

CONFLICTS BETWEEN FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

Eva BREMS

Editor



intersentia

Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

1. Orientation	1
2. Introduction to the Volume	6
3. Summing up	15
4. Thanks	16

CHAPTER 1. THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

CONFLICTS OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AS CONSTITUTIONAL DILEMMAS

LORENZO ZUCCA	19
1. Introduction	19
2. Defining Genuine Conflicts of Fundamental Rights	23
2.1. The Main Distinction	25
2.2. A (Practice Oriented) Typology of Conflicts	26
3. Balancing and Incommensurability	28
4. Dealing with Conflicts	31
4.1. Constitution-Perfecting, Conflict-Solving, Theories	33
4.2. The Presumption of Priority	35
5. Conclusion	37

PRIVACY RIGHTS IN CONFLICT: IN SEARCH OF THE THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK BEHIND THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS' BALANCING OF PRIVATE LIFE AGAINST OTHER RIGHTS

AAGJE IJVEN	39
1. Introduction	39
2. Privacy Rights in Conflict	40
2.1. Private Life v. Freedom of Expression	41
2.2. Private Life v. other Persons' Privacy Rights	44
2.3. Rights of the Child	48
2.4. Right to Life	51

3.	In Search of the Court's Theoretical Framework	52
3.1.	Some General Principles	52
3.2.	A Theoretical Framework.	54
3.2.1.	What is Judicial Minimalism?	54
3.2.2.	Judicial Minimalism on the European Court of Human Rights.	55
3.2.3.	Some Critical Remarks.	57
4.	Balancing Private Life Against other Rights: Privacy in a Democratic Society	60
4.1.	Deliberative Democracy and Human Rights: A Common Foundation in Human Autonomy.	61
4.2.	Deliberative Democracy, the Margin of Appreciation Doctrine, Minority Rights and Critical Debate	64
4.3.	Implications for the Resolution of Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights.	65
4.3.1.	For Rights Conflicts in General	65
4.3.2.	For Conflicts with Privacy Rights.	67

CONSTITUTIONAL DEMOCRACY, CONSTITUTIONAL INTERPRETATION AND CONFLICTING RIGHTS

EVELYNE MAES. 69

1.	Introduction	69
2.	Constitutional Democracy.	71
2.1.	Crisis of Democracy	71
2.2.	Rise of Constitutional Democracy	73
2.3.	Habermas' Theory on Constitutional Democracy.	74
3.	Habermas on Constitutional Interpretation and Balancing Rights	80
3.1.	Judicial Review.	80
3.2.	Balancing Conflicting Rights	84
4.	Models of Interpretation.	87
4.1.	Originalism	87
4.2.	Procedural Democracy Interpretation of Ely	90
4.3.	Fundamental Rights Interpretation by Dworkin	93
5.	Conclusion	97

**CHAPTER 2. TOWARDS A GENERAL APPROACH TO DEAL WITH
CONFLICTING FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS**

**BACK TO BASICS: WITHOUT DISTINCTION – A DEFINING
PRINCIPLE?**

ALISON STUART	101
1. Introduction	101
2. Textual Primacy of the Non Distinction Norm	103
2.1. The Current Non Discrimination Test.	106
3. Judicial Handling of the Non Distinction Norm	108
3.1. International Jurisprudence on Non Discrimination on the Basis of Sex	109
3.2. Regional Jurisprudence on Non Discrimination on the Basis of Sex	111
4. The Non Distinction Norm as a Method of Interpretation.	120
5. The Proposed Legal Application of the Non Distinction Norm.	124
6. Conclusion	128

**CUTTING TO THE CORE OF CONFLICTING RIGHTS: THE QUESTION
OF INALIENABLE CORES IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE**

GERHARD VAN DER SCHYFF	131
1. Introduction	131
2. Approaches to Cores	132
2.1. Objective and Subjective Approaches	133
2.2. Absolute and Relative Approaches	133
3. Conflicting Cores Considered	135
4. European Convention	137
4.1. One-Stage Rights	139
4.2. Two-Stage Rights	140
5. South African Bill of Rights	141
5.1. Interim Bill of Rights	142
5.2. Final Bill of Rights	142
6. Conclusion	146

TOWARDS A SOCIALIZATION OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

MARLIES GALENKAMP	149
1. Introduction	149
2. Conflicts of Fundamental Rights Within the Dutch Setting	150
3. The Absolutism of the Fundamental Rights Discourse	154
4. Problems	156
5. Lessons from Ownership	158
6. No Rights Without Responsibilities	159
7. Back to Practice	161
8. Conclusions	164

