

*Hierarchical
Linear
Models
Applications and
Data Analysis
Methods
Second Edition*

Stephen W. Raudenbush
Anthony S. Bryk

Advanced Quantitative Techniques **1**
in the Social Sciences Series



Publications
International Educational and Professional Publisher
Thousand Oaks • London • New Delhi

Contents

Acknowledgments for the Second Edition	xvii
Series Editor's Introduction to Hierarchical Linear Models	xix
Series Editor's Introduction to the Second Edition	xxiii
Introduction	3
Hierarchical Data Structure: A Common Phenomenon	3
Persistent Dilemmas in the Analysis of Hierarchical Data	5
A Brief History of the Development of Statistical Theory for Hierarchical Models	5
Early Applications of Hierarchical Linear Models	6
<i>Improved Estimation of Individual Effects</i>	7
<i>Modeling Cross-Level Effects</i>	8
<i>Partitioning Variance-Covariance Components</i>	9
New Developments Since the First Edition	10
<i>An Expanded Range of Outcome Variables</i>	10
<i>Incorporating Cross-Classified Data Structures</i>	11
<i>Multivariate Model</i>	12
<i>Latent Variable Models</i>	13
<i>Bayesian Inference</i>	13
Organization of the Book	14

2. The Logic of Hierarchical Linear Models	16
Preliminaries	16
<i>A Study of the SES-Achievement Relationship in One School</i>	16
<i>A Study of the SES-Achievement Relationship in Two Schools</i>	18
<i>A Study of the SES-Achievement Relationship in J Schools</i>	18
A General Model and Simpler Submodels	23
<i>One-Way ANOVA with Random Effects</i>	23
<i>Means-as-Outcomes Regression</i>	24
<i>One-Way ANCOVA with Random Effects</i>	25
<i>Random-Coefficients Regression Model</i>	26
<i>Intercepts- and Slopes-as-Outcomes</i>	27
<i>A Model with Nonrandomly Varying Slopes</i>	28
Section Recap	28
Generalizations of the Basic Hierarchical Linear Model	29
<i>Multiple Xs and Multiple Ws</i>	29
<i>Generalization of the Error Structures at Level 1 and Level 2</i>	30
<i>Extensions Beyond the Basic Two-Level Hierarchical Linear Model</i>	31
Choosing the Location of X and W (<i>Centering</i>)	31
<i>Location of the Xs</i>	32
<i>Location of Ws</i>	35
Summary of Terms and Notation Introduced in This Chapter	35
<i>A Simple Two-Level Model</i>	35
<i>Notation and Terminology Summary</i>	36
<i>Some Definitions</i>	36
<i>Submodel Types</i>	36
<i>Centering Definitions</i>	37
<i>Implications for p_{ij}</i>	37
3. Principles of Estimation and Hypothesis Testing for Hierarchical Linear Models	38
Estimation Theory	38
<i>Estimation of Fixed Effects</i>	38
<i>Estimation of Random Level-1 Coefficients</i>	45
<i>Estimation of Variance and Covariance Components</i>	51
Hypothesis Testing	56
<i>Hypothesis Tests for Fixed Effects</i>	57
<i>Hypothesis Tests for Random Level-1 Coefficients</i>	61

	<i>Hypothesis Testing for Variance and Covariance</i>	
	<i>Components</i>	63
	Summary of Terms Introduced in This Chapter	65
4.	An Illustration	68
	Introduction	68
	The One-Way ANOVA	69
	<i>The Model</i>	69
	<i>Results</i>	70
	Regression with Means-as-Outcomes	72
	<i>The Model</i>	72
	<i>Results</i>	73
	The Random-Coefficient Model	75
	<i>The Model</i>	75
	<i>Results</i>	77
	An Intercepts- and Slopes-as-Outcomes Model	80
	<i>The Model</i>	80
	<i>Results</i>	81
	Estimating the Level-1 Coefficients for a Particular Unit	85
	<i>Ordinary Least Squares</i>	86
	<i>Unconditional Shrinkage</i>	87
	<i>Conditional Shrinkage</i>	90
	<i>Comparison of Interval Estimates</i>	92
	<i>Cautionary Note</i>	94
	Summary of Terms Introduced in This Chapter	94
5.	Applications in Organizational Research	99
	Background Issues in Research on Organizational Effects	99
	Formulating Models	100
	<i>Person-Level Model (Level 1)</i>	100
	<i>Organization-Level Model (Level 2)</i>	101
	Case 1: Modeling the Common Effects of Organizations via	
	Random-Intercept Models	102
	<i>A Simple Random-Intercept Model</i>	102
	<i>Example: Examining School Effects on Teacher Efficacy</i>	103
	<i>Comparison of Results with Conventional Teacher-Level</i>	
	<i>and School-Level Analyses</i>	107
	<i>A Random-Intercept Model with Level-1 Covariates</i>	111
	<i>Example: Evaluating Program Effects on Writing</i>	112
	<i>Comparison of Results with Conventional Student- and</i>	
	<i>Classroom-Level Analyses</i>	113

