

Verification and Validation in Computational Science and Engineering

by

Patrick J. Roache

hermosa
p u b l i s h e r s

PO Box 9110
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87119-9110
USA
<http://www.hermosa-pub.com/hermosa>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	iii ✓
Acknowledgments	vii ✓
Part I Overview	1 ✓
Chapter 1 Introduction.....	3 ✓
1.1 Sketch of Historical Development of CFD.....	3
1.2 The New Impetus Toward Higher Quality Solutions.....	7
1.3 A Personal Anecdote Illustrating the Importance of Systematic Code Verification	11
References for Chapter 1	14
Chapter 2 Semantics: Terminology, Taxonomies, and Definitions	19 ✓
2.1 Introduction	19
2.2 Semantics	20
2.3 Code Verification and Validation: Numerical vs. Conceptual Modeling.....	23
2.4 Code Confirmation	30
2.5 Benchmarks and Inter-Code Comparisons	31
2.6 Code Certification, Quality Assurance, and Accreditation	33
2.7 Verification of Calculations.....	35
2.8 Quantification of Uncertainty	36
2.9 Grid Convergence vs. Iterative Convergence.....	36
2.10 Error Taxonomies	36

2.11 Truncation Error vs. Discretization Error.....	43
2.12 Calibration and Tuning.....	44
2.13 Quality assurance (QA) vs. Quality Work.....	46
2.14 Customer Illusions vs. Customer Care.....	46
2.15 Other Distinctions: Authors, Users, Modelers, Code and Software.....	47
2.16 Sensitivity, Uncertainty, and Risk.....	48
2.17 Etymology and Near Synonyms.....	49
2.18 Accuracy vs. Reliability.....	49
2.19 Additional Remarks on Verification.....	50
2.20 Conclusion: Limitations of Semantic Distinctions.....	51
References for Chapter 2.....	52

Part II Verification.....63

Chapter 3 A Methodology for Accuracy Verification of Codes: the Method of Manufactured Solutions.....65

3.1 Introduction.....	65
3.2 Warnings: the Division of Labor in Code Development and Use.....	65
3.3 Order of Convergence.....	66
3.4 A General Procedure for Generating an Analytical Solution for Code Accuracy Verification: the Method of Manufactured Solutions.....	67
3.5 Example: Verification of a 3-D Poisson Equation Code in Nonorthogonal Grid and a 3-D Grid Generation Code.....	70
3.6 Another Path to Manufactured Solutions.....	79
3.7 Code Verification Including Shock Waves.....	79
3.8 Need for a Theorem.....	81
3.9 Specific Analytical Solutions.....	81
3.10 Manufactured Solutions vs. Infinite Series Solutions.....	82
3.11 The Sensitivity of Grid Convergence Testing.....	82
3.12 Examples of Unanticipated Convergence Rates Determined by Systematic Grid Convergence Tests.....	83
3.13 Special Considerations for Problems with Multiple Scales: Turbulence Modeling.....	88
3.14 Warnings: What the Method Does Not “Verify”.....	88
3.15 Robustness and Confidence.....	89
References for Chapter 3.....	90

Chapter 4 Error Estimation for Quantification of Uncertainty; Verification of Calculations.....95

4.1 Introduction.....	95
4.2 Error Estimation for Grid Adaptation vs. Quantification of Uncertainty.....	96
4.3 Taxonomy for Additional Information for Error Estimates.....	97
4.4 Grid Refining and Coarsening.....	98
4.5 Levels of Simulation Use.....	99
4.6 Verification of Computer Round-off Errors.....	100
4.7 Effect of Differing formulations.....	103
References for Chapter 4.....	103

Chapter 5 Systematic Grid Convergence Studies and the Grid Convergence Index (GCI).....107

5.1 Introduction.....	107
5.2 Background on Grid Convergence Reporting.....	108

5.3 Richardson Extrapolation	109
5.4 A Generalization of Richardson Extrapolation.....	112
5.5 Richardson's Extrapolation for π	114
5.6 Grid Convergence Index for the Fine Grid Solution	114
5.7 Grid Convergence Index for the Coarse Grid Solution	117
5.8 Example GCI Calculation.....	119
5.9 Should the Coefficient Be "1" Or "3" Or "1.25"?.	120
5.10 Additional Features of Grid Convergence Studies for Verification of Codes and Calculations	123
5.11 Conclusion	135
References for Chapter 5	136

Chapter 6 Applications of Systematic Grid Convergence Studies and the Grid Convergence Index 143