**CHAPTER 3. THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND
CONFLICTING RIGHTS****RIGHTS IN CONFLICT: THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
AS A PRAGMATIC INSTITUTION**

OLIVIER DE SCHUTTER and FRANÇOISE TULKENS	169
1. Introduction	169
2. Conflicts Real or Imagined	174
2.1. Conflicts Between a Right Protected Under the Convention and another Interest	175
2.2. Rights of an 'Absolute' Character and Rights Subject to Restrictions	179
2.3. Obligations to Respect and Obligations to Protect	181
2.4. Conclusion	187
3. The Classical Solutions to Situations of Real Conflicts	188
3.1. The 'Necessity' Test	188
3.2. Balancing	191
3.3. The National Margin of Appreciation	198
4. The Procedural Turn	203
4.1. Practical Concordance	203
4.2. Transforming the Background Conditions	206
4.3. Encouraging Deliberative Processes	208
4.4. Developing Standards Through Adjudication	210
4.5. Two Guiding Principles	213
5. Conclusion	215

CONFLICTS BETWEEN FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AND THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS: AN OVERVIEW

PEGGY DUCOULOMBIER	217
1. Types of Conflict	219
1.1. Conflicts of Rights and Horizontal Situations	219
1.2. Conflicts of Rights and Vertical Cases	222
1.3. The Link Between the Structure of the Conflict and the Methods of Resolution	224
1.4. Conflicts Between Rights and Procedural Questions	225
2. Current Solutions	226
2.1. Conflicts Between Rights, Balance of Interests and Proportionality	227
2.2. Conflicts of Rights and Positive Obligations	229
2.3. The Influence of Conflicts on the Margin of Appreciation	230
3. Towards a Human Rights Hierarchy?	234
3.1. Hierarchy in the Field of Human Rights	234
3.2. The European Convention and the Idea of Hierarchy	236
3.3. Abstract and Concrete Hierarchy	238
3.4. The Hierarchical Framework Proposed to Solve Conflicts Between Rights	239
3.5. Practical Concordance: An Alternative?	243
4. Conclusion: Effect on the Court's Future	246

THE SEARCH FOR AN EQUILIBRIUM BY THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

LETO CARIOLOU	249
1. Introduction	249
2. General Remarks on the Court's Adjudication	250
3. The Court's Overall Rejection of a Utilitarian Theory of Convention Rights	251
4. The Impact of the Reasoning of an Interference on the Protection of a Convention Right	253
5. The Requirement of a Qualitative Assessment of the Values Concerned in a Given Case	255
6. The "Incompleteness of Ranking" Between Potentially Competing Convention Rights	259
7. The Role of Balancing	261

8. “Balancing” as a Tool of Development of a Normative Theory	265
9. Conclusion	268

CHAPTER 4. CONFLICTING RIGHTS AND CONSTITUTIONAL COURTS

BALANCING CONFLICTING HUMAN RIGHTS: KONRAD HESSE’S NOTION OF “PRAKTISCHE KONKORDANZ” AND THE GERMAN FEDERAL CONSTITUTIONAL COURT

THILO MARAUHN and NADINE RUPPEL.	273
1. Introduction	273
1.1. Categorizing Conflicts Within a Human Rights System	274
1.2. Exemplary Case Law of the Federal Constitutional Court.	276
1.3. A Biographical Note on Konrad Hesse	278
2. “Practical Concordance”: Terminology and Methodology.	279
2.1. Konrad Hesse’s Methodology	279
2.2. Constitutional Doctrine and the Notion of “Practical Concordance”	281
3. “Practical Concordance” and its Application by the German Federal Constitutional Court.	284
3.1. The “Mephisto” Ruling.	285
3.2. The “Mutzenbacher” Ruling	287
3.3. The “Crucifix” Ruling.	289
3.4. The “Headscarf” Ruling.	292
4. “Practical Concordance” and <i>Effet Utile</i>	294
5. In Conclusion	296

CONFLICTING RIGHTS IN SOUTH AFRICAN CASE LAW

CAROLE LEWIS	297
1. Introduction	297
2. The South African Legal Framework	299
3. Freedom of Expression and Defamation	299
4. Freedom of Expression and the Right to a Fair Trial.	305
5. Freedom of Expression and Intellectual Property Rights	312
6. Conclusion	315

CONFLICTS OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS BEFORE THE CONSTITUTIONAL COURT OF BELGIUM: THE CASE OF FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION

NICOLAS BONBLED.....	317
1. Introduction.....	317
2. Conflicts of Fundamental Rights Before the Constitutional Court.....	318
2.1. The Jurisdiction of the Constitutional Court.....	318
2.2. A Typology of Conflicts.....	321
2.2.1. Conflicts of Rights.....	321
2.2.2. Conflicts of Guarantees.....	322
3. Conflicts Involving Freedom of Expression and other Fundamental Rights.....	325
3.1. Freedom of Expression v. Right to Health.....	325
3.2. Freedom of Expression v. Rights of Children.....	326
3.3. Freedom of Expression v. Right of Property and Right to a Healthy Environment.....	328
3.4. Freedom of Expression v. Right not to Be Discriminated Against.....	329
3.4.1. Holocaust Denial.....	329
3.4.2. Racism, Xenophobia and “Manifest Hostility” towards the European Convention on Human Rights.....	331
3.4.3. Incitement to Discrimination, Hatred or Violence.....	332
3.5. Freedom of Expression v. Right to Life and Right to Respect of Private and Family Life.....	334
4. Conflicts of Constitutional and International Guarantees of Freedom of Expression.....	336
4.1. Relations Between Constitutional and International Guarantees of Freedom of Expression.....	337
4.2. An Integrative and Flexible Approach to Conflicts of Guarantees.....	340
5. Conclusion.....	343

CONFLICTS BETWEEN FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS IN THE JURISPRUDENCE OF THE CONSTITUTIONAL COURT OF THE CZECH REPUBLIC

DAVID KOSAŘ.....	347
1. Background Information.....	347
1.1. Basic Features of the Czech Constitutional Court.....	348
1.2. Charter of Fundamental Rights and Basic Freedoms.....	351

2.	Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights: Theoretical Foundations	354
2.1.	Introductory Remarks	355
2.2.	Proportionality Test	357
2.3.	Balancing	358
2.4.	Test of “Minimizing Impingement upon a Fundamental Right” . .	361
2.5.	Summary of Part 2	363
3.	Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights: Practical Application.	363
3.1.	Abstract and Concrete Constitutional Review Cases	365
3.2.	Individual Constitutional Complaint Cases.	367
4.	Different (Proportionality) Test for Abstract/Concrete Judicial Review and for Individual Constitutional Complaints?	371
4.1.	Reversal Order of the Final Stages of the Proportionality Test	372
4.2.	Different Content of the Balancing Stage	373
4.3.	Recommendations.	375
5.	Conclusion	378

CHAPTER 5. CONFLICTS RELATING TO LEGAL PLURALISM AND CULTURAL DIVERSITY

MUSLIM PERSONAL LAW (MPL) IN CANADA: A CASE STUDY CONSIDERING THE CONFLICT BETWEEN FREEDOM OF RELIGION AND MUSLIM WOMEN’S RIGHT TO EQUALITY

	WAHEEDA AMIEN	381
1.	Introduction	381
2.	Application of MPL	384
3.	Secular Options for Marriage and Divorce	388
3.1.	Assimilation	388
3.2.	Accommodation	391
4.	Shari’a Arbitration Tribunals.	396
5.	Constitutional Framework	405
5.1.	Equality.	405
5.2.	Freedom of Religion	408
5.3.	Resolving the Conflict Between the Right to Equality and Freedom of Religion	414
6.	Conclusion	418

**FREEDOM OF RELIGION VERSUS SEX EQUALITY AND STATE
NEUTRALITY: THE DIFFERENCE THE METHOD OF REVIEW
CAN MAKE**

TITIA LOENEN.....	421
1. Introduction.....	421
3. Similar Principles, Different Approaches, Different Results.....	422
4. Burqas in the Classroom.....	426
5. Headscarves in the Courtroom.....	427
6. Conclusions.....	429

**LEGAL PLURALISM AND ISLAM IN THE SCALES OF THE EUROPEAN
COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS: THE LIMITS OF CATEGORICAL
BALANCING**