Case 2: Explaining the Differentiating Effects of Organizations via Intercepts- and Slopes-as-Outcomes Models	117
<i>Difficulties Encountered in Past Efforts at Modeling Regression Slopes-as-Outcomes</i>	117
<i>Example: The Social Distribution of Achievement in Public and Catholic High Schools</i>	119
<i>Applications with Both Random and Fixed Level-1 Slopes</i>	129
<i>Special Topics</i>	130
Applications with Heterogeneous Level-1 Variance	131
<i>Example: Modeling Sector Effects on the Level-1 Residual Variance in Mathematics Achievement</i>	131
<i>Data-Analytic Advice About the Presence of Heterogeneity at Level 1</i>	132
Centering Level-1 Predictors in Organizational Effects Applications	134
<i>Estimating Fixed Level-1 Coefficients</i>	135
<i>Disentangling Person-Level and Compositional Effects</i>	139
<i>Estimating Level-2 Effects While Adjusting for Level-1 Covariates</i>	142
<i>Estimating the Variances of Level-1 Coefficients</i>	143
<i>Estimating Random Level-1 Coefficients</i>	149
Use of Proportion Reduction in Variance Statistics	149
Estimating the Effects of Individual Organizations	152
<i>Conceptualization of Organization Specific Effects</i>	152
<i>Commonly Used Estimates of School Performance</i>	152
<i>Use of Empirical Bayes Estimators</i>	153
<i>Threats to Valid Inference Regarding Performance Indicators</i>	154
Power Considerations in Designing Two-Level Organization Effects Studies	158
6. Applications in the Study of Individual Change	160
Background Issues in Research on Individual Change	160
Formulating Models	161
<i>Repeated-Observations Model (Level 1)</i>	162
<i>Person-Level Model (Level 2)</i>	162
A Linear Growth Model	163
<i>Example: The Effect of Instruction on Cognitive Growth</i>	164
A Quadratic Growth Model	169

<i>Example: The Effects of Maternal Speech on Children's Vocabulary</i>	170
Some Other Growth Models	176
<i>More Complex Level-1 Error Structures</i>	\11
<i>Piecewise Linear Growth Models</i>	178
<i>Time-Varying Covariates</i>	179
Centering of Level-1 Predictors in Studies of Individual Change	181
<i>Definition of the Intercept in Linear Growth Models</i>	181
<i>Definitions of Other Growth Parameters in Higher-Order Polynomial Models</i>	182
<i>Possible Biases in Studying Time-Varying Covariates</i>	183
<i>Estimation of the Variance of Growth Parameters</i>	183
Comparison of Hierarchical, Multivariate Repeated-Measures, and Structural Equation Models	185
<i>Multivariate Repeated-Measures (MRM) Model</i>	185
<i>Structural Equation Models (SEM)</i>	186
<i>Case 1: Observed Data are Balanced</i>	188
<i>Case 2: Complete Data are Balanced</i>	189
<i>Case 3: Complete Data are Unbalanced</i>	196
Effects of Missing Observations at Level 1	199
Using a Hierarchical Model to Predict Future Status	200
Power Considerations in Designing Studies of Growth and Change	202
7. Applications in Meta-Analysis and Other Cases where Level-1 Variances are Known	205
Introduction	205
<i>The Hierarchical Structure of Meta-Analytic Data</i>	206
<i>Extensions to Other Level-1 "Variance-Known" Problems</i>	207
<i>Organization of This Chapter</i>	207
Formulating Models for Meta-Analysis	208
<i>Standardized Mean Differences</i>	208
<i>Level-1 (Within-Studies) Model</i>	209
<i>Level-2 (Between-Studies) Model</i>	209
<i>Combined Model</i>	210
<i>Estimation</i>	210
<i>Example: The Effect of Teacher Expectancy on Pupil IQ</i>	210
<i>Unconditional Analysis</i>	212
<i>Conditional Analysis</i>	213
<i>Bayesian Meta-Analysis</i>	217

