: Tavistock Publications, 55-79.

Mackie, M. (2001) *Local Plan Gender Audit*, Report prepared for Plymouth City Council

Manchip, S (1986) *Women and Space. A Case Study of Phoenix*, MTRP Dissertation, University of Natal, Durban

Massey, D.B. (1994) *Space, Place and Gender*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

McDowell, L. (1997) *Capital Culture: Gender At Work in the City*, Oxford: Blackwell.

Menendez, A (1991) *Access to Basic Infrastructure by the Urban Poor*. *EDI Policy Seminar Report No 28*, Washington DC: Economic Development Institute of the World Bank.

Meth, P. (2003) *Rethinking the 'Domus' in Domestic Violence: Homelessness, Space and Domestic Violence in South Africa*, *Geoforum*, 34: 317 – 327.

Moser, C (1996) *Confronting Crisis. A Comparative Study of Household Responses to Poverty and Vulnerability in Four Poor Urban Communities*, *Environmentally Sustainable Development Studies and Monograph Series No. 8*, Washington: World Bank.

Moser, C (1993) *Gender Planning and Development: Theory, Practice and Training*, London: Routledge.

Moser, C (1987a) Women, Human Settlements and Housing: A Conceptual Framework for Analysis and Policy Making. In C Moser and L Peake (eds), *Women, Housing and Human Settlements*, London: Tavistock Publications, pp. 12-32.

Moser, C (1987b) Mobilization is Women's Work: Struggles for Infrastructure in Guayaquil, Ecuador. In C Moser and L Peake (eds) *Women, Housing and Human Settlements*, London: Tavistock Publications, pp. 166-194.

Moser, C and L Peake (1987) *Women, Housing and Human Settlements*, London: Tavistock Publications.

Mtani, A. (2002) The Women's Perspective: The Case of Manzese, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania, in Proceedings of the First International Seminar on Safety for Women and Girls: Montreal, May. http://www.femmesetvilles.org/seminar/english/set_intro_en.htm

Mukhopadhyay, M. (2007) Mainstreaming Gender or 'Streaming' Gender Away: Feminists Marooned in the Development Business", in Cornwell, A., Harrison, E. and Whitehead, A. (eds) *Feminisms in Development. Contradictions, Contestations and Challenges*, London: Zed Books

Mukhopadhyay, M. (2003) Mainstreaming Gender or 'Streaming' Gender Away: Feminists Marooned in the Development Business, unpublished paper presented at University of Sussex and Institute of Development Studies: Gender myths and feminist fables: repositioning gender in development policy and practice.

Nimpuno-Parente, P. (1987) The Struggle for Shleter: Women in a Site and Service Project in Nairobi, Kenya. In C Moser and L Peake (eds) *Women, Housing and Human Settlements*, London: Tavistock Publications, pp.70-87.

Nnkya, T. (2006) An Enabling Framework? Governance and Street Trading in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. In Brown, A. (Ed.) *Contested Space: Street Trading, Public Space and Livelihoods in Developing Cities*. Warwickshire: Intermediate Technology Publications

One World Action (2008) Citizens' Participation and Local Governance in South East Asia, www.oneworldaction.org

OECD (1995) *Women in the City: Housing, Services and the Urban Environment*, Paris: Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development.

Office of the Deputy Prime Minister (OPDM) (2005) *Diversity and Equality in Planning. A Good Practice Guide*, OPDM, London.

Oxfam (2008). Regeneration: Oxfam's Work at Govan, UK, www.gendersit.org, downloaded 11 September 2008.

Oxfam, (n.d) Gender at the Heart of Regeneration, *ReGender Project*.

Pain, R. (2001) Gender, Race, Age and Fear in the City, *Urban Studies*, 38 (5–6), 899–913.

Patterson, Z. Haider, M. and Ewing, G. (2004) A Gender-based Analysis of Work Trip Mode Choice of Suburban Montreal Commuters Using Stated Preference Data.

Phadke, S. (2002) Remapping the Public: Gendered Spaces in Mumbai, Paper presented at Conference on Gender and the Built Environment (Women Architects Forum), Ahmedabad, February.

Phadke, S. (2005) You Can Lonely in a Crowd, *Indian Journal of Gender Studies*, 12(1), 41 – 62.

Planning Institute of Australia (2004) Findings and Recommendations of the National Inquiry into Planning Education and Employment, www.planning.org.au

Posselthwyte, C (1986) Reuniting the Divided City: Working Mothers in a Planned Environment, MCRP Dissertation, University of Cape Town.

Rahder, B. and Altilia, C (2004) Where is feminism in planning going? Appropriation or transformation? *Planning Theory*, 3 (2)

Reeves, D (2002) Mainstreaming Gender Equity. An Examination of the Gender Sensitivity of Strategic Planning in Great Britain, *Town Planning Review* 73 (2)

Reeves, D. (2003) Gender Equality and Plan Making. The Gender Mainstreaming Toolkit, RTPI, www.rtpi.org.uk

Reeves Associates and WDS (2007) Gender and Spatial Planning, RTPI Good Practice Note 7, www.rtpi.org.uk

Rodriguez, A. (n.d.) Integrated Area Development in Fragmented Cities. A Gender Perspective, *City*, 2, 241-8.

Roever, S. (2006) Street Trade in Latin America: Demographic Trends, Legal Issues and Vending Organisation, Paper for WIEGO Urban Policies Programme.

Ruddick, S. (1996) Constructing Difference in Public Spaces: Race, Class and Gender as Interlocking Systems, *Urban Geography*, 17, 132 – 151.