KAREN MEERSCHAUT and SERGE GUTWIRTH.....	431
1. Introduction.....	431
2. Legal Pluralism as a Conflict of Human Rights.....	433
3. The Refah-Case: Strasbourg's Categorical Rejection of Legal Pluralism .	435
3.1. The Framework of Article 11 ECHR.....	435
3.2. Legal Pluralism and Sharia as Contrary to Secularism, Equality and Democracy.....	436
3.3. A Problematic Precedent for Legal Pluralism, Muslims and Islam. Discussion of the Arguments.....	438
3.4. Secularism and Neutrality: No Clear Meaning.....	440
3.5. Strasbourg's Two Strands of Case-Law Concerning the Freedom of Religion.....	444
3.6. Legal Pluralism and Gender Equality.....	447
3.7. An Essentialising Discourse on Islamic Law.....	448
4. Malaysia: Islamic Law and the Malaysian Model of a Pluralistic- Uniform Legal System.....	451
4.1. Malaysia: A 'Communitarian-Liberal Democracy'.....	451
4.2. Malaysia: Quasi-Secular or Quasi-Islamic?.....	453
4.3. Legal Pluralism in Family Law and Islamic Family Law.....	456
4.4. Some Critical Points About the Legal Pluralism in Malaysia.....	459
5. Conclusion: A Plea for a Nuanced and Context-Sensitive Form of Balancing.....	462

CHAPTER 6. CONFLICTS RELATING TO ECONOMIC RIGHTS**ENVIRONMENT VERSUS FREE ENTERPRISE: A CONFLICT BETWEEN FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS?**

IGNACIO GARCÍA VITORIA	469
1. Introduction	469
2. The Right to a Healthy Environment	471
2.1. The Constitutionalization of Environmental Goals	471
2.2. Judicial Enforceability	473
3. Free Enterprise as a Constitutional Right	475
4. A Necessary Delimitation of the Constitutional Substance of Economic Liberties.....	478
5. The Core-Periphery Model	482
5.1. A Cultural Approach	482
5.2. The Free Development of the Personality	483
5.3. Measures that May Hinder Internal Trade	485
5.4. Barriers to Entry	487
5.5. Measures Favouring Certain Firms	489
6. Conclusion	490

THE LAW OF NUISANCE AND HUMAN RIGHTS

FRANCIS MCMANUS	493
1. Summary.....	493
2. The Law of Nuisance	493
3. Historical Development of the Law of Nuisance	498
4. The Miasmatic Theory of the Transmission of Disease and Nuisance ...	500
5. Nuisance and the Rule in <i>Rylands v. Fletcher</i>	501
6. Elements of the Law of Nuisance.....	502
6.1. Unreasonable Conduct.....	502
6.2. What Factors Are Taken into Account?.....	503
7. Social Utility of the Defender's Conduct	504
8. Motive of the Defender	505
9. Locality	506
9.1. Locality and the Effect of Planning Permission.....	507
10. Duration and Intensity	509
11. Time of Day.....	509
12. Sensitivity of Pursuer	509
13. Social Utility of Thing Interfered with.....	510

14. Could the Nuisance Have Been Avoided by the Pursuer?	511
15. Is the State of Affairs Typical of Modern Life?	511
16. Need for an Emanation from the Defender's Premises	512
17. Did the Pursuer Live in Fear of the Adverse State of Affairs?	514
18. The Law of Nuisance and Human Rights	514
19. Conclusions	518

THE DISPOSSESSED AND THE DISTRESSED: CONFLICTS IN LAND-RELATED RIGHTS IN TRANSITIONS FROM UNLAWFUL TERRITORIAL REGIMES

YAËL RONEN	521
1. Introduction: Unlawful Territorial Regimes and Restitution of Property	521
2. The Cases	525
2.1. The Baltic States	525
2.2. East Timor	529
2.3. The TRNC	533
3. Rights Related to Land	537
3.1. Introduction	537
3.2. Rights Protecting Original Owners	538
3.3. Rights Protecting Current Occupants	541
3.3.1. Proprietary Rights	541
3.3.2. Non-Proprietary Rights	543
4. Balancing the Rights	545
4.1. Introduction	545
4.2. Good Faith	546
4.3. The Link Between Residence and Land Rights	547
4.4. The Relationship Between the Individual and the Unlawful Territorial Regime	553
5. Conclusion	556

CONFLICTING ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RIGHTS: THE PROPORTIONALITY PLUS TEST

WOUTER VANDENHOLE	559
1. First Type Conflicts	563
2. Second Type Conflicts: Principles	565
2.1. Prioritisation of the Most Vulnerable Groups	565

2.2.	Core Content – Minimum Essential Level	567
2.3.	Prioritization of Certain Rights?	571
3.	Second Type Conflicts: Some Cases	573
3.1.	The Right to Housing Versus the Right to Property	573
3.2.	The Right to Housing Versus the Right to Housing.....	578
3.3.	The Right to Health Versus other Social Rights.....	579
3.4.	Right to Social Security Versus other Social Rights.....	583
4.	Third Type Conflict: Extraterritorial Obligations	585
5.	Conclusions.....	586