6.1 Introduction	143
6.2 Two Further Examples of (Partial) Code Verification in Groundwater Flow.....	144
6.3 Issues in Calculation Verification.....	157
6.4 An Example of the Effective Grid Refinement Ratio.....	158
6.5 A Benchmark Problem for Driven Cavity Flow.....	160
6.6 A Benchmark Problem for Free Convection	160
6.7 Laminar Plane Jet Impinging on a Heated Flat Plate	162
6.8 A k - ϵ Model of a Free Shear Layer	162
6.9 Transonic Airfoil Calculations	163
6.10 Ordered Estimation of Far-Field Boundary Error	166
6.11 Artificial Dissipation Effects.....	168
6.12 Single and Dual Porosity Contaminant Transport: Source Term Location.....	170
6.13 Convergence Behaviors for Mixed-Order Methods	179
6.14 Grid Convergence of Zero Drag Coefficient.....	180
6.15 Anomalous Result Possibly Due to Grid Stretching.....	181
6.16 Non-Smooth Property Variation: Global Error Norms	182
6.17 Discrete Vortex Methods.....	184
6.18 Observed Convergence Rates for Euler Equations with Shocks	185
6.19 Completed Richardson Extrapolation.....	187
6.20 Truncation Error in Elliptic Grid Generation	187
6.21 One Dimensional Moving Adaptive Grid Problems	189
6.22 GCI Application in Solution Adaptive Grids with Non-Integer Grid Refinement.....	189
6.23 High Quality Grid Resolution Studies Leading to a Safety Factor of 1.25	190
6.24 Transport Code Verifications Using the GCI: Partitioning the Option Matrix	190
6.25 Turbulent Separated Flow: the Error Estimator of Celik and Karatekin.....	195
6.26 Level of Accuracy Estimates from Grid Convergence Studies.....	197
6.27 Other Examples of Careful Use of Richardson Extrapolation.....	198
6.28 Parameter Convergences of a Compressible Flow Code Near the Incompressible Limit.....	198
6.29 Justification of the Dupuit Approximation	203
6.30 Concluding Comment on Parameter Uncertainty vs. Numerical Uncertainty.....	206
References for Chapter 6	207

Chapter 7 Single Grid Error Estimators 217

7.1 Error Estimation from Higher or Lower Order Accuracy Solutions on the Same Grid (Category B).....	218
7.2 Auxiliary PDE Solutions on the Same Grid (Category C)	220
7.3 Auxiliary Algebraic Evaluations on the Same Grid: Surrogate Estimators (Category D).....	223
7.4 Time Accuracy Estimation	228
7.5 Concluding Remarks on Single Grid Error Estimators	230
References for Chapter 7	231

Chapter 8 Hard Stories	237
8.1 Factors Influencing Convergence Rates	237
8.2 Behavior of Quasi-Higher-Order Methods	245
8.3 Some Good News for Turbulence Modeling	250
8.4 The Myth of the Converged “Solution”	251
8.5 Esoteric Coding Mistakes	253
8.6 A False Verification Test of a Particle Tracker	253
8.8 Hard-Wired Data vs. User Input Data	258
8.9 Degraded Rate of Convergence Due to User Modeling Errors	259
8.10 Lessons from Nonlinear Dynamics	259
8.11 Adaptive and Local Time Stepping, and Steady State	263
8.12 Other Questions Related to the Steady State	263
References for Chapter 8	264
Part III Validation	271 ✓
Chapter 9 Difficulties With Experiments and Validation	273 ✓
9.1 Credulousness	273
9.2 Historical Methods of Validating Scientific Theories	275
9.3 The Theory Laden Experiment	276
9.4 Random and Systematic Errors in Experiments	277
9.5 Experimental Errors in Physical Properties	278
9.6 Boundary Conditions, Continuum and Numerical	278
9.7 Trends, Computational and Experimental	278
9.8 False Negatives and False Positives	280
9.9 “Nearby” Problems	280
9.10 Difficulty of the Option Tree	282
9.11 Data Sparsity and Lack of Synchronicity: Groundwater, Ocean/Lake, and Meteorology Modeling	282
9.12 The Effect of Parameter Resolution on Grid Convergence	284
9.13 Scale of Unsteadiness	284
9.14 Spatial Scales, Scaling Up, and Dimensionality	286
9.15 Assumptions of Periodicity	288
9.16 Other Difficulties of Validation in Aerospace	289
9.17 Universal Turbulence Models vs. Zonal Modeling	289
9.18 Strong and Weak Model Definitions and Model Validation	291
9.19 The Myth of the Totally Validated Code	292
References for Chapter 9	293
Chapter 10 Methodologies and Examples of Validations, Calibrations, and Certifications	299 ✓
10.1 Sources of Physical Modeling Errors in Aerodynamics CFD	299
10.2 Accuracy Level for Validation	300
10.3 Generic Models vs. Realistic Models for Validation and Calibration: Phases of Validation	301
10.4 CFD and Experimental Facility Corrections	303
10.5 Verification Must Be Independent of Validation: Airfoil Calculations	304
10.6 Synergism Between Computation and Validation Experiments	304
10.7 The Difficulty of Defining a “Nearby” Problem	308
10.8 Missing Experimental Details	309
10.9 Onset of 3 Dimensionality in Backstep Flow	309
10.10 Gray Area: “Validation” from a Calculated Benchmark	310
10.11 Gray Area: “Validation” of an Experimental Technique by a Computation	310