Sassen, S. and Lewis, R. (2003) Strategic Instantiations of Gendering: Global Cities and Global Survival Circuits. http://www.un-instraw.org/en/images/stories/remmitances/documents/Forum/saskia_sassen.pdf

Sithole-Fundire, S. (ed) (1995) *Gender Research on Urbanisation, Planning, Housing and Everyday Life – Phase One*, Harare: Zimbabwe Women's Resource Centre and Network

Schlyter, A (1984) Upgrading reconsidered: the George Studies in Retrospect, *Bulletin of the National Swedish Institute of Building Research* M84:4, Lund.

Skinner, C. (2008a) Street Trade in Africa: A Review, *Centre for Development Studies Working Paper 51*, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Paper for the WIEGO.

Skinner, C (2008b) Research Fellow, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Interview, September 2008.

Smaoun, S. (2000) Violence Against Women in Urban Areas: An Analysis of the Problem from a Gender Perspective, WP 17, United Nations Urban Management Programme, Nairobi.

Smaoun, S. (2002) The Gender Approach of the United Nations Human Settlements Programmes (UN-HABITAT): The Safer Cities Programme, First International Seminar on Women's Safety – *Making the Links*, Montréal, May. http://www.femmesetvilles.org/seminar/francais/pres_fr/smaou_pres.

Stavrou, A. (2002) Research, Practice and Evaluation: Violence against Women Surveys Some Thoughts on Implementation and Decision Making, First International Seminar on Women's Safety – *Making the Links*, Montréal, May. http://www.femmesetvilles.org/seminar/pdf_seminar/pres_en/stavrou_en.pdf.

Staeheli, L. (2003) Women and the Work of Community, *Environment and Planning A*, 35, 815 – 831.

Sweetman, C (1996) *Women and Urban Settlement*. Oxford: Oxfam.

Todes, A. 2008. Decentralisation in Sub-Saharan Africa: What Has it Meant for Women's Access to Services and Political Participation?, Paper presented to the IDRC, Women's Rights and Citizenship Programme workshop, Decentralization and Women's Rights in Sub-Saharan Africa, Dakar, Senegal, 21 January 2008.

Todes, A. and N. Mngadi (2007) City Planners, Report for the Human Science Research Council Study on Scarce Skills for the Department of Labour.

Todes, A., Sithole, P., and Williamson, A. 2007. Women, Decentralisation and Integrated Development Planning in South Africa, Final Report to the IDRC, Canada,

Trench, S and S Tiesdell (1992) Safer Cities for Women – Perceived Risks and Planning Measures. *Town Planning Review* 6 (3).

Turner, J. (2003) Integrating Gender into World Bank Financed Transport Programmes, Report to the World Bank.

UNCHS (2002) Gender Policy, <http://www.unchs.org>

UNCHS. (2000) *Women in Urban Governance*. Nairobi: UN-Habitat.

UNCHS (1997). *Gendered Habitat. Working with Women and Men in Human Settlements Development*, Nairobi: UN-Habitat.

United Nations Development Programme (2000) UNDP Gender Good Practices: Interagency Guidelines and Criteria. <http://www.sdn.org/undp/gender/practices>.

UN-Habitat (2008a) *Gender in Local Government. A Sourcebook for Trainers*. Nairobi: UN-Habitat

UN-Habitat (2008b) Best Practices Briefs. <http://www.bestpractices.org/bpbriefs/women.html>.

UN-Habitat (2007) Strategic Plan for Safer Cities 2008 – 2013. http://www.unhabitat.org/downloads/docs/5524_70912_Safer%20Cities%20-%20Strategic%20plan.pdf.

UN-Habitat (2008) Best Practices Briefs. <http://www.bestpractices.org/bpbriefs/women.html>

van Donk, M. (2000) Local Government: a Strategic Site of Struggle for Gender Equity, *Agenda*, 45

Vaiou, D. (1994) The Necessity for Women's Participation and Commitment in Planning and Decision-Making Processes: A European Comparison, Proposition for a European Charter for Women in the City, Sponsored by the EC, 266 – 271.

Varley, A (1992) Gender, Household Structure and Accommodation for Young Adults in Urban Mexico. In H Dandekar (ed) *Shelter, Women and Development. First and Third World Perspectives*, Ann Arbour: George Wahr

Waddington and Mohan, G. (2004) Failing Forward: Going beyond PRA and Imposed Forms of Participation, in Hickey, S. and Mohan, G. (eds) *Participation: From Tyranny to Transformation? Exploring New Approaches to Participation in Development*, London: Zed Books

Wakeley, P. and You, N. (2002) Implementing the Habitat Agenda: In Search of Urban Sustainability, London: The Developing Planning Unit, University College London. ISBN 874502-00-5.

Whitzman, C. (2007a) Stuck at the Front Door: Gender, Fear of Crime and the Challenge of Creating Safer Space, *Environment and Planning A*, 39: 2715 – 2732.

Whitzman, C. (2007b) The Loneliness of the Long-distance Runner: Long-term Feminist Planning Initiatives in London, Melbourne, Montreal and Toronto, *Planning Theory and Practice* 8 (2)

Whitzman, C. (1995) What Do You Want To Do? Pave Parks? The Planner's Role in Preventing Violence in M. Eichler (ed.) *Change of Plans: Towards a Nonsexist Sustainable City*, Garamond Press: Toronto, 89 – 110.

World Bank (2006) Gender Equality as Smart Economics: A World Bank Group Gender Action Plan, September.

World Bank (2007) Gender and Development Briefing Notes: Infrastructure and Gender, Gender and Development Group, February.

Yeoh, B. and Huang, S. (1998) Renegotiating Public Space: Strategies and Styles of Migrant Female Domestic Workers in Singapore, *Urban Studies*, 35: 583 – 603.

Websites consulted

www.adb.org

www.gendersite.org

www.planning.org.au

www.unhabitat.org

www.unifem.org