**CONFLICTS BETWEEN FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS OR CONFLICTING
FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS VOCABULARIES?
AN ANALYSIS OF DIVERGING USES OF ‘FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS’ IN
THE CONTEXT OF INTERNATIONAL AND EUROPEAN TRADE LAW**

	JOHN MORIJN	591
1.	Introduction	591
2.	Diverging Uses of ‘Fundamental Rights’ in the Context of International and European Trade Law.....	594
2.1.	Uses of the ‘Fundamental Rights Vocabulary’ in the General Context of Economic Globalisation: Different Challenges to Interdependence	595
2.2.	International Trade Law and the Core Labour Standards Debate: Sequencing the Fundamental Rights List by Prioritising Procedural Rights	599
2.3.	European Trade Law and the Nature of Economic Free Movement Rules: Extending the Fundamental Rights List to Include Economic Market Freedoms.....	603
3.	Re-Approaching ‘Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights’ in the Context of International and European Trade Law: Identifying Conceptual and Methodological Promises and Challenges Beneath and Beyond Babel.....	611
4.	Conclusion	616

CHAPTER 7. ARE CONFLICTING RIGHTS REALLY AN ISSUE?**'THE RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS OF OTHERS': THE ECHR AND ITS PECULIAR CATEGORY OF CONFLICTS BETWEEN INDIVIDUAL FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS**

JACCO BOMHOFF.....	619
1. Introduction: Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights and the European Convention.....	619
2. 'The Rights and Freedoms of Others': Elements of an Internal Critique .	623
2.1. Introduction.....	623
2.2. Confusion About Relevant Rights in Specific Cases.....	624
2.3. Who May Be 'Others'?.....	625
2.4. Internal Critique and Structural Weaknesses.....	627
3. The Contingency of the Category of 'Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights'.....	627
3.1. Introduction.....	627
3.2. Factual Contingency and the 'True Conflict'/Non-Conflict Boundary.....	628
3.3. Institutional Contingency and the Comparative Perspective: Introduction.....	630
3.4. Institutional Contingency (1): Understandings of Rights.....	630
3.5. Institutional Contingency (2): Alternative Conceptualizations ...	632
4. Convention Exceptionalism and the Missing Structural Perspective....	634
4.1. Introduction.....	634
4.2. Convention Exceptionalism (1): No Division of Powers Jurisdiction.....	635
4.3. Convention Exceptionalism (2): Visions of a 'Democratic Society'.....	637
5. The Missing Structural Perspective in Convention Case-Law.....	638
5.1. Introduction.....	638
5.2. The Missing Structural Perspective (1): Difficult Aims.....	639
5.3. The Missing Structural Perspective (2): Neglected Aims.....	643
5.4. The Missing Structural Perspective (3): Aims and Effects.....	644
6. Taking 'Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights' Seriously.....	645
6.1. Introduction.....	645
6.2. Illusions of Micro-Management, Juridification and De-Politicization.....	646
6.3. Taking 'Conflicts Between Fundamental Rights' Seriously: Suspicious and Suboptimal Conceptualizations.....	647
6.4. (1): Majorities as 'Others'.....	648

6.5. (2): Public Bodies and Officials as ‘Others’ 649
 6.6. (3): Redistribution and Access to Public Resources 651
 7. Conclusion: The Future of Conflicts Between Rights Before a
Quasi-Constitutional Court. 652

**FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AND OTHER INTERESTS: SHOULD IT
 REALLY MAKE A DIFFERENCE?**

JANNEKE H. GERARDS 655

1. Introduction 655
 2. Proliferation of Fundamental Rights in the Case Law of the
 ECtHR and the ECJ 656
 2.1. Introduction: Different Types of Rights and the Normative
 Debate About Proliferation 656
 2.2. The European Court of Human Rights 659
 2.2.1. Positive Obligations and the Proliferation of Convention
 Rights 659
 2.2.2. Evolutive Interpretation and the Proliferation of
 Fundamental Rights 663
 2.2.3. Conclusion 666
 2.3. The European Court of Justice 667
 3. Judicial Assessment of Cases Concerning Fundamental Rights and
 other Individual Interests 672
 3.1. Introduction 672
 3.2. National Courts: The Example of the United Kingdom and
 the Netherlands 674
 3.2.1. The UK 674
 3.2.2. The Netherlands 678
 3.3. The European Court of Justice 681
 3.4. Conclusion 685
 4. The Legal Distinction Between Fundamental Rights and Individual
 Interests – Is there an Alternative? 686