Other Level-1 Variance-Known Problems	217
<i>Example: Correlates of Diversity</i>	219
The Multivariate V-Known Model	222
<i>Level-1 Model</i>	222
<i>Level-2 Model</i>	223
Meta-Analysis of Incomplete Multivariate Data	224
<i>Level-1 Model</i>	224
<i>Level-2 Model</i>	225
<i>Illustrative Example</i>	225
8. Three-Level Models	228
Formulating and Testing Three-Level Models	228
<i>A Fully Unconditional Model</i>	228
<i>Conditional Models</i>	231
<i>Many Alternative Modeling Possibilities</i>	233
<i>Hypothesis Testing in the Three-Level Model</i>	234
<i>Example: Research on Teaching</i>	235
Studying Individual Change Within Organizations	237
<i>Unconditional Model</i>	238
<i>Conditional Model</i>	241
Measurement Models at Level 1	245
<i>Example: Research on School Climate</i>	245
<i>Example: Research on School-Based Professional Community and the Factors That Facilitate It</i>	248
Estimating Random Coefficients in Three-Level Models	250
9. Assessing the Adequacy of Hierarchical Models	252
Introduction	252
<i>Thinking about Model Assumptions</i>	253
<i>Organization of the Chapter</i>	253
Key Assumptions of a Two-Level Hierarchical Linear Model	254
Building the Level-1 Model	256
<i>Empirical Methods to Guide Model Building at Level 1</i>	257
<i>Specification Issues at Level 1</i>	259
<i>Examining Assumptions about Level-1 Random Effects</i>	263
Building the Level-2 Model	267
<i>Empirical Methods to Guide Model Building at Level 2</i>	268
<i>Specification Issues at Level 2</i>	271
<i>Examining Assumptions about Level-2 Random Effects</i>	273
<i>Robust Standard Errors</i>	276
<i>Illustration</i>	279
Validity of Inferences when Samples are Small	280

	<i>Inferences about the Fixed Effects</i>	281
	<i>Inferences about the Variance Components</i>	283
	<i>Inferences about Random Level-j Coefficients</i>	284
	Appendix	285
	<i>Misspecification of the Level-1 Structural Model</i>	285
	<i>Level-1 Predictors Measured with Error</i>	286
10.	Hierarchical Generalized Linear Models ,	291
	The Two-Level HLM as a Special Case of HGLM	293
	<i>Level-1 Sampling Model</i>	293
	<i>Level-1 Link Function</i>	293
	<i>Level-j Structural Model</i>	294
	Two- and Three-Level Models for Binary Outcomes	294
	<i>Level-j Sampling Model</i>	294
	<i>Level-1 Link Function</i>	295
	<i>Level-1 Structural Model</i>	295
	<i>Level-2 and Level-3 Models</i>	296
	<i>A Bernoulli Example: Grade Retention in Thailand</i>	296
	<i>Population-Average Models</i>	301
	<i>A Binomial Example: Course Failures During First Semester of Ninth Grade</i>	304
	Hierarchical Models for Count Data	309
	<i>Level-1 Sampling Model</i>	309
	<i>Level-1 Link Function</i>	310
	<i>Level-1 Structural Model</i>	310
	<i>Level-2 Model</i>	310
	<i>Example: Homicide Rates in Chicago Neighborhoods</i>	311
	Hierarchical Models for Ordinal Data	317
	<i>The Cumulative Probability Model for Single-Level Data</i>	317
	<i>Extension to Two Levels</i>	321
	<i>An Example: Teacher Control and Teacher Commitment</i>	322
	Hierarchical Models for Multinomial Data	325
	<i>Level-1 Sampling Model</i>	326
	<i>Level-1 Link Function</i>	326
	<i>Level-j Structural Model</i>	327
	<i>Level-2 Model</i>	327
	<i>Illustrative Example: Postsecondary Destinations</i>	327
	Estimation Considerations in Hierarchical Generalized Linear Models	332
	Summary of Terms Introduced in This Chapter	333
11.	Hierarchical Models for Latent Variables	336