10.12 The MADE-2 Experience: Can Groundwater Flow Models Be Validated?	311
10.13 Dynamic Stall Wind Tunnel Data: Who Does the Tweaking?.....	313
10.14 Consortium Effort at CFD Code Certification.....	314
10.15 Simulation Team Responsibilities in Validation	323
10.16 Shifting Responsibilities and Gray Areas.....	324
10.17 WUA Benchmarks in 1994 and 1996	325
10.18 CFD Triathlons	326
10.19 Canadian CFD Society Test Case.....	326
10.20 Workshops	327
10.21 AGARD 1988 Validation of Computational Fluid Dynamics.....	327
10.22 A Case Study for CFD Code Validation Methodology	330
10.23 Joint Consideration of Experimental and Simulation Uncertainties.....	331
10.24 Dynamic Databases for Validation.....	335
References for Chapter 10	340

Part IV Broader Issues349 ✓

Chapter 11 Code Quality Assurance and Certification.....351

11.1 Introduction	351
11.2 Quality Assurance (QA) vs. Quality Work.....	352
11.3 QA vs. Creativity.....	352
11.4 QA and Temperament Types.....	352
11.5 The Prevalence of Errors in Scientific Software: Use of Static Analyzers	353
11.6 Factors of Code Quality Assurance	356
11.7 Some Components of Project Code Certification.....	357
11.8 Engineering Teams and the Division of Labor.....	358
11.9 Personnel Roles, Code Levels, and Code Sources	359
11.10 Desirable (But Not Required) Code Characteristics.....	359
11.11 Code Documentation	362
11.12 Code Module Communication Structure	364
11.13 Code Updates.....	364
11.14 Built in Automatic Error Detection Tests.....	365
11.15 Designing for Code Maintenance	366
11.16 Commercial Codes and their Users	366
11.17 Code to Code Comparisons	366
11.18 General Software Certification and ISO-9000 Standards.....	367
11.19 QA for Large Public Policy Projects	367
11.20 QA of Analyses.....	368
11.21 QA / Certification of Users and Regulators.....	368
11.22 Assessment of Codes? Or Users?	368
11.23 QA Procedures.....	370
11.24 A Template for a QA System	374
11.25 Concluding Remarks On QA.....	380
References for Chapter 11	380

Chapter 12 Conclusions385 ✓

12.1 The Overall Process for Quantification of Uncertainty	385
12.2 Internet Archive.....	387
12.3 Fulfilling the Promise of Computational Power.....	387

Appendix A. Need for Control of Numerical Accuracy	389
I. Introduction	390
II. Resistance and Objections	390
III. Difficulties in Applications.....	395
IV. Examples of What Can Be Done.....	396
V. Conclusions and Recommendations	396
Appendix: Editorial Policy Statement on the Control of Numerical Accuracy.....	398
Acknowledgments	399
References.....	399
Appendix B. Other Journal Policy Statements on Control of Numerical Accuracy	403
Journal of Heat Transfer Editorial Policy Statement on Numerical Accuracy.....	403
International Journal for Numerical Methods in Fluids-Editorial	406
AIAA Editorial Policy Statement on Numerical Accuracy and Experimental Uncertainty.....	407
Journal of Fluids Engineering-Editorial and Policy Statement	408
Policy Statement on the Control of Numerical Accuracy	410
Appendix C. Comment on Oreskes et al	413
Comment on “Verification, Validation, and Confirmation of Numerical Models in the Earth Sciences”.....	413
References.....	417
Appendix D. CFD Parody: Will the Wind Tunnel Replace the Computer?	419
Original.....	419
Response	420
Appendix E. A Biographical Sketch of Lewis Fry Richardson.....	423
References.....	427
Index.....	429