Regression with Missing Data	338
<i>Multiple Model-Based Imputation</i>	338
<i>Applying HLM to the Missing Data Problem</i>	339
Regression when Predictors are Measured with Error	346
<i>Incorporating Information about Measurement Error in Hierarchical Models</i>	347
Regression with Missing Data and Measurement Errors	351
Estimating Direct and Indirect Effects of Latent Variables	351
<i>A Three-Level Illustrative Example with Measurement Error and Missing Data</i>	352
<i>The Model</i>	354
<i>A Two-Level Latent Variable Example for Individual Growth</i>	361
Nonlinear Item Response Models	365
<i>A Simple Item Response Model</i>	365
<i>An Item Response Model for Multiple Traits</i>	368
<i>Two-Parameter Models</i>	370
Summary of Terms Introduced in This Chapter	371
<i>Missing Data Problems</i>	371
<i>Measurement Error Problems</i>	371
12. Models for Cross-Classified Random Effects	373
Formulating and Testing Models for Cross-Classified Random Effects	376
<i>Unconditional Model</i>	376
<i>Conditional Models</i>	379
Example 1: Neighborhood and School Effects on Educational Attainment in Scotland	384
<i>Unconditional Model</i>	385
<i>Conditional Model</i>	387
<i>Estimating a Random Effect of Social Deprivation</i>	389
Example 2: Classroom Effects on Children's Cognitive Growth During the Primary Years	389
Summary	396
Summary of Terms Introduced in This Chapter	396
13. Bayesian Inference for Hierarchical Models	399
An Introduction to Bayesian Inference	400
<i>Classical View</i>	401
<i>Bayesian View</i>	401
Example: Inferences for a Normal Mean	402
<i>Classical Approach</i>	402

<i>Bayesian Approach</i>	403
<i>Some Generalizations and Inferential Concerns</i>	406
A Bayesian Perspective on Inference in Hierarchical Linear Models	408
<i>Full Maximum Likelihood (ML) of y, T, and cr^2</i>	408
<i>REML Estimation of T and a^2</i>	410
The Basics of Bayesian Inference for the Two-Level HLM	412
<i>Model for the Observed Data</i>	412
<i>Stage-1 Prior</i>	412
<i>Stage-2 Prior</i>	413
<i>Posterior Distributions</i>	413
<i>Relationship Between Fully Bayes and Empirical Bayes Inference</i>	413
Example: Bayes Versus Empirical Bayes Meta-Analysis	414
<i>Bayes Model</i>	415
<i>Parameter Estimation and Inference</i>	416
<i>A Comparison Between Fully Bayes and Empirical Bayes Inference</i>	420
Gibbs Sampling and Other Computational Approaches	427
<i>Application of the Gibbs Sampler to Vocabulary Growth Data</i>	428
Summary of Terms Introduced in This Chapter	432
14. Estimation Theory	436
Models, Estimators, and Algorithms	436
Overview of Estimation via ML and Bayes	438
<i>ML Estimation</i>	438
<i>Bayesian Inference</i>	439
ML Estimation for Two-Level HLMs	440
ML Estimation via EM	440
<i>The Model</i>	440
<i>M Step</i>	441
<i>E Step</i>	442
<i>Putting the Pieces Together</i>	443
ML Estimation for HLM via Fisher Scoring	444
<i>Application of Fisher-IGLS to Two-Level ML</i>	445
ML Estimation for the Hierarchical Multivariate Linear Model (HMLM)	450
<i>The Model</i>	450
<i>EM Algorithm</i>	451
<i>Fisher-IGLS Algorithm</i>	451

<i>Estimation of Alternative Covariance Structures</i>	452
<i>Discussion</i>	454
Estimation for Hierarchical Generalized Linear Models	454
<i>Numerical Integration for Hierarchical Models</i>	456
<i>Application to Two-Level Data with Binary Outcomes</i>	457
<i>Penalized Quasi-Likelihood</i>	457
<i>Closer Approximations to ML</i>	459
<i>Representing the Integral as a Laplace Transform</i>	460
<i>Application of Laplace to Two-Level Binary Data</i>	462
<i>Generalizations to other Level-1 Models</i>	463
Summary and Conclusions	465
References	467
Index	477
About the Authors	485